Tales of Hope II

Innovative Grassroots Approaches to Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) in Asia and the Pacific
Innovative Grassroots Approaches to Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) in Asia and the Pacific
The materials presented and designations employed in this publication are in no way intended to represent or reflect the opinions of ACCU and UNESCO. The information in Part I and Part II were selected and presented by the individual authors.

Photographs used in this publication belong to ACCU except cover photo taken by Mr. Nagata Yoshiyuki and photograph on p.38 taken by Kadazandusun Language Doundation (KLF).

This publication follows the family-name-first style for Japanese people’s names in accordance with the Japanese custom.
Following upon the first “Tales of Hope” published in 2006, this second volume compiles the results and discoveries from the field of the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific Innovation Programme for ESD, which was implemented in the two years from 2006-2008. The book aims to be accessible to a general audience and thus is sprinkled with voices heard at the project sites, descriptions of local conditions, and reflections of members of the evaluation team, in addition to the attached final report of the evaluation mission.

The new “HOPE Evaluation Method” developed to evaluate the Innovation Programmes takes its name from the first letters from the words “Holistic,” “Participatory,” and “Empowerment.” The method does not divide evaluators from the subjects of evaluation, and involves participation from various stakeholders— including leaders, local teachers, project managers, experts, colleagues from ESD Centres of Excellence (sister project of the Innovation Programme), and ACCU staff. Each of these treats the evaluation process as a learning process.

At the close of the two-year implementation period, these ten projects within the Asia-Pacific region both clarify and make suggestions about ESD. Whether comprised of formal or non-formal education or implemented by non-governmental or governmental organizations, each realizes ESD through a unique angle, not only enabling learners to gain knowledge about literacy, farming or environmental damage, but also by connecting local people and promoting the growth of the various individuals involved with the project.

With this volume, one feels new hopes arising in the Asia-Pacific region, and we will be happy if this volume helps to connect these hopes in order to build a more sustainable society for the future.
We are thankful to each of the implementing partner organizations for the Innovation Programme, each country’s National Commission for UNESCO, and all those involved who enabled this publication to occur. We are also thankful to Mr. Nagata Yosiyuki, Associate Professor of the University of the Sacred Heart, Tokyo, for overseeing this publication.

Asia/Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU)
“What was the most significant experience as you participated in this project?” With this simple question, people gradually started talking while reflecting upon their own experience. That is how this publication “Tales of Hope II” has come into existence. It is a compilation of true narratives of people in Asia and the Pacific, envisaging and striving for a sustainable future.

Launched in 2005, the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development (UNDESD) is a movement to mobilise the world to progress together in connecting diverse educational efforts to a sustainable future. ESD not only addresses the realms of learning for sustainable development: it encompasses the environment, economy, and society, with culture as an underlying dimension. It has several key characteristics as regards the learning process such as prioritising themes locally relevant and culturally appropriate, promoting social tolerance, fostering higher-order thinking skills, encouraging participation, etc. At the same time, ESD places importance on life-long and life-wide learning. Therefore, anyone, at any stage of his/her life, can benefit from ESD.

With a view to furthering ESD endeavours at the regional level, the Asia/Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU) was entrusted by UNESCO to implement the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme supported by the Japan Funds-in-Trust for ESD in 2005. Under the Programme, two sub-programmes were designed to yield multi-faceted impact: 1) the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific Innovation Programme for ESD and 2) the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific COE Programme for ESD. The former supported the implementation of ten community-based ESD projects in ten different countries, to nurture good practices of ESD across the Asia-Pacific region, while the latter identified five institutions as

---

1 For more details, please refer to Annex 3
Centres of Excellence (COE) to serve as catalysts in promoting ESD widely in the region.

The occasion of the near-completion of the above-mentioned Innovation Programme offered an opportunity to re-think activities referred to as “evaluation”. In addition to the basic, conventional evaluation approaches, ACCU and its collaborators tried out a kind of evaluation that would also be a learning process – a participatory method that would be meaningful to all of those involved, centering around the core concepts of ESD. ACCU, COE colleagues and collaborating experts came up with an approach to evaluate the Innovation Programme. With the “hope” that the evaluation process itself would be HOlistic, Participatory, and Empower people, the first letters of those words were taken and the approach was named the ESD “HOPE” Evaluation Approach.

This publication came out of the field visits to seven project sites, and questionnaires collected from eight projects of this “HOPE” evaluation. Evaluation missions were conducted by four teams consisting of an educational expert, as a team leader, COE representative and ACCU. The following essays of part I and part II of this publication are mainly written by these members. During the evaluation mission, the participants placed high importance on dialogue with the stakeholders involved in the projects, trying to capture detailed description of the narratives based on people’s real experience. Here arises a question: how can those real voices of people be presented, without being cut into pieces in terms of quantity? In hopes of best reflecting what really happened at the grassroots in Asia and the Pacific, Part I of this publication “Voices of Hope” presents seven stories from innovative projects in Palau, Bhutan, Thailand, Mongolia, Vietnam, Malaysia and Indonesia. Entering from diverse themes, all of

2 Mr. Jose Robert Guevara – Leader of the Bhutan and Thailand team
Mr. Nagata Yoshiyuki – Co-leader of the Palau team, Leader of the Mongolia and Viet Nam team
Mr. Pala Wari – Co-leader of the Palau team, Leader of the Indonesia and Malaysia team
those projects commonly envisaged a sustainable future. Those stories are based on the dialogues held among the community people, project implementing agencies, and other relevant project stakeholders, ACCU, COE colleagues, and collaborating experts out in the field, and they illustrate how ESD efforts are bearing fruits at the grassroots level.

Part II of this publication, “DESD and beyond”, tries to help deepen understanding of ESD from different perspectives, based on the field visits and questionnaire survey conducted under the framework of the “HOPE” evaluation. Following the actual cases of ESD in seven project sites, this part gives a more conceptual view, hoping to contribute to those involved in both practice and research of ESD. Part II also includes reflection on past ACCU programmes, implying the affinity of ESD for international cooperation.

With these two parts together, this publication presents existing good practices of ESD and what can be inferred from them. It is hoped that this publication will help promote ESD further in a concrete manner on the occasion of the mid-decade of UNDESD.
Introduction

ESD Means Spinning Threads of Hope

As we reach the midpoint of the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development, ESD project evaluation is prevalent in many countries. In this pivotal year, let us reassure ourselves that ESD is a concept which has arisen as a new vision for education. Trends such as global warming and the global financial crisis have invested ESD with a mission of reconceptualizing traditional educational views from their foundation, owing to the not small influence they have had in creating the current unsustainable society.

If ESD is expected to bring about a transformation in the educational paradigm, then one must also transform the traditional ways in which ESD is being evaluated. With this in mind, in June 2008 in Tokyo and Miyagi Prefecture, Japan, the Asia/Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU) held the “Workshop on Evaluation Approaches from ESD Perspectives in Asia and the Pacific,” gathering experts in the Asia-Pacific region to discuss evaluation methods suited to promoting a sustainable society. During the workshop, we rethought evaluation methods built from the top down which tend to produce value judgments of good or bad based on outside criteria. We also explored what kind of evaluation method would empower people facing adversity—in other words, evaluation that would place importance on respect for human dignity and endogenous implementation. The result was the “HOPE” Evaluation Approach.

The details of this evaluation method will be addressed in Part II of this volume. The acronym “HOPE,” formed from the first letters of the words “HOlistic,” “Participatory,” and “Empowering,” is just as these letters express—an evaluation method designed on the basis of holistic values, emphasizing a participatory approach, and which aims to empower people.
This represents the opposite pole from methods in which people other than those directly involved hand down value judgments, and transcends the framework of “evaluator” and “evaluee.”

As a method which values dialogue, one essential task in the “HOPE” Evaluation Approach is local interviews. To conduct these interviews, we created four international teams. Within the limits of time and budget, we determined the target countries and traveled to local sites. Beginning with a pilot survey in Palau, other teams followed with surveys to Bhutan and Thailand, Mongolia and Viet Nam, and Malaysia and Indonesia. All told, 390 people were interviewed. Based on the extensive data gathered in these countries, the authors of *Tales of Hope II* have portrayed the present situation of ESD in countries in the Asia-Pacific region.

Through the field surveys conducted in the seven countries above, we were able to listen to many voices. These are just a few examples, but it was not unusual to meet people who spoke with the kind of happiness below:

“When my son was born, he could not easily respire and could not move at all. Now he can crawl using his hands as feet. The wheelchair he used has now become a souvenir from the past.” (Father of a child with disabilities, age 32, Viet Nam)

“Before joining the literacy class, my life was like that of a cow. Now I am with confidence.” (Female farmer, age unknown, Bhutan)

“I have never been to a library before, but after I wrote stories in my mother tongue, I found myself excited and going to a community library.” (Female farmer with five children, age 30, Malaysia.)

We had completed interviews in Palau and Mongolia and were walking
through villages along the Viet Nam-China border to conduct interviews when a thought occurred to me. Just as in the above quotes, people we met in the Asia-Pacific region were speaking about their dreams for a sustainable future even though they might have been poor. However, the dreams were not like the “American Dream”; rather, those we heard resembled ordinary people’s hopes for ordinary happiness. People were not sacrificing the present for the realization of some distant dream, but were valuing the present and hoping to realize a “closer” dream by progressing step by step. It may be a special characteristic of ESD surveys to bring about encounters with such people, but we can say that we continually met people like this.

It is true that among the people we interviewed, there were people in situations where they couldn’t even envision a dream for themselves. There was a mother crying as she held her child whose disabled limbs grew weaker every day, and at her side an eldest daughter feebly nestling by her. When one comes face to face with that kind of reality, one cannot help feeling the powerlessness of education and international assistance.

Nonetheless, even as we saw situations where embracing a dream was not possible, in every situation there was some hope. Even in the case of the family above, there were the voices of the children from the neighborhood who came to encourage the bed-ridden child and his family by singing songs in front of them, and the look of the grandfather at the side of the mother and children warmly and quietly protecting them. No matter how terrible the situation, we realized that hope was being spun in the community, and this freed us from our painful thoughts. It may be ESD’s role to make it possible not to throw away the little bit of hope even in a depressing situation.

The scenery we came across in our field work was varied and impossible to express in one word. However, if we were to condense all the
encounters into one word, it would, after all, be the name of the evaluation method mentioned above. In order to build a sustainable future, people need to “spin hope.” They need to deal with the unsustainable reality by building a feeling of community that prevents people from losing hope. More than anything, a sustainable society needs hope. If this can be understood through the following chapters, nothing would make us happier.

Yoshiyuki Nagata
Associate Professor, University of the Sacred Heart, Tokyo
Editor (*Tales of Hope II*)
CONTENTS

Foreword ................................................................................................................. i
About This Publication ......................................................................................... iii
Introduction ........................................................................................................... vi

Part I  Voices of Hope

A Tale of Hope: Bhutan

Education to Alleviate Poverty Through the Middle Way-Thinking Diverted from Daily Routine  Zaha Tamami ...... 3
Project Profile: Bhutan ................................................................. 14

A Tale of Hope: Indonesia

Creating a Village Prepared for Disasters Where the Sprit of Gotong Royong Dwells  Kono Masanori ... 16
Project Profile: Indonesia ................................................................. 27

A Tale of Hope: Malaysia

Passing the Cultural Baton from the Past to the Future  Kono Masanori ... 28
Project Profile: Malaysia ................................................................. 39

A Tale of Hope: Mongolia

Nurturing Life-sized Happiness Through Non-Formal Education  Tsutsui Sayaka ... 41
Project Profile: Mongolia ................................................................. 52

A Tale of Hope: Palau

The Re-emergence of Social Bonds Through High School Vocational Education  Nagata Yoshiyuki ... 54
Project Profile: Palau ................................................................. 66
A Tale of Hope: Thailand
Change is Possible - Promoting Autonomous Participation under Difficult Conditions  
Zaha Tamami … 67
Project Profile: Thailand .................................................. 83

A Tale of Hope: Viet Nam
Developing a Model for Home-Based Early Interventions for Children with Disabilities  
Wipula Dahanayake … 84
Project Profile: Viet Nam .................................................. 97

Another Look at the Tales: What Was Accomplished?
Nagata Yoshiyuki … 98

Part II  DESD and beyond

ESD as a Paradigm Shift: Spinning Hopes Towards a Sustainable Future  
Nagata Yoshiyuki … 109

Reflecting on the Evaluation Methodology of HOPE  
Jose Roberto Guevara … 136

Lessons Learnt from "HOPE" Evaluation  
Pala Wari … 149

Discoveries by ACCU Staff and the Need for Rethinking Educational Cooperation  
Mori Toru … 155

Annex


Annex 2  Collected results of the “HOPE” Evaluation Questionnaire … 180

Annex 3  ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme ….. 188
Part I

Voices of Hope
Bhutan in the Midst of Change

“Material conveniences and technological improvements are greatly desirable to ameliorate the harsh, brief and brutal existence in many parts of the globe. But, beyond a level, an increase in material consumption is not accompanied by a concomitant rise in happiness. There is ample evidence to support this conclusion.”

Is economic development really contributing to people’s happiness? Is it appropriate to use economic power as the only indicator of a country’s development? In Bhutan, a small country in the Himalayas, the idea of Gross National Happiness (GNH) promoted by the country’s fourth king is being lifted up as the highest concept for the country’s development. Further, this concept has crossed the borders of this long-isolated, small, land-locked country and is becoming an indicator measuring the abundance not based on the economy that is demanded by people across the world.

Up until now, people in Bhutan had calmly entrusted the future of the country to the knowledgeable and virtuous reigns of successive kings. However, entering the 21st century, the people have gained the important responsibility for steering the country. At the suggestion of the fourth king himself, control has been transferred from the monarchy to a democratic system, and people were told that from now on, each person must think hard about the country’s future and cast a vote with a sense of responsibility and pride. This change was experienced by the people of Bhutan with some shock. Many voices expressed strong hopes that the monarchy would continue. However, the fourth king spoke simply and persuasively: “Today you have a good king, but what if you have a bad king tomorrow.” He communicated the importance of the people being involved in creating their own country and passed the throne on to his son to lead the democratization process.

Among the various processes of democratization, the biggest change was the implementation of a general election. Bhutan, which had no experience of party politics, saw two new political parties arise, and came to choose legislative representatives in a general election. The fifth king, Jigme Khesar Namgyel Wangchuck, kept out of the election and in a clear voice called for the establishment of Bhutan’s own unique democracy. "As you approach the duty of voting at the elections that will bring democracy, do so with pride and confidence of a people that have achieved so much," he said to each one of Bhutan’s people.

However, big change of a whole country usually does not proceed smoothly. First, this was a change that involved many people who were learning about the concepts of elections, voting, and democracy for the first time. In addition, in Bhutan, 80% of the people earn the bulk of their

---

Voices of Hope

3 In this situation, each one of Bhutan’s people is expected to actively carry the burden of the country’s future.

**Education for Poverty Alleviation within Sustainable Development**

When one thinks about sustainable development in developing countries, one must be conscious of the “development” side in equal measure to the “sustainability” side. In Bhutan, where 30% of the people live below the country’s established poverty line, if one does not position poverty alleviation appropriately within sustainable development, “sustainable development” itself will likely end up being an unpersuasive concept. Therefore, under the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific Innovation Programme for ESD (IP), Non-formal and Continuing Education Division, Department of Adult and Higher Education, Ministry of Education of Bhutan undertook a project aimed at alleviating poverty through reforming farming practices. Based on the wish to develop learners’ thinking skills beyond farming and enable them to apply their thinking abilities autonomously in various aspects of their lives, the project was implemented as a central component of literacy education.

The project was conducted in six villages within Bhutan. One of them, the village of Mendrelgang in Tsirang District, was located a six-hour drive from Thimphu, Bhutan’s capital, and exhibited all the aspects of a typical Bhutanese farming village. In the bowels of the deep green mountains, homes with deep traditions of Tibetan Buddhism are scattered across the land, and people wearing the **gho** and **kira** ethnic clothing chat while farming. A special characteristic of this region 162 kilometers south of the capital is the air that seems to sweat with moisture from the strong rays of

---

At a glance, the village seems to be totally ordinary. However, this is not a community that has experienced generations of continuity. It arose as a result of the government’s relocation policy. In this community, in which people have gathered from across Bhutan, people using various regional dialects co-exist. During the relocations, each household was given land to farm, but one cannot say that the land was necessarily appropriate for farming. As in many other farming villages in Bhutan, much of the land is sloped, and even though it is farmland, it is not wide and level. Rather, each household farms using the space in front of the house, and the extent of the farming seems to involve planting the least number of young plants as necessary.

What are the most appropriate crops for the climate of the village? The method the villagers used to improve their lives was not traditional. First, to answer the question, the learners state the special characteristics of various crops. Then, they use a matrix in order to compare them, score the crops based on various perspectives such as economic efficiency and the environment in which they best grow, and rank the crops. Then, the leaders select a crop, and as a component of the project, cultivate the seedlings for this crop.

After going through this learning process, passion fruit was selected as the crop in the village of Mendrelgang. It matched the warm climate and the soil, the level of market demand, the priorities of the district’s agricultural policy, and was the result of the consideration of many aspects. What results has the project produced?
Fruits of Learning

“Before joining the literacy class, my life was like that of a cow. I just did farming and ate whatever available grain blindly. Now I am with confidence. I know what I am planting and why I am doing this.”

These are the words of a woman who participated in the project in the literacy class. Among the learners in the literacy class, there were many students who had never done any simple reading, writing or calculation. For these men and women, just attending the literacy class two hours a day in the evening to learn reading, writing and arithmetic was like a job. Particularly for the female learners who were busy every day with farming, housework and taking care of children, just setting aside the time to attend the literacy class was a huge challenge. In consideration of this situation, the project incorporated situational analysis of each person’s farming in the midst of learning in the literacy classes. The learners were hoping that the quality of their lives would improve even a little by changing their farming practices. Thus, holding a handbook instead of a textbook, they wrote down the names of crops around them, discussed the different crops, wrote down their special characteristics, attributed a score, and performed calculations. After they finished the sequence of study using the handbook, they were able to select crops that were persuasive to all, and seedlings were given to them to plant on an experimental basis. Then they were able to test the results achieved with their heads with their own hands. To the learners, the process brought with it a great deal of hope. At the same time, from the standpoint of literacy education, the process enabled learners to truly apply literacy skills to their actual lives and, unconsciously, was connected to activating higher-order thinking skills such as scoring and ranking.

“I became able to identify most good products in the locality and how to
market them. I became able to calculate my own income.” As the words of this learner indicate, through the process, learners were able to gain overall knowledge of their situation, including the climate and soil of their village and its distance from markets, the farming in which they were currently engaged, their revenues and expenditures, and farming that would be sustainable and productive.

Further, of course learners gained skills in reading, writing and arithmetic, but also in critical thinking, analysis, and collective decision making. One female learner said the following: “When I was first asked what crop to grow, I said we should go for maize. Maize is commonly grown here. But, after the situational analysis, I decided to go for passion fruit. Why? Because maize requires lots of labour but passion fruit require less and they are easy to take care of.” Her face was full of confidence after having completed a process of thinking collectively about what crop was most appropriate, obtaining information and deciding based on that information, rather than just continuing to plant crops she had planted as a matter of course.

When learners spoke about the changes before they attended literacy classes and participated in the project and after, the expressions on their faces were memorable. As she looked at the passion fruit that were gradually ripening in front of her eyes, a female learner said proudly to the village head that she would now like a passion fruit juice factory because it would be more efficient to make the fruit into juice while it was fresh, before bringing it to market. In this way, the learners not only gained skills and knowledge, but confidence.

Just after the project began, a district agricultural official visited Mendrelgang to participate in the first training. He reflected: “[It is] quite encouraging to learn from the change. In June and July [when the project was launched] the participants were reluctant to say a word… they were
very shy.” A literacy instructor who became close to the learners and supported the entire process is a witness to this: “Now they have confidence. They know how to select not only crops but animals, trees, etc. We were blind before. But now, through this handbook, we change,” he said.

A Holistic View of the Target Population

In the background of this process of change is the fact that at each level of government, the village, district and central government, the education and agriculture ministries were united in conducting the activities that supported the learning of the participants. Further, even though the project was originated by the ministries of education and agriculture, from the start it was not top-down and the implementation structure included the learners. The foundation for this was the belief that if the learners had the appropriate support, they would be able to accomplish the tasks, and that the learners were farmers, parents, active citizens, and change agents for the country.

At the village level, instructors provided patient support, and village officials, most of all the village head of Mendrelgang, offered trust and cooperation. “Farmers, they know how to work. But they didn’t know how to select crops. They are hard-working but produced little. So I teach how to select good crops step by step. By working and working, they came to know more about crops,” said an instructor. He believed that the learners could change and supported the learning of the participants by taking leadership and establishing linkages with the principal of a neighboring public school and an agricultural extension worker. Even after passion fruit was chosen and the learners had the seedlings in their hands, the instructor walked around visiting the learners’ homes and joined the learners in watching over the growth of the passion fruit. In the same way, the village head of Mendrelgang believed that if villagers had timely
support and education, they would be able to display sufficient ability. Occasionally, he spoke to the villagers suggesting they think and act for themselves. “Initially, when the project was initiated here, I expected that everything that needs to be done should be solely from the people. I created awareness among the people not to expect all from the government but do it themselves. And I let them make decisions and encouraged them to be independent.” Additionally, if they had an idea, he called for villagers to raise their voices and formally or informally share the idea with neighbors, thus advocating for their active participation in developing the village. This kind of thoughtful support from instructors and leadership from the village head, as well as their trust towards the learners, enabled these formerly illiterate villagers to become farmers autonomously making choices in their daily lives.

Further, through this ESD project, the cooperative relationship formed between the Ministry of Agriculture and the Ministry of Education overcame the problem of bureaucratic divisions among agencies evident in many countries, and can be seen to have had deep impact both for the implementers and the beneficiaries of the project. At the time of the launch of the project, an official of the Ministry of Agriculture who heard that the project period would be two years wondered about two years being very short for a project concerning agriculture. However, he gradually recognized the significance of this project conducted through non-formal education. “In the past,” he said, “the Ministry of Agriculture had difficult times involving parents in our project. But, we made it with this project through non-formal education. Farmers are learners and parents.” On the
other hand, an official with the Ministry of Education said that there was merit in it not being an official partnership concluded through a memorandum of understanding. “They share agricultural knowledge with me and I share that of literacy—it is a both-way learning [bi-directional learning].” In other words, we can say that officials with the ministries of agriculture and education of the central government were learning about agriculture and literacy from one another as they were involved in the development and management of this project that contributed to learning and poverty alleviation among the participating farmers. “Education plays an important role in poverty alleviation—adult literacy is something that we need to work a lot more on,” said the education secretary. Behind the secretary’s stance of emphasizing literacy education from the central government to the literacy class in the village is the change in the learners brought about by this single, continuous string of partnership.

**Sustainable Development for Gross National Happiness**

Through literacy education, this project aimed to change farming practices and, thereby, to alleviate poverty. The project enabled farmers who had had no opportunities to learn simple reading, writing and calculation to learn these things and, through scoring results and creating matrices, to master higher-order thinking skills and launch a process of deepening their confidence in making decisions and taking action. These skills were used directly in their farming, and their actual experiences farming were in turn reflected in the non-formal education classes. If one takes a short-term view of changes in farming practices and poverty alleviation, it is hard to say that results were achieved during the two years of the project. The passion fruit was still small, was not transported to markets, and one cannot say at all that people’s lives were changed by these little passion fruit. However, when one returns to the perspective of education for sustainable development, one can probably see signs of poverty alleviation
People who before had blindly done their farming became conscious of why they were planting something and what they were planting. They not only followed customs, but obtained information from their surroundings, thought together, made choices, and implemented them. Then, the new ideas gained as a result were discussed again and moved towards implementation. The learners became conscious of each one of these processes. In other words, they grasped their situations, and while obtaining necessary knowledge, gained thinking ability to change their situation in a better direction. When one positions poverty alleviation in the midst of sustainable development, this is an important foundational ability. Rather than simply receiving the blessings of development from an outside source, the ability to think for oneself and search for a better route to alleviate poverty is an ability that makes the building of a sustainable society possible.

As expressed aptly by a staff member of the Ministry of Education, sustainable development is: “Education to move forward—not through the extreme path but the middle way.” This project can be said to have built a foundation for searching for this “middle way.” Whether advanced or developing, many countries have experienced rapid development leading to unsustainable societies and treasure that is hard to recover. Visible and invisible cultural traditions, the natural environment, and social bonds are being lost. In the midst of this is Bhutan, searching for “the middle way” to achieve Gross National Happiness in the midst of a sustainable society. What this project has brought about is a process for farmers who had led passive daily lives to gain higher-order thinking skills that enable them to become individual change agents. These are changes at the micro level, but are truly aligned with the flow of macro-level changes through which Bhutan as a whole country is progressing.
If we now recall the idea of Gross National Happiness promoted by Bhutan’s king, the concept is accepting of the idea that material development brings material enjoyment. However, it is a stance that, as a matter of course, continues to question whether that will bring happiness. As mentioned at the beginning of the paper, Bhutan is currently in a major period of transition. In this transition it is essential for each one of the people to keep GNH in her/his mind and master skills in obtaining information, thinking, and making decisions one by one. This ESD project can truly be said to be one step forward in that direction. Further, as one of the literacy class instructors said, this one step is connected to the next step: “They used to grow vegetables, but, through this project, they became good decision makers. This impact will remain for new generations.”
Project Profile : Bhutan

Strategic Action for Enhancement of Farm Products for Poverty Reduction in Rural Communities Through Non-Formal Education

Organisation:
Non-formal & Continuing Education Division, Department of Adult and Higher Education, Ministry of Education

Outline:
Poverty in Bhutan is largely a rural phenomenon, where farming is the main occupation. If farmers are not supported with improved farming techniques and marketing, there is a danger of increasing rural urban migration and that most of the farm land would remain barren. Prioritized actions for improvement of the farming practices will therefore be carried out through developing handbooks.

Project Site(s):
• Ngatshang, Mongar district, Eastern Bhutan
• Mendelgang, Tsirang district, Resettlement area, Southern Bhutan
• Bumdeling, Trashi Yangtse district, wild apple growing region Eastern Bhutan

Activities:
• Coordination meeting at the national level to discuss on the constraints faced in the 1st year project and to plan for the second year.
• Orientation workshop in 3 selected sites with the implementing partners.
• Conduction of situational analysis of the farming practices by the NFE learners involving the village elders and community leaders in all three sites.
• Training of farmers on the improved method of farming by the local RNR extension agents.

Number of Beneficiaries:
• 7 people of officials in the implementing organisation
• 25 people of district Sector heads
• 7 people of head of the School
• 60 Non-Formal Education Instructors
• 120 Non-Formal Education Learners
• 18 people of Community Leaders

Major Outputs/Outcomes:
• Handbook (literacy material) for conducting situational analysis
• Coordination meeting at the national level
- Preliminary meeting in the identified project sites
- Orientation workshop in three selected sites
- Conduction of situational analysis of the farming practices in all the three sites
- Training of farmers on the improved method of farming
- Stronger cooperation and team work in the communities fostered
- The NFE learners could plan and plant long and short term crops
- Needs assessment conducted and future plans developed independently
- A sense of belongingness and ownership created
- A value laden multicultural approach in imparting technical and literacy skills to the NFE learners enhanced
- NFE programme was recognized as the important and effective channel for the implementation of ESD-related activities
Introduction

“Science without conscience is but the ruin of the soul.”

(François Rabelais, *Pantagruel*, chapter 8)

What should we learn, how should we learn it, and how should we share what we have learned? These are questions that educators consciously, or even unconsciously, face on a daily basis. When speaking about Education for Sustainable Development (ESD), we treat the educational goals, process, and learning environment as important considerations. This is perhaps out of a wish to use newly gained knowledge to prevent the harmful occurrences that lead to an unsustainable, destructive world.

The concept of ESD is very broad, ranging across a variety of themes such as peace, environment, and human rights, and emphasizing the necessity of a multi-disciplinary approach to realize sustainability. Volcanic eruptions, which are connected with the ancient mystery of the birth of life on the ocean floor, at the same time threaten the existence of life itself. An ESD project in Indonesia takes up this theme head on.
Indonesia, which is made up of over 17,000 islands, is a country where earthquakes, tsunami, and other dangerous natural disasters are neighbors. West Java Province, which is the province with the largest population at over 40 million, is on the island of Java, and has seven active volcanoes. In this location, Mount Papandayan (2,586 m) had a large eruption in 1772 in which about 3,000 people were killed, and in 2002 attention focused on it when it erupted again.

During the 2002 eruption, the lava flow reached neighboring villages and destroyed local peoples’ lives. When the Hope Evaluation Team visited (September 2008), the top of the volcano continued to emit smoke. During the eruption, one of the areas that experienced damage was Sirnajaya village in Garut district. This village is located about 70 kilometers southeast of Bandung, the site of the 1955 Asian-African Conference, which was a turning point for colonies in becoming independent nations. It is inhabited by Sundanese Muslims. On this trip, our HOPE Evaluation Team visited in the middle of Ramadan, and under the usual heat of the summer sun, we came into direct contact with the depth of belief of the local people as they overcame their own desires.

Natural disasters often affect a wide area, but the claw of the damage is felt at the village level. Thus, in this paper I would like to introduce disaster mitigation education taking place in a village on the front line for damage. What do the people involved in the activities hope for in their learning and how is the knowledge useful to them for the future?

**Mitigating the Disaster from Volcanic Eruptions: The Case of West Java**

WALHI West Java, the implementing organisation for this project, was established in 1980 and is one branch of WALHI/Friends of the Earth Indonesia, which conducts environmental activities across Indonesia.
At present, WALHI has over 450 member organisations and is the country’s largest environmental NGO, addressing issues related to rain forest protection, water, food, and climate change. The organisation employs a dual approach involving advocacy campaigns as well as assistance to grassroots activities. Within this framework, WALHI’s West Java office implements multiple environmental preservation projects, with an emphasis on forming cooperative relationships with other NGOs and promoting the participation of youth in its educational activities and trainings.

The project on which this paper focuses aims at developing local communities well-prepared for disasters. It does this by having university student volunteers trained in natural disasters, including volcanic eruptions, spend a few days or weeks in vulnerable mountain communities to help raise the villagers’ consciousness and capacity for coping with disasters. Thus, in addition to the target population in Sirmajaya village, 40 university student volunteers from the suburbs of Bandung were chosen (most were Sundanese like the villagers), with two target groups formed.

Because there are three active volcanoes in the area around Sirmajaya village, including Mount Papandayan, the area is blessed on one hand with fertile soil. However, on the other it is affected daily by movements of the earth’s crust and volcanic earthquakes. The majority of villagers are of low socio-economic status, cultivating vegetables such as broccoli, potatoes and carrots, and leading simple lives. In this case, of the 5,230 people in the village, about 10%, or 477 people, (the male-female ratio was about 50-50) participated in the series of disaster prevention activities. In addition to WALHI’s official call to participate in the project, people gathered by word of mouth.

---

1 For details concerning this project, refer to the ACCU website at http://www.accu.or.jp/esd/projects/ip/ip01_indonesia.shtml
2 WALHI headquarters website : http://www.walhi.or.id/websites/index.php/en
Prior to visiting the village, the university students attended several training sessions conducted by WALHI, and learned foundational knowledge about natural conditions before and after disasters, observation, and methods of coping with disasters. The highlight of the training was a six-day course held at an outdoor camp in the midst of nature in Lembang that incorporated methods like a puppet show and picture drawing game. In order to encourage the youth who had developed teamwork and increased enthusiasm to continue obtaining information, WALHI recorded the training modules on a CD-ROM. In addition, for the villagers, WALHI developed a “volcanic disaster comic book” as an easy-to-understand educational material, and printed and distributed 500 copies. As the students spent time living together with the villages, they communicated the knowledge and experience they had mastered concerning disasters.

Arifin, one of the student volunteers, said: “I had had experience being a disaster response volunteer, but after I underwent the WALHI training, my view of disasters changed. Earlier I had thought that disasters were a matter of fate and that nothing could be done about them, but I realized the importance of disaster preparation. The people of Sirnajaya village listened so carefully to my experiences and those of the other youth, and through conversation, I learned about the local situation in the village.” In this way, the change in consciousness among the youth about disasters gradually extended its effect to the residents of Sirnajaya village as well as to friends and even the families of the youth.

**Cultivation of Feelings of Safety and Autonomy**

Several results and issues arose from the discussion with youth volunteers and villagers involved with the project.

First, the youth and the villagers shared increased comfort resulting from
gaining scientifically-based knowledge and information about volcanic eruptions. Villagers said things like: “I am thankful that if an eruption occurs, I know the best way to guide my family and animals in fleeing” and “Before undergoing the drills, I had so many worries, but now I am sensitive to the signs of an eruption and am able to feel relaxed.” As a result of the project, the villagers who had fled in a confusing pattern now understood the areas expected to be dangerous in an eruption. This can be said to be an indicator that they will not fall into an extreme panic if an eruption now occurs.

In order to enable students to learn broadly about the activities and research of various agencies connected with volcanic eruptions, a field trip to the observatory post run since 1985 by the government of Garut district was held during the volunteer training, and students were given lectures about measurement of volcanic activity using seismography and global positioning systems (GPS) and about communications networks for use in the case of disaster. Ideas developed to build upon this included creation of hazard maps by villagers themselves and the establishment of a media center to gather and disseminate disaster-related information. The implementation of these plans had not occurred by the time of the HOPE Evaluation. Thus, one after another we heard requests from villagers not to stop at an academic study of volcanic eruptions and to offer more practical activities such as hazard maps and emergency drills as the next step.

Second, villagers lost their passivity in the face of disaster, and a mental attitude to try to improve their situation has begun to grow. As mentioned earlier, hearing the experiences of volunteers who devised measures to reduce damage rather than viewing the damage as fate left a lasting impression. At present, in addition to the influence of the eruption’s damage on the village, the problem of illegal logging of the rain forests has arisen, and recently the water shortage has become severe. Some
villagers estimated that the volume of mineral water obtained from the springs by Mt. Papandayan decreased by 75% following the 2002 eruption. These circumstances seemed to give villagers a strong motivation towards the training because they wanted to understand the current situation of the damage caused by the disaster as well as to discover clues for clarifying the natural phenomena taking place. “I think that various problems are interconnected. The water shortage is caused not only by the influence of the volcanic eruption, but probably also by the illegal logging and forest fires,” surmised one of the village youth. The majority of villagers, including this youth, had only completed primary education. But regardless of their school career, the villagers scrupulously observed changes in the environment surrounding them. Our team was so impressed by this youth’s desperate efforts to solve the problems of the village and his strong sense of mission.

The third result was the deepening bonds and trust developed through the interaction of the student volunteers and villagers. In order for the disaster prevention activities to continue in the village, it seems logical to say that one should select leaders from within the village rather than volunteers from the outside. However, it is definitely the case that one of the important elements of this project was the experiment of promoting exchange between the villagers and university students who did not have great cultural differences from the villagers and who were recruited for this purpose. The 40 university students registered as volunteers were busy with daily study and many extra-curricular activities, and there were some who could not spend enough time interacting with the villagers. However, we were told that a portion of the students stayed a significant time in the village and continued to keep in touch with the villagers thereafter. Among them, some exceeded their roles as volunteers assisting with disaster prevention measures and were welcomed to the village kindergarten as volunteers. One male student reflected: “I went to the village to communicate what I had learned in the training to the villagers, but I was
surprised by the depth of their wisdom. Each person contributed his or her knowledge and worked towards solutions.” In addition, there were female students who said that the best part of participating in the WALHI training was making friends at other universities and meeting many other people who were sympathetic towards others. The volunteers were shy when they were asked serious questions during the evaluation interviews, but in the near future there may be among them some who return to the village as skilled scientists.

Managing the project also provided learning opportunities for WALHI staff. The active project leaders at the WALHI West Java office were close in age to the student volunteers. For WALHI, which emphasizes advocacy work, the project provided an opportunity to pay more attention than usual to government efforts regarding disasters and to the environmental protection laws in West Java and to trends concerning these. On this occasion, they were able to open their hearts during several days in the field with our evaluation team. WALHI staff told us: “We feel true passion for our work when we are able to build good relations between villagers and volunteers and contribute to resolving problems.” To be able to move the project plan forward from beginning to end in the midst of Indonesia’s multi-ethnic society, staff worry every day about misunderstandings of the villagers’ culture and daily routines as well as the importance of keeping up the spirit and unity of the volunteers. As these small efforts build, even if they don’t yield immediate results, they sow seeds of hope among all and contribute to the process of each person’s growth.

In the HOPE Evaluation in which the writer participated, villagers, student volunteers, and WALHI staff participated in various project activities from different standpoints. Our team interviewed each of these groups and shared the results in front of the whole group in the end. Through various exchanges, we confirmed the necessity of taking initiative through use of an information communications network based on the wisdom of the
villagers and their trust. All of the members of our evaluation team hope that through the evaluation, all of the involved parties were able to focus on one another and that it served to move one step forward in building mutual respect for complementary roles. Our team was filled with humor from members from Fiji, Papua New Guinea, and Thailand, and we represented experience in the educational and environmental fields. Together, during a stay of less than a week, we made many fresh discoveries.

**Blessings from the Volcano**

The volcanic belt presents not only the negative aspect of eruptions. One can see in each area of the world vegetable and fruit cultivation using the fertile soil with good drainage and the expansion of profit-making activities connected to industries such as thermal electricity and tourism.

Mount Papandayan is near tourist areas such as the hot spring of Cipanas. However, in the case of the particular village we visited for this evaluation, the villagers were living a life of bare self-sufficiency and were not able to develop a creative approach to improving their conditions. They were entangled in the complex problem of ownership rights to the land, and we had the impression that this hindered the residents from developing their own plans and making use of government services.

For example, in Sirnajaya village, the building that housed the junior high school was damaged during the previous eruption. Since then, sending their children to the school in town has become an economic burden for many families. This is one cause of the middle school attendance rate in the village being low. In order for the residents to be able to lead lives that are safer, and even more, which guarantee their human rights, it is probably necessary for them to strengthen connections with local government. Further, although the sad situation of the damaged area was
communicated widely through the media, the aid received was largely of an emergency nature. As is typical for similar villages, not enough assistance is focused on actions to prevent disaster and for mid- and long-term revitalization and development.

Hiroki Kamata, a researcher of volcanoes in Japan and across the world, wrote in *Volcanic Eruption: Prediction and Disaster Mitigation* (Iwanami Shoten, 2007): “If you reflect on volcanic eruptions as natural disasters, you realize that there is no example in folklore or mythology involving the conquest of nature. In the case of volcanic islands surrounded by the sea, ancient wisdom concerns how to live with volcanoes. On the other hand, those of us who came later feel that we can control nature based on the rapid progress of science and technology.” Kamata proposes a more holistic form of research, combining natural and social sciences. Concerning this point, the people of Sirnajaya village now not only predict eruptions, as they had been, by measuring the vibrations of a pile of stones; they believe they should act based on a scientific foundation. But on the other hand, we can observe their stance of placing importance on harmony with nature based on their reverence for it. While they demand scientific information, it seems that they will not overdo it, and maintain a balance. During our evaluation, we tried looking for clues in Sirnajaya village about mythology concerning volcanic eruptions to obtain more insight into villagers’ worldview, but we were not able to determine clearly if such stories existed.

Natural Disaster = Natural Hazard + Vulnerability (Man-made actions, poverty, etc.)

Disasters occur when natural hazards meet vulnerability caused by human actions and poverty-related issues. In the case of volcanic eruptions, it is not necessarily true that this rule applies. But, in a situation where the eruption itself cannot be prevented, continuing to make efforts to reduce
vulnerabilities to disaster is important, while also being thankful for the natural benefits over the long-term.

The “Blue Bird” Found on Java Island—The Spirit of Mutual Help

In efforts to mitigate disasters, in addition to gaining correct knowledge concerning disasters, establishing infrastructure such as earthquake-proof buildings, emergency routes, and satellite water and sewage systems is essential. Through WALHI projects, one can definitely see progress in the former area, but it is clear that there are many unresolved issues in the latter. However, it became clear that in Sirnajaya village, there is a third element, Gotong Royong, which resides in the village and serves as a “soft” foundation for disaster prevention. (In the local language, Gotong Royong means a spirit of mutual help that brings out each person’s abilities.)

Concerning the promotion of ESD, ordinary people who do not know anything of the term “ESD” cannot overlook what they think is important and what they want to pass on to the next generation. Thus, when asked why he is proud of his village, a male who is in a position of responsibility in the village says straightforwardly that it is because of the strong bonds with which people help one another as if they were a family. This is the spirit of Gotong Royong.

On the other hand, in response to the question of what he would like to change in the village, he laments: “Our village is poor and economically behind the other villages. We don’t own the land, and with just growing potatoes and carrots, we can barely make a living.” I remember the conclusion of the story of Maeterlinck’s Blue Bird that reminds us that true happiness is found in one’s own backyard and in appreciating the daily routines of our lives. The most precious spirit of helpfulness is
probably within their village, and we are moved to point this out from the outside. This solid foundation is so important for creating a village prepared for disasters. To the villagers concerned, however, noticing that this has a value exceeding their level of economic development is not such a simple thing. In the midst of the march of development, what can the villagers do in order not to lose sight of this blue bird of happiness? It is important for everyone to continue the quest to think about this.

One means for overcoming this difficulty is likely to start with knowing both the limitations and the value-added of the meaning of ESD. One can say that the highest level of science, technology and preparation of infrastructure is not included within the narrow definition of ESD activities. However, the lack of these will not cause the “ruin the soul” in the words of François Rabelais, but will destroy the body. Thus, we hope that when ESD learning is implemented together with other specialized knowledge and development projects, that its true value can come out as a foundation for those activities and as a guiding principle to act upon in pursuing true, sustainable directions.

Mt. Papandayan (September 2008)
Capacity Building of Community Based Disaster Risk Assessment and Mitigation on West Java Volcano Hazard

Organisation:
Walhi West Java Indonesian Forum for Environment (WALHI)  Friends of the Earth Indonesia

Outline:
West Java Province is gifted with fertile land, but it is vulnerable to tectonic/ volcanic earthquakes and eruptions with many volcanoes present in the area, a series of educational and training projects need to be implemented to decrease the impact of volcanic hazard by raising awareness and building response capacity, as well as by reducing the effect of hazard on the most vulnerable people living in the disaster-prone areas.

Project Site(s):
- West Java Province

Activities:
- Motivational training
- Skills Training
- Spatial Volcanic Hazard Information Course
- Volcano Monitoring Participation

Number of Beneficiaries:
- 30-40 persons of volunteer: Age between 19-35, 35 male and 5 female, mostly college student
- 477 persons of community members: Age between 15-70, 265 male and 212 female, mostly farmer and their wives, Sundanese ethnicity, located on 14 sub-villages
- 5,230 persons of community members: Sirnajaya village area

Major Outputs/Outcomes:
- A series of motivational and skills workshop organized
- Comic books on volcanic hazard published
- Awareness among community members on volcanic hazard increased
- Capacity among community members to cope with volcanic hazard developed further
- Community taskforce on disaster preparedness organized
- Network and linkage between community and wider stakeholders strengthened
Introduction: The Kadazandusun People Within a Multi-Ethnic Nation

Malaysia, a nation of multiple ethnicities and religions, is composed of eleven states on the Malay Peninsula and Sabah and Sarawak on the island of Borneo, for a total of thirteen states. In addition to Malays, Chinese, and Tamils, the country is the home of many indigenous peoples. One of these peoples is the Kadazandusun people who represent the largest portion of the population in the state of Sabah. Most of these people are farmers who are mainly Christians.

Within Malaysia there are more than 147 languages spoken, and estimates are that 90% of them are spoken by indigenous peoples. Kadazandusun, the language of the Kadazandusun people, belongs to the Austronesian family of languages. Adding together the thirteen main dialects, one can count between 300,000 and 500,000 speakers.

Sabah, which the Kadazandusun people inherited from their ancestors, was the subject of a UN-sponsored referendum in 1963 that transferred it from British occupation to the Federation of Malaysia. Since then, due to
public education through a national curriculum and the diffusion of media, the frequency of Malay and English use has increased in the state, and the influence of these languages has been absorbed into family life. Indigenous people who felt the threat to their native language’s extinction launched a movement to revitalize use of Kadazandusun. Their activities bore fruit in 1995 when Malaysia added Kadazandusun as an additional elective course at the elementary and junior high school level; the language has been introduced into different school years in stages.

Together with the movement to revitalize use of Kadazandusun, demand has increased for linguistic research, reference books, and literacy classes in the language. Within this context, the Kadazandusun Language Foundation (KLF)\(^1\) was established in 1996 as a nonprofit research institute. KLF is the implementing organisation for the ESD project to be described.

Based on a mission to preserve, promote, and develop Kadazandusun and the other indigenous languages in Sabah, the Foundation has promoted reading and writing in indigenous languages and supported a project to train teachers at the over 400 elementary schools across the state. In addition, taking into account the lack of reading material in local languages in both schools and homes, the foundation has started publishing. Thus far, the Foundation has published many books, including Kadazandusun dictionaries, as well as other works incorporating folktales, local foods, plants, customs, rituals, and other cultural content. KLF’s unique strength is that it not only works to preserve indigenous languages, but is committed to a long-term vision of revitalizing living, indigenous cultures.

---

\(^1\) KLF website: http://www.klf.com.my/
Case Study of Togudon Village: Creation of “Eco-Books” in the Local Indigenous Language

As explained above, KLF, an organisation with a mission to preserve indigenous languages, served as the implementation partner for an ACCU-UNESCO ESD Innovation Programme aimed at producing concrete results from the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development. The organisation’s selection to represent the multi-ethnic nation of Malaysia can be said to be a symbol of the country’s tolerance. For two years beginning in 2006, KLF implemented an ESD project through the Programme that centered on raising the literacy of the Kadazandusun people in their mother tongue. Project content consisted of gathering folktales concerning forest preservation and sustainable use of natural resources that had been passed down orally in the village, as well as creating picture books from simple passages and illustrations by each family.

The location chosen for the picture book project was Togudon Village, Moyog, Penampang District, West Coast Division, Sabah. To get there, one travels about one hour by car inland into the mountains from Kota Kinabalu, the international gateway to Sabah State, and through Donggongon Town in which KLF has an office. Transportation networks for travel to Togudon have been established. However, in comparison with the urban coastal areas where luxury resorts are being developed at a rapid pace, there is an obvious gap in lifestyle and culture. Local staff point out that there are likely greater gaps than the material and physical differences between these locations. Village children, for example, take off from the town school to help with traditional festivals, sometimes making it difficult for them to keep up with their studies.

---

2 For details concerning this project, refer to the ACCU website at http://www.accu.or.jp/esd/projects/ip/ip01_malaysia.shtml
Thirty families, including the teachers at the preschool in Togudon and mothers of preschool students, participated in the project. First, KLF used a regular gathering at the preschool to request participation in the picture book project. In a group which included women who had never attended school and who could not read or write, there was not a small amount of confusion even among those who were interested due to the fact that they were not familiar with the process of publication. When the steps in the process were explained in an easy-to-understand way using samples of actual books, the faces of the participants gradually brightened. According to KLF staff, this process of explanation was the point they took the most care about in executing the project. Also, KLF trained facilitators from among the local people to play central roles; the facilitators led the literacy classes and their continuous involvement in planning and project management was emphasized as well.

Togudon Village is limited in basic supports for society such as electricity as well as other life necessities. For this reason, linkages with health and community development organisations were incorporated into the project plan from the start. Through developing their literacy skills, villagers became able to record indigenous knowledge and gained abilities needed to fulfill more important roles and responsibilities in the future. KLF staff held the hope that the project would open the way for indigenous people to become conscious again of the strengths and value of their community’s existence and unite in pursuit of a sustainable future.

KLF had the cooperation of a strong partner in this endeavor. This partner, the nonprofit Partners of Community Organizations Sabah (PACOS), establishes preschools and works in other ways to improve the lives of indigenous peoples. To KLF, with long experience in publishing and linguistic research, the presence of PACOS and its warm relations of trust and experience with residents at the grassroots level, was a great help. In

---

3 PACOS website: http://www.sabah.net.my/pacos/
this way, the project made possible a true collaboration of complementary partnership in which both partners learned from each other.

The project began with a literacy class in the native language, followed by writing of drafts of the books. These were then edited, illustrations added, and then printing was done—a process encompassing two years. In the summer of 2008, the comprehensive compilation of an 11-volume picture book series with ISBN numbers was completed. Each one of the books was full of humor and originality. Books that stand out humanize the animals and plants living in the local area and depict their interdependence and other lessons. The cover of the books are printed in color with illustrations and the writers’ names appear grandly on the cover.

On 26 September 2008, with HOPE Evaluation team members in attendance, a commemorative ceremony for the book publication was held at Monsopiad Cultural Village, which recreates the traditional village of Monsopiad, a hero of the Kadazandusun people. Villagers clothed in red and black traditional costumes performed powerful indigenous dancing, and the venue was filled with enthusiasm as if all the ancestors had returned from their graves. Volumes of the book series which had just been printed were piled together in stacks of eleven and tied carefully with a ribbon. A Sabah State representative to the national parliament attending the ceremony gave each writer a package of books when she came up on the stage. This was a moment filled with satisfaction for everyone. The following morning, the ceremony was publicized widely through the main print media in Sabah and Borneo. There is no mistaking that the writers were especially happy that this picture book series was donated to the state-managed community library in Togudon village. This was because alongside the Malay language and imported books occupying the bookshelves, this became the first recognized book in Kadazandusun.
Hopes and Horizons Expanded by the Picture Books

As indicated above, with the support and organisational capacity of KLF and its partner organisations, the execution of the various activities for completing the books went according to plan and produced a visible result. However, no one, including this writer, probably imagined the extent to which confidence grew among the people of Togudon Village or the changes in their psychology.

In interviews with the HOPE Evaluation Team, the voices below were heard from preschool teachers and mothers who participated in making the book.

“The important thing to me who ordinarily never leaves the village was that, because my name was written on the book, it was like I was able to travel far away.”

“Until now I had never been to a library, but I was so happy that the picture book was published and immediately went to the library.”

“The best experience for me was, in the midst of daily work to take care of the children and tend the fields, to learn a wise way of using time. Also, I was very happy to learn how to make a book in my native language and publish it.”

Each of these voices is proof of women starting to discover the widening of their possibilities.

There was one other discovery. At the start of the project, the team had generally established the subject of the books to be Kadazandusun traditional tales passed down among the families. At the project midpoint,
in order to make the connection with ESD clearer, the focus was narrowed to themes connected to natural resources and the natural environment based on a determination by KLF. This time it was discovered that the stories aligned with these themes included some created by the participants in addition to folktales passed down through the generations. “I wasn’t sure what to write, but on a day when it seemed like it was going to rain, I looked outside the house and there was a landslide, and I had an idea. I didn’t have confidence about the grammar, but through help on the first steps, I put my thoughts into writing. The person who said this was a woman who helped the project in organizing the mothers. This was a moment when the team was present for the cultural baton being passed down from the past toward the future.

“It was rainy season and the mother bird had to go and look for food for her babies. The tree in which the soaking wet bird lived had a sympathetic expression on its face. On the other side of the hill, there was a landslide. ‘Why does this happen?’ the mother bird asked the big tree.”

This is the way the story opens, and a tale is told of the interdependence of animals and plants in the forest and of the need for propagation of trees.

**Minority Languages Under Threat of Extinction Around the World**

Currently, about 6700 languages are in use across the world, and if no effective policy is devised, by the end of the century, about half are likely to be in danger of extinction. One statistic says that every two weeks a language is lost. According to the newest information from UNESCO’s Atlas of World Languages in Danger (2009), 25 languages from Malaysia

---

are on the endangered list. Kadazandusun has a large number of speakers and many people have cooperated in its preservation, so happily it is not on the list.

Nevertheless, across the world 199 languages have less than 10 confirmed speakers and 178 have between 10 and 50 confirmed speakers—a dire situation. UNESCO is sounding an alarm because the loss of the languages is accompanied by the loss of the abundant cultural diversity of each place. This means a loss of unique thought and wisdom that are a precious resource for building a better future.

In assessing the economic return on language utilization, experts often focus on whether the mother language is taught in the home and frequently highlight the parents’ level of consciousness. Based only on interviews in Togudon Village, the team had the impression that many people were poor at reading and writing Kadazandusun, but that they were positive about using it during their daily life.

The residents and staff of the partner organisations in the village were also all wearing t-shirts from the UN-led campaign for the rights of indigenous peoples indicating their alliance with compatriots across the world. Among them was even a youth representing the Indigenous Peoples Network of Malaysia who had a plan to present about promoting indigenous peoples’ rights and languages at an international conference, which inspired the members of the HOPE Evaluation Team.

In this way, the effort to revive indigenous language in the state of Sabah was an example of the slogan “Think Globally, Act Locally.” If I dare to raise challenges for the future, it would be strengthening the linkages between non-formal education rooted in the local society where the project was implemented and Kadazandusun classes within formal schooling. During the HOPE Evaluation, we did not visit schools, but as I mentioned
earlier, Kadazandusun is currently being introduced as an “additional subject” at the elementary and junior high school levels.

Nonetheless, we came across several people who had doubts about whether this study would be accompanied by a context of traditional values and lifestyles. Also, the Kadazandusun people, while considered a single group, can be divided into two main sub-groups—the Kadazan people and the Dusun people. Each has pride in and preferences for its distinct dialect and customs. As a result, disunity sometimes arises. Looking towards the higher goal of preservation of languages of indigenous peoples, one can consider this a possible hindrance to further progress. A memorable comment from one woman was that in the near future, she would like to invite students for non-formal education activities in the herb gardens in the various villages so that wisdom could be passed to the next generation.

**A Successful Balance of ESD Elements**

Are there special points to highlight about this project implemented by KLF under the name of Education for Sustainable Development (ESD)?

Efforts at educational cooperation in the developing world include school and library construction, as well as literacy classes, publications in the local language, and teacher training. These efforts are made by many organisations and individuals. Among these, a special characteristic of this KLF project is the mixing of three elements—adult literacy classes, picture book publication and the wisdom of indigenous peoples—with the aim of establishing the direction for creating a sustainable future. In other words, over the course of two years, mothers of preschool children, including some who were illiterate, learned reading and writing in their native language, used the ability they gained, and participated in creating a picture book based on indigenous folktales. At the entrance of the
Togudon Community Library a hanging banner states “Mambasa Manamba Toilaan! (Reading increases knowledge)”, as if keeping watch on everything.

Nonetheless, balancing these three elements cannot be done without a careful process taking into account each person’s literacy level and skills. The process includes the meticulous care given to the participants by the KLF staff, the cultivation of “value-added” partnerships with another local organisations, and the pride of the people of Togudon Village in their folktales, which they developed in the midst of the beautiful natural environment. In addition, although not mentioned earlier, there was support from fathers “in the shadows” who helped with the planning of the stories and took care of children while the mothers attended literacy classes and worked to learn how to write.

“It is good to have an end to journey toward, but it is the journey that matters in the end.” (Ursula K. LeGuin), When I read this on a bookmark with a drawing of Mount Kinabalu, my eyes accidentally stopped on these words, and I felt happy. The project was a journey with a destination of publishing picture books, but it was also a journey in which each participant treasured the scenery she encountered and moved forward one step at a time.

Lastly, I would like to introduce several other activities going on in Togudon Village and its surroundings. As soon as one visits, one instantly feels the attractiveness of the scent of the air. In the midst of this environment, the HOPE Evaluation Team members had the opportunity to peek into how the local people live. At the village’s Moyog River, which flows through the Moyog District and to the South China Sea, a traditional method of limiting fishing was revived several years ago and is known as the “Tagal System of Riverine Fish Management.” In order to prevent over-fishing, villagers use the ancient wisdom of forbidding fishing in a
designated spot for a designated time so that fish can lay their eggs there. In addition, in order to move from depending on the memory of elders to search for medicinal herbs, in 1999 an herb garden was established to pass down the information to the younger generation and others outside the village. At present, student volunteers and observers from around the world visit the garden.

These are wonderful projects based on a wish to create a sustainable society in Moyog District. In the topics for the picture book series as well, some of these elements have been made permanent through writing. Thus, from now on, in preschools and in homes, these stories will be read from by parents to children, and children will grow up curious and with warm hearts.

We also learned that indigenous people in Sabah are struggling with the issue of ownership rights to the land they farm. Complex issues have accumulated, and KLF and many other people will continue efforts to help the Kadazandusun people address their own challenges.

I would like to borrow the first and single local word we all learned through the HOPE Evaluation in order to express to the project planners, managers, and participants one more time. “Kotohuadan!” (“Thank you!”) from our hearts.
Voices of Hope

Moyog Family Literacy Project (Sabah, Malaysia)

**Organisation:**
Kadazandusun Language Foundation (KLF)

**Outline:**
The project seeks to elevate the literacy capacity of rural families so that they will be more empowered to make documentation (write stories) of aspects pertinent to a sustainable future, such as, the documentation of culture and indigenous knowledge of forest conservation and sustainable use of forest resources. Seminars and workshops are conducted to teach families reading and writing skills, and to assist parents in writing down their stories.

**Project Site(s):**
- Moyog village, Penampang district, Sabah province

**Activities:**
- Official launching of 11 storybooks, officiated by the Minister in the Prime Minister’s Department. And also attended by government officials and PO’s leaders.
- Meeting at project site, Invited writers/project participants to attend the launching of their storybooks.
- Workshop & Consultation Visit. Distributed writing papers, clear folders, color pencils and stationeries to participants for their use during practical activities.
- Writing seminar in mother tongue. In this session we assisted participants how to write and produce folk-stories that contained advices, values, skills and knowledge of Kadazandusun people on forest conservation and sustainable use of the forest and natural resources
- Meeting with parents of pre-schoolers of the Kg. Togudon pre-school. Officially appointed Ms. Zita Gosungkit (preschool teacher cum Togudon leader) as a resource person (coordinator) at the project site.

**Number of Beneficiaries:**
- 50 Adults
- 20 Children
- 10 Youth
- 9 Project Team (KLF staff & documentors)
- 8 Teachers (facilitators from PACOS/Suausindak)
**Major Outputs/Outcomes:**

- Modules 1-10 on kadazandusun language published and distributed (25 copies each)
- Skills in time management and self-discipline developed
- Ability to write in own native tongue strengthened
- More confidence in writing stories gained
- Ability to think in a more creative manner developed
- Participants empowered, by writing and documenting own cultural heritage in form of stories for children
- Ability to think more critically, i.e., ability to see from different point of view, developed
- Awareness increased that writing stories in own language is a way to preserve mother tongue
- Learned how to hold a pencil
- Personnel enlightened and could now appreciate how a book is produced and published after having undergone hands-on training on the stages in the publication and printing processes
- Personnel trained to manage projects in rural areas in the future with a new ideas on strategies and approaches
Rapid Change in Mongolian Society

“Happiness is to be happy with what you have.” A very ordinary mother who worked in the coal mines while raising six children on her own said these philosopher-like words resembling the Buddhist concept of “knowing one has enough.” Even while in a difficult living environment, this mother expressed consciousness of the issue of child labor she felt from her work in the coal mines and her unease with the damage to the environment caused by the small mining company. Of her six children, two attend the “Enlightenment Centre,” the community-level Non-Formal Education (NFE) centre, and she says she herself sometimes goes to the centre to talk with the teachers. Her daughters were not able to keep up with the education in the public school and had dropped out. She spoke of the changes in the children since they attended the centre. They were able to study at their own pace, to know what they were respected by others, and began to reach out actively to other people who needed help. What are the conditions in the county of Mongolia where one receives the above kind of response above to the question: “What is happiness for you?” What kind of place is the Enlightenment Centre towards which she feels a sense of hope?
Mongolia covers a large area and is blessed with a wonderful natural environment. Its inhabitants are known for being a horse-riding people who exhibit a great sense of pride and who, from long ago, have lived a nomadic life in movable homes called ger (“yurts”). However, over the past ten years or so, the country has been facing a variety of unsustainable conditions. The natural environment has worsened considerably, and desertification and the drying up of rivers and lakes are being reported. Even more serious than the changes in the environment are the environmental pollution and destruction caused by human activity. People’s standard of living declined as a result of the economic problems during the 1990s and the number of people flowing into urban areas to look for work rapidly increased. Approximately two-thirds of the country’s population of about 2.5 million now live in the capital Ulaanbaatar, and in this rapidly developing urban area, poverty policies, garbage management, and management of public health, including sexually transmitted diseases, are becoming important issues. Because there is no recycling system in Mongolia, all products used become garbage. The garbage produced as a result of the sudden urbanization is left on the plains and is connected to environmental pollution. In addition, without realizing the harm, people burn the garbage for fuel, resulting in air pollution and health problems. Sexually transmitted diseases within Mongolia also exhibit an increasing trend and those most vulnerable to this threat are youth and street children, as well as adults who dropped out of school or have not had educational opportunities. Moreover, as a result of population movements and urbanization, traditional culture and the wisdom of elders are not being passed down to the next generation. In order to address these issues in the society, efforts are needed that will enable people to gain the essential knowledge and skills through education in order to create a sustainable society with their own hands.
Expectations of the Non-Formal Education (NFE)

Formal education consists of educational activities that take place within the school-based education system that has been set up by the government, while informal education refers to all non-organized learning based in such things as daily life experiences. In contrast to these, non-formal education refers to goal-oriented, organized educational activities that take place outside the framework of formal school-based education. This non-formal education also provides a place where children who have dropped out of school or adults who have not had educational opportunities can come to learn. In Mongolia, non-formal education has served to extend precious learning opportunities to nomadic children who find it difficult to commute to public school due to a lack of fixed residence through employing mobile ger (“yurts”).

At the center of non-formal education in Mongolia is the Non-Formal and Distance Education Centre (NFDEC), the implementing agency for this ESD project. In 1997, the organisation was established under the Ministry of Education, Culture and Science, and at present has about 20 staff. NFDEC supports non-formal education open to all, including adults, drop-outs, students who cannot go to school, people who live in locations far from schools, and vulnerable members of the society. To improve the education level nationally, it conducts programming and develops educational materials, and oversees non-formal education centres from provincial-level centres to community-level enlightenment centres. It has an important responsibility for providing high-quality, systematic educational opportunities to children and adults who, because of insufficient educational opportunities, are left behind and pushed to the periphery as society changes.

For people who learn through non-formal education, up until now, there
have been opportunities for learning about various topics. However, there have been no opportunities or plan for them to think about a sustainable society. The government, which has felt the crisis of sudden changes in the society, decided to use ESD as a national policy to raise and resolve various issues. One can say that this project is the first experiment in enabling the people of Mongolia to be conscious of the direction aimed for in their learning and to make changes in areas such as the environment and health based on their ideas of what conditions are unsustainable and sustainable. In the process of discussing how to position ESD within the country, we were told that the debate included the question of whether to establish ESD as a new school subject or to highlight the elements of ESD in all of the school subjects. In the end, the latter approach was adopted as the national policy, and within NFE, the development on an ESD curriculum was begun.

The project launched within this context started with the translation of the International Implementation Scheme (IIS) developed by UNESCO into Mongolian by the NFDEC, in order to enable the wide circle of those involved to be able to share the same concepts. Following this, an ESD curriculum was created within the non-formal education framework, and texts and posters were developed using know-how from earlier educational materials development experiences. A policy decision was made to focus first within the two-year project period on the urgent problems of health and garbage and, following that, to expand to themes such as preservation of culture. When creating a poster to teach about the damage of tobacco within formal education, there is a tendency to teach about the ingredients in tobacco and their adverse effects on the body using formal chemical names and other specialized terms. In contrast, in this non-formal education materials development process, efforts were made to make the materials easy to understand with many photos and pictures, as well as directly useful, such as by explaining how tobacco affects one’s own body.
One of the strengths of non-formal education in Mongolia is the tight network that reaches from the central NFDEC to the enlightenment centres in the local regions. The “methodologists” responsible for overseeing the provincial NFE centers carefully communicate what they learn at NFDEC trainings to the teachers in the community-level enlightenment centres. Then, as they are being taken care of by enthusiastic teachers, children and adults who could not feel comfortable in the formal education system or who were forced out of the system become empowered and learn what they need. By integrating ESD into the non-formal education classes, for example, learners change their views that “garbage is just garbage” and “to take care of your health, you just need to take care of your body.” They become able to notice the connection between health and garbage and the connections between garbage, resources and the economy. Themes that they had thought were separate become connected as well as connected to their actual experiences. They understand the reasons why these are problems, think about solutions, and are encouraged to change their own actions and, from that, to promote changes in the surrounding community.
ESD Skills Used Effectively in Non-Formal Education, As Seen through the Project

According to the World Health Organization (WHO), life skills are “abilities for adaptive and positive behaviour that enable individuals to deal effectively with the demands and challenges of everyday life.” Among these are decision-making, problem-solving, creative thinking, and critical thinking. In ESD, importance is placed on thinking with one’s own power, solving problems, and solidifying the ability to think of other choices and methods—skills that are necessary for living—rather than technical skills in areas such as carpentry or sewing. Further, the most distinctive characteristic of ESD can probably be said to be in how this problem-solving ability is applied. For example, even if one acquires problem-solving ability, one should not think of this as a utilitarian skill for solving a problem on one occasion. ESD aims for broad thinking in which each individual is conscious of moving in the direction of sustainability in which the whole society has hope.

The children learning at the Enlightenment Centre in Mongolia are learning how to re-use garbage by making slippers from vinyl bags as a point of entry for learning about the problem of the increase in garbage. If this was all, this would be the same as earlier learning on the theme of garbage. However, a learner said: “My mother was happy that I could make money from garbage that up until now had just been thrown out.” He learned the connection between garbage and economic activities and felt motivation and pride that he could contribute to the family income and be useful to the family. From this point, learners’ thoughts extended further to: “There is also lots of garbage on the plains,” “Much of the garbage that stands out is from people who come from the city to picnic and leave garbage without cleaning it up,” and that the garbage that comes from the city has no place to go and is left on the plains. Another learner
said: “In the extremely cold winter, poor people and nomadic people who
don’t know enough about garbage burn the garbage to generate heat,” and
still another added: “If you burn vinyl bags and tires, pollutants are created
that harm the environment.” In thinking about what should be done to
solve the problem, a learner suggested: “The traditional means of burning
animal waste does not cost anything and is not connected to environmental
pollution.” The learners are even making connections by rediscovering the
value of “old-fashioned” ways.

There are voices that say that ESD is something that belongs to advanced
countries and that it doesn’t fit the context of developing countries or it is
too early for it. However, from the example of Mongolia, one can say that
even in a so-called “developing country,” through implementing ESD,
people are able to deepen their learning. One can say that this example
shows that it is never too late or too early to implement ESD.

The picture “Four Friends” was hung in the
Enlightenment Centre in Khentii Province
located approximately 330 kilometers east
of the capital, Ulaanbaatar. Many copies of
this picture can be seen in countries like
Bhutan where people are believers in
Tibetan Buddhism. On the back of an
elephant is a monkey, on whose back is a
rabbit, on whose back is a bird, and the
picture depicts them cooperating to pick a
fruit. One explanation is that the bird
spreads the seeds, the rabbit provides the
water, the monkey provides the fertilizer and the elephant protects the tree,
thus cooperating to cultivate the tree. Then, when the fruit is ready, they
climb on one another’s backs to pick their harvest, which they share. It is
a famous picture explaining the importance of cooperation. There is
another interpretation of the picture. In this one, animals who have forgotten how to respect one another start to fight over who is the oldest. The elephant says that he remembers when the tree was just a bush, the monkey says that he remembers when the tree was a small shrub, and the rabbit says he knows when the tree was just starting to bud. Lastly, the bird talks about how he carried the seeds for the tree, and the animals are persuaded that he is the oldest and deserving of respect, and peace is restored.

From the latter half of the 16th century, Tibetan Buddhism spread widely and deeply in Mongolia. During the Soviet invasion, Buddhist temples were destroyed. However, since the democratization process in the 1990s, Tibetan Buddhism once again began to seep in as the winds changed. The values-orientation which sees virtue in respecting and helping elders also matches the practices of ESD. One youth said: “The most important thing I learned in the class was to help others and to receive help from others.” One of the effects of ESD that can be cited is that it enables people to notice various connections such as between themselves and others and themselves and society. By noticing various problems in society and thinking about solutions through ESD, children who have problems in the home, who move frequently, and who face poverty and other difficulties, who drop out of school and who have difficult experiences in society are able to re-establish their positions in society and in their families. When discussing the problem of garbage on the plains mentioned earlier, a learner who raised his hand said: “In my house we have 60 horses, 300 sheep and 23 cows,” and “The people in Ulaanbaatar who don’t have these animals are the ones who are the poorest.” In this way, he taught us proudly of his own definition of abundance that did not only relate to money.

In response to the question: “What was the most significant experience for you in this project?” the NFDEC project manager responded first by
touching upon her earlier view that ESD was almost the same as environmental education. Then she said: “I started to understand that ESD includes environmental issues and other issues. For example, it made me think about cultural diversity and visible and invisible special cultural characteristics.” She added: “The population covered by formal education and higher education is only a small part of the whole, and it is important to deliver education to more people at all age levels. As a result of this project being started, I came not only to think about ESD but to view education itself more holistically.” Further, the director of NFDEC said: “I think implementing ESD through non-formal education also demonstrates a good example for formal education.”

Rather than the set framework of formal education which generally evaluates learning based on points, the flexible framework of non-formal education provides the opportunity to implement ESD in a way that creates places for learning that match the needs and pace of the learners. One has the time to become conscious again of what individuals and the society value and the flexibility to cultivate a stance of continuous, lifelong learning. Within the framework of non-formal education, and within the context of developing countries, the special characteristics of ESD are sufficiently alive.

**Life-Sized Happiness**

One of the traditional Mongolian pastimes is fortunetelling with sheep bones called *shagai*. *Shagai* means “ankle,” and when Mongolians eat...
their precious livestock, they do not leave a drop of the innards or blood. They even use the bones in their daily lives, throwing nothing out and having nothing go to waste. The *shagai*, whose four sides are called camel, horse, goat, and sheep, is one example of this. Depending on which sides of the four *shagai* come up when the bones are thrown, the route to solving troubles is foretold. Thus, when one is uncertain about the future, one uses something close at hand to search for the proper direction. One looks at the direction and proceeds with the authority of the heart. This is not something striking and new, but uses the wisdom and tools from one’s community to make better choices for oneself, one’s family and one’s community.

Our evaluation team actually had the opportunity to stay in a ger of a nomadic family during our visit to Mongolia. In the round ger on the plain from which could be seen the round horizon line, Mongolian vodka to welcome us was poured into a silver bowl passed down from their ancestors and everyone who sat in a circle partook of the drink in order. We were treated to cheese and yogurt made from milk that came from their own animals, a special “guest” meal with meat, and the “neighborhood” (the closest home was at a 2-3 kilometer distance) gathered to welcome us. Just as they did long ago, they move their homes with the changing of the seasons, and lead a nomadic life carrying with them only what they need. However, in the ger was a borrowed home generator and satellite antenna which they said was used “to watch the Olympics in real time.” In this way, we saw that social and environmental changes were certainly influencing the lives of the nomadic peoples.

The mother who treated what she had at the moment as important, the youth who viewed sheep as treasure, and the young person who said he would live by helping others and being helped by others. Each of these people is living wishing for a modest happiness. Non-formal education is playing a significant role in providing educational opportunities to people
like these, people who have moved to the city and lack educational opportunities, children who have dropped out from formal education, and widely to people who are living nomadic lives. To Mongolia, which is rapidly transitioning to a market economy, promoting ESD through non-formal education is one route that will enable ordinary people who value “life-sized” happiness to overcome the difficulties and conflicts of poverty and environmental destruction even as they are affected by societal change. This project which was begun by the NFDEC will continue even after the two-year project period ends and we hope that the results will spread to formal education and other fields.

Like *shagai*, ESD has naturally come to be a part of people’s lives and, depending on the community or people involved, balances the economy, society, environment and culture in different ways. It plays the role of making people happy and the role of helping to set a direction. In this place, the example of ESD that we saw and heard about lightened the worries of the Mongolian people and showed an important direction for change towards sustainability that they could implement.
Project Profile: Mongolia

Non-Formal Education Capacity Building for ESD in Mongolia

Organisation:
National Centre for Non-Formal and Distance Education (NFDE), Ministry of Education, Culture and Science

Outline:
In Mongolia, the curriculum and contents related to ESD are underdeveloped both in formal and non-formal education. Thus, it is crucial to develop ESD-oriented learning and teaching materials in NFE and organize activities to raise public awareness. Linking with the goals of UNDESD and other educational initiatives, the project activities include curriculum development on ESD in NFE and booklet/poster production, and organisation of capacity-building workshops.

Project Site(s):
- NFE Enlightenment centres and Community Learning Centres (CLCs)

Activities:
- Translation and publication of DESD documents
- Study best practices from the developed countries on the Non-Formal Education for Sustainable Development (NFESD)
- Development of NFESD curriculum
- Development and production of learning materials
- Training of trainers on NFESD
- Capacity building training for NFE teachers/facilitators
- Training the local people through the NFE enlightenment centres

Number of Beneficiaries:
- 250 school dropouts and out-of-school children
- 38 NFE facilitators
- 30 NFE methodologists
- 23 materials developers

Major Outputs/Outcomes:
- 14 sets of teaching-learning materials on NFESD produced (500 copies each)
- 2 educational films on NFESD produced (300 copies each)
Learning materials distributed to libraries of the Educational Institutes, Ministries (Ministry of Nature and Environment, Ministry of Health) and International Organisations such as WWF and approximately 20 NGOs, which contributed to efficient information dissemination.

Some of the learning materials produced under this project republished soon, upon request of organisations and projects in this field. For example, 4 handbooks in 300 copies each were republished by the request of UNESCO project “Educational services for nomadic people”, which contributed to the dissemination of ESD concept.

The capacity of NFDE Centre and local NFE Learning Centres strengthened.

Experiences gained on developing ESD teaching-learning materials.

Knowledge and skills on ESD increased among the project staff members.

Collection and types of the learning materials enriched.
Introduction

The Fish-Bearing Breadfruit Tree of Ngibtal

In the old days in Palau there was an old woman named Dirrabkau who lived by herself on an island called Ngibtal near the village of Ngiwal. The woman had a son named Mengidabrutkoel whom she did not see often as he travelled throughout the other villages.

The men of Ngibtal always passed by the house of Dirrabkau after a day’s fishing but they never shared their catch with her. Though the woman was fond of fish, she was never able to eat any. The old food she ate were the fruits of the breadfruit tree which grew in her yard.

One day, after a long absence, Mengidabrutkoel came to visit his mother and she took this chance to complain to her son that while others had plenty of fish to eat, she never had any for her pot. Mengidabrutkoel pitied his mother and before setting forth on his next trip, he went to the yard, to the breadfruit tree by the water’s edge. He cut off one of its branches and water gushed off from the stump, flowing spasmodically with rhythm of the waves on the shore. With
each surge, fish came out of the tree. So his mother had a steady source of fish right in her yard. This breadfruit tree became the envy of all the other people of the island. “While we must go out to the sea for our fish, the old woman can just get her fish by sitting under her tree”, they moaned.

Finally, not being able to contain their envy, the people went over to Dirrakbau’s house and cut down the fish-bearing tree (Meduu). The water started to flow from the cut trunk in a torrent and very soon the whole island was flooded and the envious people all perished. To this day the site of the island, with its pathways and house platforms, can be seen from the water’s surface off the shore in Ngiwal.

The above story is displayed by the main entrance of the Palau International Coral Reef Center in Palau’s capital, Koror. A postscript has been added pointing out that the story’s moral is that people must cooperate, share, avoid becoming greedy, and care for one another.

Although a tradition of mutual aid has been passed down through the centuries in Palau, Palau’s current situation is far from the moral described. Modernization is proceeding at a rapid pitch, and the traditional spirit of helping one another is disappearing. Older people in Palau complain that, far from helping one another, young people in particular behave selfishly, an issue I will touch upon later.

Threats to the sustainability of Palau’s society are not limited to the disappearance of traditional spiritual culture. These days, foreign capital is being welcomed, and hotels beyond the four giant ones currently operating are being constructed. Foreign laborers from the Philippines and Bangladesh are being employed as blue-collar workers and an oligopolistic market is usurping jobs that would have gone to local people. The
unemployment rate among youth is high. According to Palau government documents, in 2000 the unemployment rate for 16-24 year-old males was 5%, but in 2005 it had risen to 12.8%. The rate for females rose similarly from 6% to 10.5%. These numbers indicate that the recent rapid growth in tourism in Palau is proceeding in a “globalised” way, placing its own country’s youth in a difficult situation.

**Palau’s Changing Society and Emmaus High School**

Emmaus High School’s vocational education can be cited as an educational programme aimed at addressing the challenge of this trend of globalization. The school is a Christian boarding school serving high school students. It was established by a German missionary in 1948, just after the end of World War II. Built on a peaceful spot alongside the water facing the Pacific Ocean, the private school has one dorm, one school building, spacious athletic fields, basketball courts and other sports facilities, and workshops. The school is small, and recently there have been as many as 80 students with about 20 students in each grade. In Palau as a whole there are only five secondary schools. Among them, only one is public and that school puts its efforts mainly into vocational education. The others are private schools and, as with Emmaus High School, they provide education based on a Christian perspective. The majority of people in Palau are Christians, and Emmaus High School is a Christian

---

Voices of Hope

School, receiving various types of support from an adjoining church.

Emmaus High School’s tuition is higher than that of the public school and, together with housing and board, costs run to $220/month. While the school is not expressly for wealthy families, in general it is regarded as a traditional, elite school which has produced many people who have advanced within the political world. A significant number of graduates from the school are active in politics in Palau, and the grandchild of the former president is currently a student. Ironically, however, this boarding school which emphasizes discipline in its education has assembled many students who have been involved in some type of social problem. In Palau, anti-social acts among youth, including smoking, fighting and theft, have become highly visible. In this context, there seems to be an expectation that this boarding school can play a role as a rehabilitative facility because it teaches manners and discipline. Thus, it is not rare for parents to enroll “problem” children. Among students, one has even committed multiple robberies and spent time in jail. Nonetheless, the school’s self-evaluation report states that the school’s mission is to provide education that enables youth to become self-sufficient, good citizens, contribute to the community, and become respected people.\(^3\) As I will describe below, one can say that this mission is being achieved.

Student Empowerment

The vocational education at Emmaus High School is not overtly advertised. It represents a small but important component of the overall curriculum (Table 1.1). The goal of this vocational education is, of course, the learning of skills. However, the cultivation of a spirit of helping others is important as well. Christian educational principles form the foundation, and vocational education is positioned as an extension of those principles.

---

Vocational education is not a required subject at Emmaus High School; it is an elective in which 20% of students participate. Those who participate see the school’s workshops as their own space and call the workshops “shop” with a strong sense of affection. Among students taking shop, some even speak with pride to others about their experiences. Even if these students do not appear more engaged in their regular classes, they are vibrant while in shop, and there are boys who seem like completely different people.

The skills that the students learn are highly practical. In the workshops students create tables, bookshelves, small rest stations for the athletic fields, benches, etc. In addition, they paint walls and repair broken cars. The school’s “home-made” products enable the budget for these items to be reduced compared to what the school would have ordinarily invested, contributing significantly to the sustainability of school operations.

The quality of the items made by the students is high enough for this use and the reputation of the products is increasing within the community. Currently, there are even requests for school students to make furniture using mahogany trees that have fallen outside the town.

What one should also emphasize about the results of vocational education at Emmaus High School are the bonds between teachers and students and the return of confidence and empowerment to students that arises from this.

Vocational education instructor, Ted Telchaub Merep, engages students
dealing with all sorts of issues and takes responsibility for the large number of students called “problem children.” To the student mentioned earlier, who had served time in jail, he asked: “Would you like to be in your vocational education class or would you like to return to jail?” He says that once the student pledged that he wanted to stay and continue through graduation, the student has been keeping that promise.

On the other hand, Ted says the following when asked his most difficult experience at the school in an interview. “There is nothing more difficult than seeing students who have grown after many twists and turns ‘leave the nest’ at the time of their graduation.” He says that this is so difficult that he does not even attend the ceremony. Ted maintains a firm attitude, but the look he gives students is warm and he demonstrates the utmost trust in the students.

The Uniqueness of Vocational Education at Emmaus High School

Recently, vocational education has become one of the educational trends in the South Pacific region. Since the Sixth PRIDE Project Regional Workshop on “The Role of TVET in Pacific Secondary Schools: New Visions; New Pathways” implemented jointly in Palau in 2006 by PRIDE (Pacific Regional Initiative for the Delivery of Basic Education) and UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre for Technical and Vocational Education and Training, school education centering on academic subjects has been re-evaluated, with each country’s government putting effort into vocational education that viscerally connects school education and the actual society. This opportunity to reconfirm the tradition of “learning by doing” in the South Pacific region is significant, according to PRIDE’s former director, Mr. G. R. Teasdale.

Even though this trend is welcome, it is not without problems, however. If
the utilitarianism of vocational education is brought to the fore, the various types of richness that education should fundamentally cultivate—in other words, the emotional and spiritual sides—will be neglected. Additionally, many countries ascribe negative “second tier” value to vocational education as compared to regular education. This is probably the result of the imported Western European curriculum prioritizing knowledge--on which education has continued to be based since the end of World War II.

As mentioned earlier, the significance of vocational education at Emmaus High School stands out in this context. Vocational education at this school differs from traditional vocational education in its Christian foundation and positioning as one component of the education provided to all students. In other words, even if vocational education has a utilitarian purpose, the school is conscious of its importance in the process of human growth. From this perspective, one can view the vocational education at Emmaus High School as part of a process enabling students to gain the values and attitudes of ESD.

Vocational education at Emmaus High School succeeds by doing more than enabling students to gain skills and by functioning as “values education.” As touched upon in the beginning, helping others is not only a Christian value, but it is part of Palau’s traditional culture. In the Palauan language, “mutual help” is “Ureor Beluu.” The literal meaning of this is “working community,” and it has the convivial ring of everyone working together to accomplish a task.

By working together with friends during school and helping one another outside the classroom, students gain a self-confidence they have never felt before. One school student said: “I have gained more self-confidence and I feel that people can depend on me to get things done.” Another said: “I have learned teamwork, critical thinking and to be patient when faced with a difficult problem.” The foundation of education at Emmaus High
School is the Christian spirit, and vocational education is positioned as an extension of this. The students are empowered by the encouragement of the teachers and by gaining what is necessary from others. They acquire a feeling of self-confidence (refer to Figure 1.2). In interviews with high school students receiving vocational education and the teachers interacting with them on a daily basis, words such as “confidence,” “self-realization,” and “self-confidence” came up frequently, corroborating this empowerment.

**ESD as a Response to Local Community and Global Society**

If one is asked about a critical problem in the South Pacific region, many people will think of the island nations that may disappear as a result of global warming. Generally, when one discusses the sustainability of the South Pacific, the rather sensationalized scenario of global warming leading to a rise in sea level, leading to countries disappearing is

---


envisioned. Sustainability is treated as a critical environmental problem. In the case of Palau, this analysis does not fit. Actually, when we asked students in a group interview if they knew the term “global warming,” only two students had heard of it.

When grappling with ESD in Palau, from what perspective should one discuss it? Concerning the appropriate perspective, when Ted heard the concept of ESD he said: “This is definitely an issue that should be taken up at Emmaus High School.” Because of the aforementioned issue of foreign laborers as well as other issues such as the high school drop-out problem, one can reposition vocational education on a foundation of ESD and possibly come up with a policy solution for the social issues affecting Palau. In Palau, more than an environmental context for sustainability, there is a trend towards discussing sustainability in terms of economic and social aspects.

Caleb Otto, Emmaus High School graduate, chair of the school’s board of directors, and senator and chair of the health committee of the Palau National Congress, also emphasizes that the sustainability of the country of Palau will be affected not only by environmental issues, but by economic and social issues. Otto brought up the example of the country of Nauru in the Senate. Nauru is an island nation built on land under which phosphate ore, used in pharmaceuticals, is buried. After a period of Japanese occupation during World War II, Nauru became independent in 1968 as the world’s third smallest country. Following that, it was discovered that large amounts of phosphate ore could be mined and Nauru became wealthy through its export. Large amounts of phosphate ore were exported to advanced countries like Australia by the national mining company and it seemed like citizens’ lives suddenly became richer. However, this was a temporary prosperity. As soon as the phosphate ore, which people had thought unlimited, started to become exhausted, the country literally collapsed. At that time, those who had already made a
great deal of money emigrated and, in fact, many “threw away” their mother country. The remaining people were all the more poor. Mr. Otto says: “This is the history of a country that demonstrates the danger of rapid economic growth and is a vivid example of importing the irresponsibility of advanced countries in not considering the future.” Truly, it is an example that calls for the necessity of sustainable development in the South Pacific region.

A key unique feature of the HOPE Evaluation Method is that it “links local priorities with global issues.” It is also a method that emphasizes adaptability to a dynamic global context. Even though Palau is a small island nation in the South Pacific, at Emmaus High School there is more than enough consciousness of global issues and global context. In fact, vocational education has been established as a means of resisting the import of foreign laborers, an issue resulting in unsustainability of the local community. Moreover, vocational education plays a role in responding to the problems of local secondary education--in other words, the anti-social activities of junior high and high school students and the increase in drop-outs. It is appropriate to say that vocational education at Emmaus High School is responding both to global issues and issues within the local community. (refer to Figure 1.3)

The goal advocated in the United Nations International Implementation Scheme (IIS), which clarifies indicators for ESD, is to change values, actions and lifestyles in line with a sustainable future. From this point of view as well, one can say that the education at Emmaus High School is producing results. As represented by a quote on the self-evaluation that “students realized that they had potential which they were never aware of before,” many of the students who participated in the vocational education demonstrated a change in values.

---


7 Year 1 Final Report: Palau. (Unpublished)
As mentioned at the beginning, even through the spirit of helping others has been passed down across the centuries, as a result of rapid modernization, it has suddenly become weak. At the time of the founding of Emmaus High School, the buildings were built through shared labour, and it was a truly “hand-built” school. However, as time has passed, this spirit seems to have disappeared. Nonetheless, one can probably say that at Emmaus High School, through ESD, the values that should be passed on to the next generation are being revived in the context of a new era.

![Diagram](Figure 1.3 : Emmaus High School and Connections with Sustainable Development)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TIME</th>
<th>FRESHMEN 9th A</th>
<th>FRESHMEN 9th B</th>
<th>SOPHOMORE</th>
<th>JUNIOR</th>
<th>SENIOR</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6:00 AM</td>
<td>Rise up / Fix up your beds / Clean up your dorms / Personal preparation</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7:25 AM</td>
<td>Breakfast</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7:50 AM</td>
<td>Morning Devotion in Classrooms</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:00-8:45 AM</td>
<td>Bible</td>
<td>Algebra 2</td>
<td>Chemistry</td>
<td>Bible IV</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:45-9:45 AM</td>
<td>World Geography</td>
<td>Biology</td>
<td>Computer 11</td>
<td>Physics</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:30-10:15 AM</td>
<td>General Science</td>
<td>Physical Science</td>
<td>Computer 10</td>
<td>Bible</td>
<td>Palauan Gov’t</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:15-10:30 AM</td>
<td>Break Time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10:30-11:15 AM</td>
<td>Algebra 1A</td>
<td>Algebra 1B</td>
<td>Bible</td>
<td>Palauan History</td>
<td>Trigonometry</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:15-12:00 NN</td>
<td>Palauan Language</td>
<td>Arts &amp; Crafts</td>
<td>Geometry</td>
<td>English</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12:00-1:00 PM</td>
<td>Lunch Time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:00-1:45 PM</td>
<td>English I A</td>
<td>English I B</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>Civics</td>
<td>Economics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1:45-2:30 PM</td>
<td>Physical Education 1</td>
<td>World History</td>
<td>English</td>
<td>Life Management</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:30-3:15 PM</td>
<td>Music/Arts &amp; Crafts</td>
<td>Physical Education</td>
<td>Vocational Education</td>
<td>Vocational Educ.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3:30-4:15 PM</td>
<td>CAP (Character Award programme)</td>
<td>Work Crew</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4:15-6:15 PM</td>
<td>Free Time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6:15 PM</td>
<td>Dinner Time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6:30-7:30 PM</td>
<td>Show Time</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7:30-8:30 PM</td>
<td>Study Hall – Mon, Tues, Wed. &amp; Thurs.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:30-9:15 PM</td>
<td>Preparation to go to bed</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:15-9:30 PM</td>
<td>Devotions</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:30 PM</td>
<td>Lights out</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:45-10:00 PM</td>
<td>Personal Devotions &amp; Prayers Lights out @ 10:00 PM – Fridays &amp; Saturdays Only</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:00-8:30 PM</td>
<td>Morning Prayer Meeting – Saturday Only</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9:00-11:00 AM</td>
<td>Saturday Work Crew</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8:50 AM</td>
<td>Sunday – Kec Palauan Worship Service / 10:45 am English Worship Service</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7:30 PM</td>
<td>Sunday Evening Service at the Auditorium</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Vocational Education Focusing on Facilities Maintenance Officers Training

Emmaus High School Vocational Education Program

Palau is developing at a rapid pace. Construction of homes, government building and business are increasing. With the school’s mission to train young people to become self-sufficient, good citizen, respecting and contributing member of the community, the main objective of the project is to equip students with needed skills for maintenance of facilities, small engines, appliances among others, for sustainable development of the local community.

Project Site(s):
• Emmaus High School

Number of Beneficiaries:
• 7 students in Koror, Emmaus High School. Grade 9 to 12 (age 15-18 years) and they are all males.
• Indirect beneficiaries such as teachers, family, and community members

Major Outputs/Outcomes:
• Vocational/Carpentry Handbook produced as teacher’s reference
• Students became aware of the importance of learning of vocational skills that are important to everyday life
• Students learned how to cooperate and appreciate each other’s talents
• Students learned to appreciate working with hand and hard work
• Students learned the importance of the concept of self-sufficient and not dependent on other people
• Students learned the skills that they can apply or use in the future
• Students learned to take care of the environment
• Students provided with more learning activities that are relevant to their life in the future
Change is Possible—Promoting Autonomous Participation under Difficult Conditions

The Dilemma Facing Thailand—The Strains of Wealth and Modernization

“If one is moderate in one’s desires, one will have less craving. If one has less craving, one will take less advantage of others. If all nations hold this concept of moderation, without being extreme or insatiable in one’s desire, the world will be a happier place.”

King Bhumibol Adulyadej, a focus of reverence for the people of Thailand, said the above in a speech on December 4, 1998, prior to his birthday. He made the statement as he looked upon the country’s citizens who were then suffering under the weight of the Asian financial crisis, which had originated in Thailand in 1998. To the people, who had been apt to blindly revere economic development, these words asked them to stop and consider its ultimate purpose.

Thailand was founded on the base of this kind of Buddhist philosophy, and social and cultural abundance has been preserved in Thailand over many years. From the 17th-20th centuries, when various Asian countries were ruled as colonies of the western Great Powers, Thailand maintained its independence, promoted its own diplomacy, and achieved modernization. Even these days, many people are charmed by an image of Thailand as tranquil and peaceful as expressed by such Thai words as sabaay (“good feeling”) and sanuk (“fun”).

On the other hand, in the shadow of this abundance and peace is the northern part of Thailand. With its poverty, economic gap with the rest of the country, and the spread of drugs and HIV/AIDS, it is dealing with a reality far removed from the image of sabaay and sanuk. Hill tribes have been living in the area called the “Golden Triangle” where the borders of Thailand, Myanmar and Laos meet since before modern borders were established. These tribes represent only 1% of the population of Thailand, but among them is a great diversity of tribes including the Akha, Lahu, Hmong and Lisu. They have varied languages and traditions, but common points are their nomadic lives based on slash and burn agriculture and animist beliefs.

This northern area of Thailand which is close to Myanmar, Laos and China also served as a breakwater against communism. Under a focus on “border security,” the government directed especially severe national unification policies towards the hill tribes who repeatedly migrated between countries. The promotion of settlement for hill tribes that was a core element of the these policies forced the hill tribes to change the unique lifestyles they had developed, resulting in an upheaval in their means of livelihood from a nomadic existence based on slash and burn agriculture to a settled life cultivating crops to market. However, in the mountainous areas, transportation is inconvenient and hauling the crops is grueling. Thus, one result has been that earning their livelihood has
become more difficult, and there has been a rapid increase in those migrating down from the mountains to work as laborers. In particular, the women and girls who have come to work as prostitutes and long-term male laborers have accelerated the spread of drugs and HIV/AIDS in the mountain areas.

Another result of national unification policies has been the diffusion of public education by Thais in a Thai style. Even in small-scale schools in hill tribe villages, the standard Thai curriculum is taught by Thai teachers. At the same time, children who come down from the mountains to go to boarding schools have come to experience ignorance and prejudice as part of their school lives. Nonetheless, a Thai education is indispensable for earning a living in Thailand. Changes surrounding the education of children in Thailand have created a gap between a generation which has lived with traditional customs and a younger generation which has had a Thai school education and dreams of succeeding in the regular economy of Thai society. Ethnic traditions and customs are being lost and the number of children who are isolated from their ethnic heritage and history is growing.

**Children at the Bansunkong School**

The Bansunkong School, which is located in Mae Chang in Chiang Rai Province in the northern part of Thailand, is an elementary school (kindergarten - grade 6) dealing with this reality in northern Thailand. Because of this location and because it is a public school with free tuition, about 80% of the children are from hill tribes (mainly Akha), and the remaining 20% come from poor families in northern Thailand. This area which adjoins the border of Myanmar has children who have migrated to Thailand from Myanmar. For example, there is one 12 year-old girl placed in the third grade class who has spent a long time using English and Myanmar language and is working hard to catch up with the lessons
taught in Thai. School officials said that there are also students whose parents suffer from HIV/AIDS as well as AIDS orphans, and costs for school meals, gym uniforms and other items usually borne by students are covered through charitable contributions.

Within the district for Bansunkong School, S. Village is located about fifteen minutes away on foot. The village currently has about 400 households and is an “extension village” to which members of the Akha tribe were relocated twenty years earlier as part of a project of the King. Beautiful flowers bloom in vivid colors set against a deep green and are the pride of the village which, at a glance, seems to be a tranquil place. However, if one continues walking, the paved road ends a short distance after the village entrance, a pile of young corn that has grown too big to bring to market has been left in front of a thatched roof house, and one can see villagers gathering water from a pipe beside the road. From a small thatched hut a boy with no shirt on rides happily astride a bicycle that is too big. This is a third-grader at Bansunkong School. The student has received an award for good grades and the bicycle was the prize he won. In his household is an older sister, a fifth-grader, who suffers from a learning disability. The parents do not have regular work and the school principal sometimes hires the father as a day laborer to do jobs at the school. In addition, although the village head did not say this clearly, a big issue in the village is that of drug addiction.

Even if the students are not members of hill tribes, their lives are certainly not easy within the district of this same school, there is a sixth-grade girl who commutes from a lowland area and dreams of becoming a singer. They say she lives with her parents, older sister, uncle and aunt, but her parents, uncle and aunt all have HIV/AIDS and she does not like to talk about her family. A girl in the same grade has a Thai father and a mother from the Akha tribe, and was born in an Akha village. She says she has never met her father. Before starting elementary school, she attended a
village daycare center in the mountain area, but she said she did not have good memories of that. Now she lives in a dorm where everything is free and goes to school with hill tribe children in the same way. She said that two of her younger sisters were temporarily in Chiang Rai, but even through the family was separated, she commuted to the school because their home was in the mountains.

**A Learning Process Involving Examining and Creating Society**

Out of a wish to enable children studying and living in this environment to actively engage with their immediate environment and the broader society and gain the capacity to participate in resolving their own problems, in October 2006 the Case Study Approach (CSA) Teaching-Learning Method was introduced on a school-wide basis under the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific Innovation Programme for ESD. In CSA, students are divided into groups and, by proceeding through seven steps, they become conscious of issues surrounding them, focus on the issues that are especially important, search for solutions, and implement the solutions, thereby completing a learning cycle.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Step</th>
<th>Content</th>
<th>Method</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Discover issues in nearby places (school and community)</td>
<td>Individual “mind mapping”; gathering data via questionnaire; comparison of past and present; expressing oneself through drawing and storytelling</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Narrow down priorities which are possible to address</td>
<td>Group work, field work, analysis of background surrounding the topic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Make a presentation to school or community</td>
<td>Presentation; receipt of feedback; revision</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Search for alternative solutions</td>
<td>Data gathering (field work, Internet, etc.)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Create an action plan</td>
<td>Learning methods of project design; if necessary, obtain funds</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Implement the plan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Measurement and evaluation</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CSA, which is based on these seven steps, can be said to be a teaching-learning method based on social constructivism. At the center of the method is a learning cycle in which students become engaged with their own situations and participate in group work focused on problem solving. In summary, by passing through these seven steps, students build their own knowledge and through work with other group members, teachers, and community members, apply this knowledge, investigate further, and reconstruct the knowledge. Rather than a simple transfer of knowledge from teacher to students, it is a process through which students create their own learning. Through these learning activities, they gain capacity to recognize and solve problems, creativity, and other higher-order thinking skills.

The performance of students in classes using CSA when it was partially implemented with funding from UNICEF and local NGOs was good. As a result, many teachers said they wanted students from those classes when classes were reorganized at the end of the year. In addition, based on the results of the experimental introduction of CSA and in order to promote a process in which teachers could learn from one another, the principal decided that CSA should be implemented school-wide as part of an innovation project. He altered the school timetable, held teacher training, and made other adjustments so that CSA was implemented solidly through a “whole school approach.”

Changes in the Children: “I believe I can help the village people.”

At Bansunkong School, the 1st-3rd graders looked at their own school environment and the 4th-6th graders at their local community, implementing CSA by proceeding through the seven steps. As the first step, groups of children were formed and each group brainstormed about the school surroundings and problems in the village. During this time, the
children created mind maps and adopted specific points of view while walking around the school and villages—using learning methods that would not be employed in the customary knowledge-based learning. Issues in the immediate school environment taken up by students in the lower grades included garbage strewn inside the school and toilet problems. Issues in the local community dealt with by the older students included preservation and development of Akha traditional culture, the water shortage in the village, garbage issues in the village, and the economic efficiency of village agriculture. After that, the students proposed plans to solve the problems, made presentations to school officials and villagers, adjusted their plans based on feedback they received, and made follow-up presentations. Then, based on the actual solutions they devised, they proceeded through the steps, developing action plans, implementing the plans, and evaluating them—completing a cycle of learning. This CSA is different than problem-based learning in which one is given the theme or case studies; it starts from students discovering a theme. Then, by having students share the themes they have discovered with the larger group after discussing them, joint ownership of the issue arises. The existence of this joint ownership may be the number one factor in raising children’s participation in their study.

Changes in children who have participated in a learning cycle based on social constructivism are clear to the principal and teachers involved with these students. First, in terms of knowledge, through the group work, students deepen self-understanding and advance in their understanding of various aspects of the school and villages. Particularly as students move to higher grades, they are losing their traditional Akha culture; however, through the learning process, their eyes turned to the economic pressure
and social changes that are causing this. In the same way, the group that dealt with agriculture in the village not only focused on the economics of agriculture but on things like the environmental effects of chemical fertilizer and medicines and became able to look at multiple facets of a single theme.

Further, what was noteworthy was that through moving through the steps the students gained many skills useful for problem solving. Through the group work, they learned teamwork and leadership; through analysis of the problem, they learned systems thinking, critical thinking and analytical thinking; through proposing solutions, they learned visionary and creative thinking; and through the presentation, they learned expression, presentation skills, planning skills and negotiation. Sixth graders who came into an Akha village and addressed the issue of trash began by creating internal rules for the group on their own. These included things like: “Don’t be noisy,” “Don’t walk around,” and “Don’t cause trouble for the villagers.” And, in order to satisfy the villagers, the group selected the most pressing problem in the village—that of garbage—to address. Because garbage trucks do not come to this village, garbage was strewn all over the village. The students set up a meeting with the villagers and, as a result of exchanging opinions, it was decided that each household should pay 20 baht and that the local government should be requested to come and pick up garbage. The students negotiated together with the villagers, and after the garbage truck came, students saw how clean the village looked and said: “It was very interesting and we were useful to the villagers, the village got clean, and I was happy,” and “We got the full cooperation of the villagers and I was truly happy. The villagers did not make one complaint [about paying the money].” The students’ comments were similar in the happiness they expressed.

This type of CSA puts the focus on discovering problems and solving them, but there was also an activity conducted in several classes in which
students described the ideal village they envisioned. This is not just an exercise in which students respond to a topic put down in front of them. They must work to contrast an ideal situation with present conditions, determining key issues and searching for solutions that will bring things close to the ideal. For example, if students are addressing the issue of garbage, they don’t only look at garbage. They look at the village holistically, and through that, they think about the positioning of the garbage issue within the village and develop an angle for solving the problem that harmonizes the whole. The skills of jointly envisioning an ideal village, expressing and presenting this in front of their classmates, and gaining an interest and grasp of current issues are important ones developed through CSA.

Also, if one looks the appearance of the students, it is clear that they have not only gained knowledge and skills, but confidence and self-respect, curiosity towards learning, an attitude of participating actively and, at the same time, the self-discipline and responsibility to act without the direction of a teacher. One female sixth-grader reflected: “Before this, I had not done these kinds of activities, so at first I didn’t know if I could accomplish the tasks. I had no confidence about whether the villagers would cooperate with me or not. However, now I have been helpful to the village, we addressed their issue, and I am truly happy. In the future, I think I can also be helpful to other people. If only the villagers would tell more problems to the students, I believe I can help them.

Observation of the activities of the students shows that even if they do not receive specific instructions from their teachers, they group together and naturally someone takes leadership and helps the discussion progress. In a short time, they create expressive presentation documents including not only text but graphics and present them in front of the entire class. These presentations are excellent, and include introductions of the members of the group and communication of the theme taken up by the group. Groups
not only read their presentation documents, but there was a even group who demonstrated their themes through skits. One teacher recalled the presentations in the following way. “Before introducing CSA, [hill tribe children and children born in Myanmar] almost did not speak at all. However, now they have become able to speak in front of the entire class. There are children who shake out of nervousness, but even so, they are able to speak in front of everyone. If you look at the children’s presentations, they have different thoughts than they had before and you can see that they have gained the ability to express their own thoughts.”

The students who participated in CSA at Bansunkong School naturally became leaders at the junior high schools to which they moved. “The effects of CSA sometimes don’t appear immediately. However, if one looks at the leadership and skills of the students who advanced to junior high school, one can see the effects clearly,” said one teacher. It seems that there is repeated communication about achievements of the school’s graduates such as students who did not stand out in their time at Bansunkong School but who are serving as leaders or are doing outstandingly at their new schools.

On the other hand, we were told that there are students who are unhappy that they cannot engage in the same kind of participatory learning that they experienced at Bansunkong School. Nonetheless, that children who were born and raised in conditions of poverty and discrimination, amidst the spread of drugs and HIV/AIDS in the difficult conditions of northern Thailand were able to gain these capacities is a great example of hope for children and adults in similar situations in other countries and regions. The students of Bansunkong school are beginning to master skills, knowledge and attitudes by thinking for themselves, viewing issues from multiple angles, raising issues, learning, moving towards the implementation of solutions, evaluating their work, and then working to improve the solutions. Within the severe social conditions of northern Thailand and a
Voices of Hope

social environment that at a glance seems unsustainable, children are forging paths forward for their own lives which is a precious foundation for improving their immediate surroundings and the broader society.

Communities of Practice

So, why have children’s knowledge, skills, attitudes and values changed so dramatically? One reason one can cite is that together with the introduction of CSA, teachers’ ways of interacting with students changed significantly. “When I first heard of CSA, it seemed very difficult. However, when I actually tried it, I learned that I didn’t have to teach children from start to finish; it was enough to watch over and support students’ activities.” As indicated in this teacher comment, there was a change from the attitude of “teaching” to “supporting learning.” A first-grade teacher noted that many of the students in the class were born in Myanmar and did not speak Thai well, so she used the first CSA step to walk around the school with students and ask “What’s this? What’s that?” in Thai, and start with them trying to use Thai words they knew that were related to their immediate surroundings. Then when they returned to their classrooms, the teachers said they encouraged the children’s learning of Thai little by little through group work with their classmates. The teachers also assisted in facilitating this group work. “In the group there were some students who were outstanding, and these students wanted to move forward on their own. However, I communicated that it was not the quality of the activity, but acting together that was important. I composed groups with students of different abilities and emphasized that it was not a competition between groups and that the important thing was conducting the activities together.”

In this way, these were not lessons to convey knowledge. They were lessons to support a learning process for students. What is clear from teacher comments is their trust in the students. “Students can learn
themselves about the issues they discovered. We teachers are only there to encourage students to be the centre of learning.”

Of course, these changes in the attitudes of the teachers did not occur overnight. The innovativeness of this project is that it did not center on CSA itself but on several communities of practice\(^2\) and self-reflection processes that arose from implementing CSA on a school-wide basis. First, there was the community of practice in which students themselves learned by proceeding through the seven steps and during each step, made discoveries and repeated the reflective processes, moving forward via trial and error. Then, a community of practice arose among the teachers of Bansunkong School to support this process. “If we teachers stopped understanding the CSA method, we would help one another. There were only two or three days of training, so we had to cooperate to help one another after that.” “At the first training, I did not understand the method very well. As we used it, I came to understand it little by little. When I didn’t understand, I asked other teachers to be able to do it.” In this way, teachers helped one another and by reviewing their own practice and through repeated reflection, the teachers also deepened their own learning. There were teachers who said that at first they had no confidence, but as they used the method, they gained confidence. And there were teachers who said that before they used CSA, they felt distant from hill tribe villages with different languages and customs, but through the project they went to an Akha village and came into contact with student families and were able to experience the actual environment in which these children were born and raised.

What supported the teachers’ learning from one another was the school administration beginning with the school principal. First, the principal,

\(^2\) Communities in which various social experiments have taken place, and in which the communities have gained knowledge and skills through participating in them. (Wenger, 1998.)
assistant principal and two well experienced teachers underwent training and introduced CSA as a pilot project on a limited basis in three classes. Looking at the results of the study using CSA, the principal felt that the activities would not be sustainable on such a limited basis and decided that a whole school approach was necessary. Further, he altered the school schedule to make it suited to CSA. The principal reflected in this way: “At first, there were people who opposed it. The teachers were probably not ready for it, and there were voices proposing that we shelve the idea. However, with only a portion of the teachers using the method, the principal thought that the other teachers would doubt what they were doing, and teachers were not able to have discussions together. That’s why I decided we needed a whole school approach.” The principal provided all the support he could think of to the teachers, from obtaining financial resources for the project to deepening teachers’ understanding. The principal himself participated in the training, and twice a year set up trainings both inside and outside the school. Together with the teachers, he learned from a guidebook, observed lessons, and provided advice as necessary. “First of all, more than anything, I was able to learn things myself, and then I was able to help the teachers learn. Whether a principal, teacher or student, it is important that everyone continue to learn at the same time. Further, as the principal, I worked hard to find a way to support the teachers and I tried to communicate that the only method of helping teachers solve their problems was having teachers talk with one another.” The principal continued: “Until we introduced CSA, teachers were used to a teacher-centered method which made them tense and they didn’t like. However, in classes where a child-centred approach like CSA was used, the teachers were no longer tense. The students were happily studying and growing. Every day I am walking around the school and observing these classes!”

One other stakeholder continuously supporting the school management beginning with the principal and assistant principal and the teachers
involved with CSA is the Office of the Basic Education Commission (OBEC), within the Ministry of Education of Thailand. OBEC, which has introduced CSA to several schools, realized that there were many teachers struggling with CSA and that CSA was not necessarily achieving the result of developing students’ critical thinking abilities. OBEC also felt that teachers depended on OBEC which made lesson plans for them to follow, and that teachers had the attitude of just following those plans if they were available. The OBEC manager thought that this was probably because up until that point, policies and systems were communicated to schools in a top-down way. Quickly, she revamped the next planned training and added a session to focus on helping teachers to develop students’ critical thinking abilities. The OBEC manager thought she could not continue to commute to Bansunkong School forever to support the project and aimed to cultivate an attitude where the teachers would support one another through communication and training. Thus, teachers also directly participated in CSA by being given the opportunity to consider the issues around them, think about them together with their colleagues, develop solutions, and try implementing the solutions. This process which the teachers undertook together with OBEC was a true learning experience for the teachers and, because they experienced it themselves, they were able to learn how to create a student-centred learning process. What made this possible was that OBEC discerned the situation of the teachers and provided appropriate input. One can consider OBEC itself to have a flexible process that has created a community of practice of self-learning, reflection and ongoing improvement.

As described, at the Bansunkong School, many communities of practice supporting the learning of students have arisen. As the principal stated, the students, teachers, principal and the Ministry of Education—all of the stakeholders—are all learning and spinning the process forward as if creating thread. It can be said that this is what is causing the above-mentioned dramatic changes in the children.
Children and the Future of Thai Society—Towards a Sustainable Future

The King of Thailand said that in order to sustain a balance in people's lives, society, the economy and the environment, self-reliance is necessary to support knowledge, critical thinking, and integrity. He defines self-reliance in a unique way, as including the need for self-immunity or protection, reasonableness, and moderation. This is truly the kind of sustainable society called for by ESD, and is also in complete alignment with the route ESD advocates for getting there through education.³

This is truly what ESD brings to mind as a method for creating a sustainable society, and one with which one can completely agree. At Bansunkong School, the students implemented CSA, including such things as discovering issues in their surroundings, constructing knowledge together with their peers and members of the community, critically assessing issues, and creating solutions. This process is one aid to the kind of self-efficacy in which students say: “I can solve problems” or “I can be helpful to my school and people in my community.” The students do not complete a curriculum of established educational content. They think for themselves, learn, and take autonomous actions. And, as a result, they gain self-efficacy, problem solving skills and the ability to depict and express an improved situation together. This was on a small scale, but the children who mastered it will be able to face larger issues in the society head on. For example, even if there is a complex situation, we can say that they will be on the starting line for being able to make improvements towards a sustainable future.

The case of Bansunkong School is only a small example within the broad global society, Asia and Thailand. However, specifically because the

³ UNDP, *Thailand Human Development Report, 2007*
people of Thailand have experienced their unique cultural flourishing and abundance continuously since ancient times, in order not to be caught in the “Satanic Mill (Polanyi, 2001.)” and suffer the strains in the shadow of rapid economic growth and in order to move toward the kind of human-oriented society that the people and the King have depicted one step at a time, the hints that this case provides are extremely big.

References

Polanyi, Karl. (2001) *The great transformation: the political and economic origins of our time*. Beacon Press,

Wenger, Etienne. (1998) *Communities of Practice: Learning, Meaning, and Identity*. Cambridge University Press,
## Project Profile: Thailand

### Participatory Learning Leading to Integrated Community Development; A Case Study Bansunkong school

**Organisation:**
Bureau for Innovative Development in Education (BIDE), The Office of the Basic Education Commission (OBEC), Ministry of Education

**Outline:**
This is a pilot project of learning reform within a whole-school approach. Teacher guidelines will be developed specifically for Bansunkong school and will be used in developing an integrated curriculum, as well as to promote child-centred teaching-learning methods by using the local community as a resource for learning.

**Project Site(s):**
- Bansunkog School

**Activities:**
- Conduct experiential learning, to develop critical thinking and problem solving of local issues
- Integrate the concept of ESD into classroom activities in every classroom
- Provide teacher training and in-depth advice
- Disseminate the school achievement to other schools in order to facilitate networking for further extension of ESD nationwide

**Number of Beneficiaries:**
- 25 teachers in Bansunkong School
- Approximately 650 students, representing five hill tribe villages, enrolled in Bansunkong School
- Approximately 2,000 community members

**Major Outputs/Outcomes:**
- “Seven-Step Approach” introduced in every classroom in Bansunkhong School
- Voluntary Cooperation among teachers increased
- Teachers gained confidence in how they cope with students
- Students empowered, with increased skills in concept mapping, fieldwork, collective decision making, critical thinking, presentation, etc
- Students ability to give presentation with confidence in Thai increased
- Students became aware of the local issues and was able to propose solutions to the community people
- Relationship between teachers (school) and community people strengthened
Vietnamese System of Education

Recent census estimates the population of Viet Nam at beyond 84 million. Vietnamese people, also called “Viet” or “Kinh”, account for 86.2% of the population who live on the deltas and coastal plains of the country. There are 54 ethnic groups throughout the country, many of whom are found in the highlands which cover two-thirds of the territory.

Viet Nam has an extensive state-controlled network of schools, colleges and universities but the number of privately-run and mixed public and private institutions is also growing. The educational system in Viet Nam consists of formal and non-formal education. National formal education is divided into preschool, general education and higher education. General education is divided into three levels: primary, lower secondary and upper secondary education. Vietnamese is the official language for all schools and educational institutions. Every course which is not provided in Vietnamese must be approved by the Prime Minister. In 2008, the total number of 27,900 schools have been established across cities, towns and villages in Viet Nam with the purpose of ensuring the right to education of

1 TVE Asia Pacific website: http://www.tveap.org
all children and improve the national literacy. There are a large number of specialist colleges, established to develop a diverse and skilled national workforce.

However, there are still unmet demands of formal education which has to be fully filled by the Non-Formal Education (NFE). NFE should therefore take place both within and outside educational institutions, and cater to persons of all ages. Depending on country contexts, it may cover educational programmes to impart adult literacy, basic education for out-of-school children, life-skills, work-skills, and general culture.

This is especially relevant in the case of ethnic minority groups. There is anyway a gap in ethnic minority children getting into mainstream education system partly due to their language barriers, as courses are being taught in Vietnamese. Therefore, not just mainstream education system but NFE is crucial for these groups. NFE programmes do not necessarily need to follow the ‘ladder’ system, and can have differing durations.

**Needs of an Early Intervention (EI) for Children with Disabilities (CwD)**

Vietnamese education has gained great achievements in recent years. Up to December 2007, 40 out of 64 provinces and cities have finished universalizing education at primary level at the right age and 40 out of 64 provinces and cities have finished universalizing education at secondary level.

The Vietnamese government also pays attention to education for children in difficult circumstances and differently-abled children. From 1986 to 2006, the amount of children with disabilities going to school increased from 3,000 to 300,000 children (an increase of 100 times). Some children
with disabilities go to secondary schools while others go to colleges and universities. However, according to the statistics from Viet Nam Institute of Educational Science (VNIES), this number was only 24% of the disabled children in the whole country in 2007. Often, these children are 2-4 years older than their classmates, sometimes even 10 years older. This goes to show that many disabled children still do not have the same educational access and opportunities as their peers and often do not start school at the right age.

There are a few identified reasons for this low level of school enrollments of children with disabilities. Lack of awareness among managers, local authorities, decision makers and communities; schools and teachers who are not ready to receive the children with disabilities; children with disabilities are not prepared with the necessary skills to attend mainstream schools; and lack of trained teachers are some of the reasons.

Early intervention in Viet Nam is still at experimental level for children with disabilities such as hearing, visual, mental, physical and/or multiple impairment. It is usually implemented in educational organisations/centers. Just a small number of students in developed cities benefit from the services already available. Many of the children, especially in remote and mountainous areas, cannot access these early intervention programmes. Often, the distance from their house to kindergarten is too far. Another contributing factor is that many of these families have low income and pay more attention on earning their livelihoods than on providing education to their children with disabilities.

Preschool children live with their families. It requires special knowledge and skills to look after a child with special needs. If parents are not equipped with such knowledge and skills, it results in the children entering schools 1-2 years later than their classmates. Therefore early intervention, focusing on the family, is very important to assist them to acquire such
skills as early as possible. This would help families improve necessary skills to make their children go to school at the right age.

The early intervention activities focus on helping the families believe and accept their child with special needs. The rationale behind this was to make the families recognize and accept the abilities of the children with disabilities and start building up their confidence levels in assisting the child with future hopes.

**Viet Nam Institute of Educational Science (VNIES) and Early Intervention (EI) Model**

Center for Education of Exceptional Children (CEEC) of Viet Nam Institute of Educational Science (VNIES) is the implementing organisation for the Early Intervention (EI) Model. CEEC has been established in 1973 and has an extensive experience in working with children with disabilities for over 30 years. Further they have over 10 years of experience in working on inclusive education. CEEC has 15 full time staff. VNIES and CEEC together involve mainly in carrying out scientific research in the field of special education for disadvantaged children and children of ethnic minority groups. In addition they provide advisory services to the government of Viet Nam in developing strategy and curriculum for special education.

VNIES has developed a model for EI for selected children in the Bac Quang district in Ha Giang province. Main objective of the EI model is to provide support and knowledge to the selected families to improve specific skills to assist children with disabilities to make them suitable to go to schools at the right age. This will ensure equal chance in education for all.

The main activities of the model include formulating a tool kit to measure
social skills of children to identify the children with special needs. In order to achieve this awareness programmes at different levels and different target groups have been organised. Teachers, parents, communities and schools were the target groups. Training programmes for parent in identifying the children with special needs and taking care of them have been organized. Teachers have been provided with special trainings on teaching methodologies for children with special needs. Further, combined workshops for parents and teachers have been organized to share the learning experiences. Finally it has been aimed at popularising the model in order to expand it into other geographical areas and higher levels of implementation such as other provinces and at national level.

The Strengths of EI Model in Bac Quang District

Most of the children with disabilities under six year old living in the remote and mountainous areas are still not going to schools. Parents and local authorities are not aware of the Viet Nam government’s policies on education and the economic and social benefits they can reap when their disabled children VNIES go to schools. The EI model has given ample opportunities for all the stakeholders in the project implemented areas to realise these factors.

The activities have enabled families to understand more clearly the needs and abilities of children with disabilities and the role of society in taking care of and educating them. These children have joined the EI model which has helped to improve the specific skills required to attend school at the right age. In the successfully implemented areas, the activities have mobilized the human resources of the community, schools and teachers. It has provided the background for socialising education in difficult areas and has contributed to developing the education systems for children with special needs, giving them meaningful recognition in society.
Further, the model has enabled the children with disabilities and their parents to get entry into the education system and to start a relationship with the education system and minimize dependence and to be integrated into the community. The family members can now better understand their child with disabilities and can provide the needed support for his/her development. Also the success of these stories has given the opportunity to share the experience among others in the community and indirectly strengthen the social bonds among community members. It has further created awareness among the community members to help each other to join the EI model and send their children to schools at the right age.

One of the very positive outcomes of the project observed during the HOPE evaluation mission is the strong link that has been established amongst the communes, families and the kindergartens in the project site. “I am happy when all my children in the classroom are healthy and without diseases” expressed by a kindergarten teacher when sharing her thoughts about the EI model. There are many obstacles and barriers for communes living in far mountainous areas for them to send their children
to schools due to geographical difficulties. The situation becomes even worse when the child has special needs.

**Ripple Effect of the EI Model**

Ms. Myrna Eijsenring (Advisor Special Education and Early Childhood) has been involved in the project right from the concept stage both as an advisor as well as a volunteer. It was quite interesting to listen to her experience in general as a teacher in special education for 35 years as well as in the Viet Nam IP project. “The best environment for a disabled child is an affectionate family” she explained. She looked at the project as an initiation and expressed it as a “stone in the pond” The model in Bac Quang is just one stone in the pond of EI model. You need to set up many stones, she expressed. She believed that the Center for Education of Exceptional Children (CEEC) is empowering society in their implementation activities. Training programmes and awareness given at many levels of society and utilising the capabilities of a new generation in project work were cited as good examples for the empowerment of project staff, families and teachers involved.

![Figure 1.5: Possible upscale of the project into many levels](image-url)
In answer to our question what is happiness for you, Ms. Eijsenring said “We need to create a better situation for everybody. I feel happy by doing this work for children”. As further improvements to the project, she suggested the inclusion of a medical care component for the children as well as providing some training aids for both teachers and disabled children.

During the HOPE evaluation mission, the team realised well that the “stone in the pond” has started making ripples. Given the financial scale of the project, it has thus far been implemented as a model and a pilot in selected areas. But it has already shown a lot of positive signs of replication into the next levels.

As mentioned earlier, one of the key strengths of the project is establishing the three strong pillars: family, kindergarten and commune in Bac Quang District. In the future, with continuous support from various agencies, all the grassroots activities by families, kindergartens and communes may find their impact beyond district and provincial levels, and even towards national level. Such a “ripple effect” of their project should be expected and shared with other IPs in the region.

But bringing the model into national level would definitely pose major challenges. To name a few encouraging parents to get more actively involved to create their own learning environment, encouraging peer education systems, awareness raising to accept disability and believe the ability of the child and bridging between pre-school and primary school levels. With these challenges, however, the evaluation team members still agree that their ‘early intervention’ projects through ‘home-based learning’ deserve a model for wider implementation. In collaboration with medical and child welfare sectors, the project would be established on a more stable and stronger footing, and the ‘ripple effect’ will be even more secured.
One of the staff members of CEEC, who expressed her thoughts with the mission, said, “I have found myself changed through the project. I have become friendly, smiling more. I think the project was a good change for me to understand and change myself in to who I am today.” As expressed in her joyful words, throughout the evaluation mission, it should be stressed that all the stakeholders, including project officers and the evaluation team members, had been ‘learners’ themselves and enjoyed being in the process of empowerment.

**The Strong Pillars of Success**

![Diagram showing ESD as Wholesome Development, Economy, Society, Environment, and Culture with a model for Home-Based Early Intervention (EI) for Children with Disabilities (CwD).]

During the HOPE evaluation mission in Viet Nam while meeting and interviewing different stakeholders of the project it was realised that the EI model has been built on three strong pillars: economy, society and environment. They are all interconnected and cannot be addressed in isolation as separate entities. This has been well understood and it has led to the success of the implementation of activities.
Many of the targeted beneficiaries belong to agriculture related income generating groups. Most of them also belonged to different ethnic minority groups and this fact had posed a major challenge in addressing their specific demands without disturbing their culture. The physical environment within which they live is quite challenging as far as the access and other infrastructure is concerned. But due to the fact that they are a part of that special mountainous environment, the activities needs to incorporate within their physical environment. The planning of activities has paid considerable attention to both the physical environment of the families as well as the child’s environment at home.

The ESD programme by Viet Nam Institute for Educational Sciences (VNIES), CEEC has strengthened the social linkages between and among the people. There was enough evidence for that in the feedback shared by the beneficiaries. “For ten years we didn’t have a child so we adopted a child. After one month we found that she has a disability but she was already our child so we never thought to give her up. Now everybody helps us and we feel strong” This is one of the feelings expressed by a mother from Kim Ngoc commune. They were in quite high spirits about the progress of their child and were hopeful for a better future for the child.

Awareness programmes conducted at many levels targeting different stakeholders has enabled the direct and indirect beneficiaries to have a more open mindset about the importance of educating a disabled child. ESD programme by VNIES, CEEC has indirectly helped the beneficiaries to meet the economic needs of the families. “My boy now goes to kindergarten. My husband takes him to kindergarten so he has more time to work in the orange garden.” This was expressed by one of the mothers from Kim Ngoc commune.
Empowerment of Stakeholders

The EI model by CEEC has enabled the empowering of different stakeholders at different levels.

Ms. Nguyen Thu Hien (Project Coordinator, CEEC) while sharing her most impressive experiences of being involved in the project said that among them were the realization that there were challenges that local people face which the project officers never imagined, difficulties in the area, and the support, willingness and passion of local authority officers towards the success of the project.

“I feel I have gained more confidence in facing any challenging situation, become more passionate being involved in these activities. Our work is not just working with children with disabilities. But we also work with their families, communes, and kindergartens. We support them in awareness raising and improving life skills and harness positive mental attitudes towards life. We assist them to create a sustainable future for them and for their children. I feel very happy about this” Ms. Hien expressed.

As a suggestion to further improves the IP activities she suggested strengthening and networking between and among other Asian countries to share these experiences and to learn from each others.

Dr. Nguyen Duc Minh (Vice Director of CEEC) the key player leading his dedicated team shared his experiences and thoughts. Answering our question of the most significant experience of the project he explained; “the two years is not enough for a project of this scale”. But he is happy about the fact that the project has now built the necessary network to work in future between and among the teachers, parents, medical team, project staff and other relevant local authorities. Based on this strong network he
suggested expanding this model into further levels into other districts, provinces and even up to national level.

“Happiness for me is my own children and family doing well. Secondly, the children of Viet Nam do well in their lives” he said. He was such an exemplary leader for CEEC and believed strongly in his project staff and their capacity, capabilities, commitments and professional way of delivering tasks independently. These have led to the success of the project immensely. The activities and tasks entrusted to each individual has made them strong and helped them to believe in themselves. In turn the activities at ground level with grassroots communities have made teachers, parents and communes empowered in their participation of ESD activities in the EI model.

**EI Model and Sustainable Communities in Bac Quang**

Activities of the EI model have some essential characteristics of the ESD. They are locally relevant and culturally appropriate, deals with all three realms of the sustainability – environment, society and economy. The activities engage formal, non-formal and informal education, build civil capacity for community based decision making, social tolerance and quality of life.

Activities which engage communities at many levels in their awareness raising as well and improving the attitude towards children with disabilities, accepting them as a part of the society and improving various different life skills have enabled empowering the communities. Such empowered communities will involve and engage in more participatory decision making and act based on local needs, perceptions and conditions. The EI model has further strengthened the social bonds between and among the families, kindergartens and communes. Early intervention in
Bac Quang therefore, is not just for the children with disabilities but also for their families and the communes at large. They have positive hopes for their children doing well and have a sustainable future.

References


Year 1 Mid Report: Viet Nam (Unpublished)

Year 1 Final Report: Viet Nam (Unpublished)

Year 2 Mid Report: Viet Nam (Unpublished)

Ministry of Education and Training of Viet Nam: http://moet.gov.vn/?page=11.2

Law of Education 2005: Viet Nam

An interview at a house of a child with disabilities
Developing a Model for Home-Based E.I. for Children with Disabilities

Organisation:
Center for Education of Exceptional Children (CEEC) – Vietnam Institute for Educational Sciences (VNIES)

Outline:
The number of disabled children attending school is very low in Viet Nam. One of the reasons is that they lack specific skills to access education. Thus, early intervention is vital for their education and life. Through guiding families with necessary knowledge, the project aims to help disabled children to go to school at the right age, ensure equal chance in education for all, and to make them part of collective efforts in sustainable development.

Project Site(s):
- Bac Quang district, Ha Giang province

Activities:
- A workshop on reporting survey’s results
- Training course on EI for pre-school teachers who are teaching CwD
- Direct skills guidance at home
- Meetings among project’s beneficiaries and participants
- Training on EI for CwD’s parents
- Self-evaluation survey

Number of Beneficiaries:
- 142 children with disabilities (Under 7 years old, disabled and/or ethnice in Bac Quang district, Ha Giang province)
- Nearly 200 parents (Parents of children with disabilities in Bac Quang district, Ha Giang province)
- 120 preschool teachers (Teachers of children with disabilities in Bac Quang district, Ha Giang province)
- 30 educational managers
- About 30 social and/or medical staffs

Major Outputs/Outcomes:
- 142 CwD have been early intervened and had his/her own individual plan to learn and develop.
- 142 families of CwD have been provided with basic knowledge and guided directly specific skills of EI for their children.
- Over 150 preschool teachers and educational managers have been trained on EI for CwD.
- All agencies that related to CwD such as Health agencies, Labour, Invalid and Society agencies, Bureau of Education and Training…etc have involved in EI and education for children with disadvantages.
Since the start of the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development, the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme has probably been the largest-scale program focused on ESD implemented in a single region. The total number of learners, just including those who were the subjects of the evaluation survey, exceeds 1,000. 1,005 people from eight countries responded to the evaluation survey questionnaire and 390 people from seven countries participated in the interview survey. When one gets to this kind of scale, evaluation is customarily conducted using quantitative indicators. However, the ACCU evaluation team employed a qualitative approach in addition to a quantitative approach. The preceding chapters depict the outcome of the field study, the voices of happiness and sadness of each one of the learners we met—“Tales of Hope.”

In the last chapter of Part I, I would like to use the HOPE Evaluation Method (for details, refer to Part II) implemented in the various countries as well as the mid-term and final reports prepared by the implementing partners for each project to summarize what has been achieved through this programme. Finally, I will discuss higher-order thinking skills, which the HOPE Evaluation has made clear are a key issue for ESD in the latter half of the Decade. I will discuss this point in the first chapter of Part II which follows.
What Was Accomplished

1) Encouraging values that contribute to sustainability

Even though projects were implemented with differing degrees of consciousness about ESD, one can say that every project reflected understanding of the ESD International Implementation Scheme’s expression that achievement of the goals of ESD and of the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development require not only changes in knowledge, but changes in values, behaviour and lifestyles. At minimum, most of the projects aimed at developing attitudes and values not emphasized in traditional school education, such as recognizing the limited nature of the earth’s resources. For example, China reported: “The student’s ESD consciousness and skills have been greatly improved.”

Furthermore, in Mongolia, issues such as garbage were addressed not simply in terms of knowledge. Teachers were conscious of the importance of changing attitudes, and implementation within classrooms was confirmed through site visits.

2) Promoting communication among diverse stakeholders

There are cases in which ESD is implemented as policy by government at the national or local level. There are also cases in which it is implemented by grassroots NGOs that are intimately linked with communities. In the Asia/Pacific region, it is rare for upper and lower streams of society to mix and work organically to make the society as a whole sustainable. However, in each country’s project there seemed to be some new beginnings and potential turning points on the horizon. For example, in Viet Nam and Palau, the project implementation, and particularly the evaluation process, became an occasion for the government officials assigned responsibility for the project to learn the

---

1 Year-2 Final Report: China, p. 35. Incidentally, according to China’s self-analysis, among knowledge, skills and attitudes, the project’s greatest results were in the area of attitudes. (Ibid., p. 32).

(Mid-Report/Final Report cited in this chapter are all unpublished documents)
significance of the existence of ESD.\textsuperscript{2} In Bhutan, the linkages between national level partners at the Ministry of Education and Ministry of Agriculture, district level education and agriculture officials, and extension workers and non-formal education instructors at village level became close, and the project was implemented making good use of the expertise at each of these levels. The Viet Nam, Mongolia, Palau and Bhutan projects demonstrate that ESD gathers diverse stakeholders together to solve problems, thereby providing opportunities for co-operation.\textsuperscript{3}

3) Social bonds

It is interesting that most of the organizations implementing ESD projects mention that they are deepening social bonds and the feeling of connectedness. In Bhutan, project leaders said that the project helped to develop mutually co-operative relationships at the local level and bring about a better atmosphere.\textsuperscript{4} China and Mongolia reported that care for others increased.\textsuperscript{5} In some cases, the process of addressing environmental problems and other issues makes the importance of social communication more evident. As stated in a quote from a project manager presented in Bhutan’s final report, an outcome of the project work was that he enjoyed working together for a common cause.”\textsuperscript{6}

4) Coexistence with nature

Indonesia was the only country implementing an ESD project focused on disaster preparedness education. Indonesia’s final report included a

\textsuperscript{2} Viet Nam’s final report cited “internal effects” brought about by the project in the area of “Linkage among people and people, people and official functional bodies was improved.” (Year-2 Final Report: Vietnam, p.5).


\textsuperscript{4} Year-2 Final Report: Bhutan, p. 3.

\textsuperscript{5} Concerning China, see Year-2 Final Report: China, p. 12. For Mongolia, this comment was obtained during the field study.

\textsuperscript{6} Year-2 Final Report: Bhutan, p. 11.
quote from a villager that “I am more caring about the earth and natural resources.” Efforts in the Indonesia project to focus not only on co-existence with the friendly aspect of nature but the threatening aspect have great significance. Nepal and Bhutan, on the other hand, are implementing sustainable agriculture to prevent communities from falling into destructive development practices as a means of addressing the long-term theme of poverty reduction among marginalised peoples.

5) Participatory learning

It was not the case with all projects, but in some projects, participatory learning yielded wonderful fruit. The model example of this was in Malaysia where ethnic minorities compiled stories they created about their own woods and resources into a children’s story books, which were then published. Also, in Thailand, traditional lessons were replaced with a participatory curriculum called the 7 Steps Approach, which produced many results. Children from mountain tribes analyzed the situations of their own villages, talked to one another about the problems, put forward plans for solving the problems, and moved forward on enactment of the plans. The introduction of this participatory approach in which children participated actively in their own learning contributed greatly to cultivating students’ knowledge, attitudes, skills and values. Similarly, in Bhutan, the site visit revealed that farmers who had been passive towards agricultural development in the past came to serve as change agents moving their own community in a more sustainable direction. This was recognized by the farmers themselves, ESD project officers, and education ministry officials.

6) The educational multiplier effect

Interestingly, changes in values and other changes were seen in people besides the learners in the ESD program. The project director learns together with the project participants and, in some cases, may learn

---

more and change more than the targeted learners. The director of the Viet Nam project said that as a result of having more opportunities to come into contact with villagers since she became responsible for the project: “I have become friendlier, I smile more. I think it’s a good change for me.” In addition, in Mongolia and other places, the students who learned ESD enlightened their parents in their own homes about the importance of health and the environment, a phenomenon that was seen in other countries in which people other than the direct beneficiaries were influenced through an educational multiplier effect.

7) **Reintegration**

ESD can catalyze the integration of things which have been divided or compartmentalized through the process of modernization. In Palau, vocational education traditionally offers weaker content than basic subjects such as math and science and is separated from intellectual training. However, as a result of a vocational education project being positioned as an ESD project, a more holistic learning programme was implemented balancing the intellectual, emotional and physical. Similarly, there is a tendency to entrust the education of children with disabilities to specialized facilities or classrooms. However, in Viet Nam inclusive education is being tried as an ESD project. One can see the results of the Viet Nam and Uzbekistan projects focused on children with disabilities in their capacity to successfully influence government at the national level. However, as seen in the example of Viet Nam, issues remain concerning the lack of integration between the medical field and education.

---

8 For example, Year-2 Final Report: Mongolia, p. 6.
9 Interview during field study (Hanoi, Vietnam, 9/16/2008).
10 For example, Year-2 Final Report: Mongolia, p. 7.
11 In Viet Nam this was confirmed through the field study. For Uzbekistan, refer to Year-2 Final Report: Uzbekistan, p. 7.
8) **Diffusion of a systems approach**

It is fair to emphasize that implementing the ESD programme has, in some cases, catalyzed a gradual change from a way of thinking in which the hints for resolving a problem in a particular realm can only be found in that realm to a “systems theory” approach which recognizes diverse factors in the background of the problem. For example, in China EPD evolved from the customary focus on environment and population to a more comprehensive concept of ESD.\(^\text{12}\) Additionally, in Mongolia, through seminars and other occasions, environment, society and the economy, the “three pillars,” were communicated to ordinary teachers and others. That the teachers were implementing their lessons while being conscious of these pillars became clear through the site visit.\(^\text{13}\) A report from China also stated: “The ACCU ESD project helps foster the students’ broad vision of the society, nature and the environment, and a high sense of responsibility and the care for others,” and “This is the essence of education.”\(^\text{14}\) However, a challenge covered in more detail later in the chapter is that this kind of result was seen only in a small portion of the countries.

9) **Acquisition of higher-order thinking skills**

Through the ESD projects, people living in farming villages are learning ways of thinking that are useful for planning and attaining independence. There is great significance in villagers viewing multiple facets and aspects of the problems they face in their daily lives rather than focusing only on a single dimension. By participating in making decisions and becoming accustomed to critical thinking and reflection, farmers in Bhutan, for example, became conscious of planning and

---

\(^{12}\) Refer to Cover Sheet for Year-2 Final Report: China, p. 11, p. 22.

\(^{13}\) For the voice of a learner who has acquired the same “systems” view, refer to Cover Sheet for Year-2 Final Report: Mongolia, p. 10.

\(^{14}\) This was the thought of the principal of an economically underprivileged secondary school principal. Year-2 Final Report: China, p. 12.
clarifying priorities. Project leaders commented that by acquiring the habit of dealing with problems from multiple dimensions, villagers become able to examine other problems in their daily lives along multiple dimensions. This capacity of villagers to analyze their situation (“situational analysis”) can be called a success for an ESD project.

During our site visits, we realized that this positive result could be seen in other countries besides Bhutan. Whether or not the learners were conscious of using “higher-order thinking skills,” it was clear that they acquired problem-solving ability and creative thinking skills and, as a result, were able to transcend the limited sphere of the “here and now” along the dimensions of both time and space. That they were driven towards care for future generations and for the planet can be discerned from the questionnaire-based survey. (See. pp.129-135)

Challenges for the Future

The following issues can be mentioned as common to a certain extent across the programme as a whole.

1) Regional Gaps

In many countries, the gap between regions is significant. For example, in China the ESD project was implemented at 26 elementary and junior high schools. We realized that, among these, the principals and teachers at the 16 schools on the outskirts of Beijing who were blessed with training opportunities demonstrated much better results in knowledge, skills and attitudes. A society with these kinds of gaps is not a

---


16 The only country that incorporated this kind of consciousness in the implementation of their project was Thailand.

17 Year-2 Final Report: China, p. 34.
sustainable society, and improvement is required since “society” is one of the three pillars of ESD.

2) **Deepening of Consciousness about Future Generations**
One can say that through ESD, a seed of consciousness concerning care for future generations has sprouted in many countries. The radar charts in this report indicate that some projects promote a vision of ESD that transcends generations. In Indonesia, for example, there is consciousness at the level of the implementing organization that not only the present generation but future generations should inherit the same or better quality of life (QOL), and that one needs to rethink the present way of life in order to achieve this.¹⁸ Further deepening of consciousness about future generations might be done through rethinking the mythology of ever-increasing economic growth, an important issue especially for Asian countries which have experienced rapid economic growth.

3) **Balance Among Environment, Society, Economy, Culture**
The radar charts (Figure3.1~3.24) show each project emphasises the three pillars of ESD—environment, society and the economy, that they are balanced successfully in only a small portion of countries¹⁹. As pointed out admirably in the final report from Mongolia,²⁰ ESD still has a tendency to be used in the same sense as environmental education. Pillars other than the environment must be incorporated in a balanced way and treated with the same importance as the environment. In particular, few countries emphasize the economy. On the midterm and final report forms, we asked the extent to which each of the three pillars of environment, society and the economy (and also “culture,” which serves as the underlying foundation) are emphasized in each project.

¹⁹ See. ANNEX2
²⁰ Year-2 Final Report: Mongolia, p. 11.
The results are expressed in Table 7, in which the average of self-evaluations for each country on a five-point scale are indicated. As is clear from the chart, realizing a sustainable economy as defined by ESD is essential, but the amount of effort to do this is insufficient. As pointed out aptly in the report of Palau which faces large and rapid changes in society owing to large-scale infusions of capital with the goal of tourism development, “strong moral principles” and “a sustainable economic system” are needed, which is a common issue with other countries.

4) Emphasis on the cultural dimension

From Table 1.2, one can also point to the importance of the cultural dimension. At the point of submission of the midterm report, culture was not emphasized very much, but we can see that the emphasis had been increased by the time of the final report. This is not noted on the chart, but Mongolia was the country with the most noteworthy increase in consciousness concerning culture. At the stage of the midterm report submission, it was the lowest at “1” on the scale, but at the stage of the final report, it was the highest at “5.” One can surmise that this is due to the importance of culture being recognized through the process of implementing the project, and that at the end of the project a high consciousness was generated as a result of producing educational materials designed to “breathe” Mongolia’s traditional culture into modern society. This kind of example should be welcomed, but it is certainly not enough and represents one of the challenges remaining for the latter half of the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table 1.2 : Level of Emphasis of the Various Areas of ESD</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Midterm Report Submission</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Society</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Environment</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Culture</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Note: Average value for each country’s self-evaluation on a five-point scale
Part II

DESD and beyond
“ESD is Hope”

From 31 March to 2 April 2009, The UNESCO World Conference on Education for Sustainable Development was held in Bonn, Germany, and this simple sentence was the “catch phrase” lifted up on the cover of a pamphlet distributed there. The conference was organized by UNESCO and the German Federal Ministry of Education and Research, in cooperation with the German Commission for UNESCO, and had the goal of reflection at the midpoint of the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development and consideration of prospects for the future. At the gathering, approximately 900 participants from about 150 countries, including ministers and deputy ministers, engaged in discussions for several consecutive days.
The pamphlet included a graph of hope among the people of eight countries involved in the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific Innovation Programme for ESD (IP). From this graph, which depicts the change in hope among the people in each country over several years, one can see that hope of the project participants in these countries of Asia and the Pacific increased each year. The data piques our interest when juxtaposed with the global financial crisis that has caused the lives of people across the world to descend into poverty and economic growth to decline. I will provide details later, but here I would just like to express that ESD is deeply connected to creating hope for people. Further, this “catch phrase” was developed based on the understanding that a society in which people have hope builds a foundation for a sustainable future.

In the main part of this paper I will discuss the background behind the establishment of “hope” as one of the indicators for ESD. I will also urge the understanding of the essence of ESD. Although ESD has been interpreted in various ways, I would like to begin by offering ideas on what is unique about ESD.

**The Essence of ESD**

Now, as the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development has approached its midpoint, ESD has gradually become known. However, it is rare for a word to have as varied interpretations as ESD. There are times when ESD is said to be a concept with multiple meanings and when it is said to be vague. Because it is such a comprehensive concept, it is easy to cite as a reason for action. However, others point out that by being many things to many people, the meat of the concept is hard to grasp.

Often we hear criticism that ESD is no different than environmental education. It is true that ESD tends to be viewed as focusing on issues
such as global warming and on measures to address and prevent environmental problems. If one considers that the main causes of unsustainability are environmental problems, this view of ESD is natural. However, following this line of thinking ends up considering ESD the same as ordinary environmental education, and it is hard to see the significance of creating and launching a decade for international work merely under the new name.

In response to this view equating ESD with environmental education, constructive criticisms have been raised. One of these views asserts that ESD is more than environmental education, and that it is “EE +DE”—Environmental Education + Development Education (for example, Bourne, 2005). As expressed in Figure 2.1, UNESCO, the lead agency for ESD, also emphasizes that ESD does not only concern the environment, but also society and the economy. Further, culture is posited as the important foundational element for these.

Figure 2.1: Education for Sustainable Development
Source: http://www.unescobkk.org/education/esd/about-esd/idea-of-esd/
So, is the special characteristic of ESD that it focuses not only on environment but also on the social and economic realms? This writer does not believe so. Even in some of the actual practices of ordinary environmental education, one can say that societal aspects are emphasized as well as ecological aspects (for example, in the 1997 Thessaloniki Declaration).

Is the special characteristic of ESD then that in contrast to EFA ("Education for All"), it places more emphasis on raising the quality of education rather than on quantitative expansion of educational opportunities? This does not hit the target with a fundamental difference either. It is true that even the name "Education for All" represents a clear numerical challenge within the field of basic education. However, the qualitative aspect of the education has been emphasized from the time of the World Declaration on Education for All. Further, since concrete goals for EFA were re-established under the Dakar Framework for Action, it seems that qualitative goals have actually been emphasized more than before.

So, is ESD a frivolous concept devoid of uniqueness? No, that is not the case. The writer thinks that if one questions at a more fundamental level than has been done above, the uniqueness will come into relief. Here I would like to recall the background behind the birth of ESD. It is accurate to say that ESD arose from a strong sense of crisis concerning environmental and other issues related to the earth’s unsustainability. To create a sustainable future, education, which is important in the formation of “values, behaviour and lifestyles,” holds the key, and there was a movement to rethink the mode of education that was conspiring to support this unsustainable society. In other words, the essence of ESD is radical and can be found in a shift towards a fundamental re-orienting of education itself in the direction of a sustainable future. Said another way, ESD is a concept that calls for a “paradigm shift.” In comparison with
EFA, ESD represents a more contentious concept (Wand and Parker, 2008: 6).

As mentioned earlier, the special characteristic of ESD that has been emphasized previously is its inclusion not only of the environmental sphere, but of social and economic spheres in its field of view. As a result of this emphasis, it seems that ESD’s uniqueness in comparison with ordinary environmental education has been settled. It is true that the importance of this balanced view has been pointed out and has become widely known particularly since the first year of the United Nations Decade on Education for Sustainable Development. However, in this paper, I would like to emphasize that ESD is a more radical concept which pushes for a re-orientation of existing modes of education itself.

**Re-Orienting Education**

Above I mentioned that ESD is a radical concept. However, it is not a concept that requires destruction of the foundation of the existing system and re-construction of a new system. Rather, though mending the current system, ESD can perform a magical function of bringing the system back to life. This fundamental character of ESD is expressed continually in various international documents pertaining to ESD through use of the expression “re-orientation.”

There has been consciousness of this “re-orientation” from the time of ESD’s debut. In *Agenda 21*, which was ratified at the Global Summit in 1992 in Rio de Janeiro, an action plan was established to achieve a balance between environmental conservation and development, and the importance of education is stated in Chapter 36 as “Promoting Education, Public Awareness and Training.” This was the moment ESD appeared on the international stage. Together with the focus on reforming basic education; increasing public awareness; and promoting training to
corporations, industry, government and all social sectors, the main area for ESD’s efforts was clarified in that chapter as “Reorienting education towards sustainable development.”

So, to what direction should education be corrected? This direction was made clearer in the International Implementation Scheme (IIS) which establishes indicators for the promotion of ESD in many countries. In the IIS, “reorienting existing education programmes” is lifted up as a heading, and the aim is for transformation of values, behaviour and lifestyles that will lead to positive changes in the direction of sustainable development.

Experiments to re-orient education to reflect sustainability have taken place before the birth of ESD (for example, Orr, 1994; Sterling, 2001). Table ? represents this kind of comparison of conventional modes of education and more sustainable, or holistic, modes of education. It was developed by the Japan Holistic Education Society, a thought leader in this ecological trend in education, within which it is now promoting ESD.

---

1 For details, see the Agenda 21 official English version: http://www.un-documents.net/a21-36.htm
### Table 2.1 Comprehensive Holistic Education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Conventional School Education</th>
<th>Points of Emphasis in Holistic Education</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Basic Views on Education</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Distinction between subject (teachers) and object (learners)</td>
<td>Connections that arise during learning, premise of establishment of a space where such connections can occur</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>One-way, linear educational relationship from teachers to students</td>
<td>Relationship between teachers and students that is circular, mutual and helps everyone to develop</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reduction to such functions as the economic and political</td>
<td>Participates in the evolution and flow of life in the whole universe</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Process of building knowledge and skills internal to learners</td>
<td>Process of change in varied relationships between self and the world</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Standardization, homogenization, uniformity</td>
<td>Individuality, uniqueness, diversity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Views on Learners</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Logical intelligence is the basic function; separation of mind and body</td>
<td>Synthetic understanding of knowledge, emotion and will; mind and body; conscious/unconscious</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Human resources, the educated as objects to be manipulated</td>
<td>The whole person, partners with responsibility for responding to a person’s whole personality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Independent individuals, self-sufficiency</td>
<td>Individuals in the midst of relationships, self-support through interdependence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unlimited, general possibilities</td>
<td>Unique, individual capabilities</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>External motivation, necessity of control</td>
<td>Internal motivation, inherent spirit of voluntary action</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Educational Content/Learning Method</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Understanding of the elements of academic ability</td>
<td>Understanding of academic ability as a whole</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Facts, general principles, emphasis on explicit knowledge</td>
<td>Spirituality, meaning, values, implicit knowledge, emphasis on awakening</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Separation of content areas into subjects, fragmentation</td>
<td>Synthetic studies, integration of subjects through experiential learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning centered around intellectual work</td>
<td>Multifaceted approach involving intuition, body, image, etc.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Principle of competition</td>
<td>Mutual dependence, mutual assistance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Emphasis on efficiency, emphasis on results</td>
<td>Emphasis on process</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fixed schedule, division of time, planning</td>
<td>Encounters, flexibility, fluidity, discontinuity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unified standards and learning methods</td>
<td>Pluralistic standards and diverse forms of learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Objective evaluation, measurement, quantitative description</td>
<td>Subjective evaluation, descriptions in poetry and prose</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Majority opinion, regard for the ordinary and “central” student</td>
<td>Minority opinion, regard for the unique and peripheral student</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
It would be accurate to say that the direction for re-orientation is expressed in Table 2.1. ESD’s vision is expressed in the points of emphasis in holistic education rather than conventional school education.

Also, the educational vision of ESD is greatly influenced by systems theory (for example, refer to Wals, 2007). In other words, in the background is consciousness of problems with the dualism of Descartes, which divides the spiritual and material worlds, as well as Newton’s mechanical determinism. In the process of modernization, we have moved from division into specialties and fragmented thinking to systems thinking, from a mechanical worldview to an ecological worldview, from top-down to bottom-up, from competition to cooperation, and from citizenship focused on obedience to citizenship focused on carrying the responsibility for social change. When looking at the theory of ESD and ESD practices being implemented, one can see this kind of vision for laying the foundation for a sustainable society.

One can correctly say that the above vision of ESD gives us the opportunity for a fundamental re-orientation by examining whether curriculum, teacher training, school construction, campus design, meals, school management, and relationships between teachers and students—all
the aspects that make up education—are sustainable.

In this kind of reform of all educational activities, naturally systemic reform is demanded. Further, this change needs to be based on a holistic and global perspective aligned with a more sustainable society. Therefore, one cannot just reform curriculum by establishing an ESD or environment subject area and teach about sustainability just in that area. One must take an “infusion” approach in which one is conscious of the issue of sustainability as one teaches in all school subjects (OREAL/UNESCO Santiago, 2008: Chapter 3). In addition, one should not stop at learning within school classes. One must reflect the spirit of ESD in all educational activities, including after-school and out-of-school-time activities, and by adopting a “whole school approach” to school management.

If one thinks about this emphasis on wholeness both in the context of ESD and particularly for the United Nations Decade on Education for Sustainable Development, evaluation is an important issue. Evaluation is apt to be based on a framework of rationalism and mainstream methods of analysis, and in the educational field the “conventional school education” described in Table 2.1 exerts a strong influence. If one takes an experimental approach with ESD, one cannot deny that at the stage of evaluation, there is still danger of being pulled towards “ordinary education.”

A Sustainable Society and Hope as Seen Through HOPE Evaluation

Evaluation of sustainable development and of ESD naturally differs. The former employs many objective, numerical indicators. In contrast, the latter, which deals with the conduct of education, has to be more qualitative in nature. This is said to make developing indicators difficult. In particular, because qualitative changes and changes in values are
important to ESD, one must take a serious approach to the issue of determining the indicators to use.

As stated earlier, if ESD aims to shift the educational paradigm, the evaluation methods must also aim to change the usual perspective. Generally, recent ESD evaluation has emphasized the logical framework. One therefore worries that most of the reality of the lives that people are creating is being lost at the evaluation stage because it cannot be logically divided into parts, and that one is losing the kind of “qualitative feeling” of the projects that is depicted in Part I of the volume—the kind of reality that one can feel or breathe.

HOPE Evaluation was proposed as a way lending importance to the “qualitative feeling” of ESD projects. The evaluation method is described in the following chapter, but it is an acronym for “Holistic, Participatory, and Empowering.” As this name expresses, in terms of creating a project, one emphasizes a holistic process, and promotes the active participation of various project stakeholders—particularly learners. Furthermore, participation in the evaluation process itself aims at empowering project participants. It is accurate to say that this weaves in the points emphasized in holistic education, as expressed in Table 2.1.

Another special characteristic of HOPE Evaluation is that “hope” has been established as one of the key indicators. I would like to refer again here to the graph I touched upon at the beginning of the paper. In Figure 7, eight rising lines are drawn. On this “Hope Timeline” the degree of hope felt by learners at four different stages is indicated—in other words, five years before the project began, at the launch, at present (at the time of the evaluation in 2008), and five years ahead. The graph shows how the degree of hope changed over time using a scale from “absolutely no hope” at 1 and “have a great deal of hope” at 5.
As one can see if one looks at the Figure 2.2, in all of the countries hope is increasing. This is probably the natural result of introducing a project. However, if one considers that the majority of project beneficiaries are families with members with disabilities, school drop-outs, members of minority ethnic groups, and others who are in the poorer classes and lack educational opportunities, the meaning of their hope increasing is significant. As I will mention later, hope is an important indicator not only for individuals but in terms of a whole society’s sustainability; one can say based on the graph that the hope of each community has increased.

Hope was established as an indicator in ESD evaluation as a result of discussion among experts at the 2008 “ACCU Workshop on Evaluation Approaches from ESD Perspectives in Asia and the Pacific” held in Tokyo and Miyagi Prefecture, Japan, as a component of the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific Innovation Programme for ESD (IP). The introduction of the Hope Timeline was an idea that came up suddenly in discussion, but in the
background to it the following type of thinking was probably operating.

Recently, in Japan, a “hope gap” has arisen and gained attention as an urgent social problem. Particularly since the 1990s and the permeation of the global economy, there is no longer a guarantee that each individual’s effort will result in promotion. The number of young people who are not currently engaged in employment, education or training (“NEETs”), who are underemployed (“freeters”), or who experience other uncertain situations has gained attention as an urgent social problem. Nowadays, the economic gap among young people has become visible in gaps in job types and lifestyles. The gap in lifestyles has affected young people’s mental condition, and the gap between youth who have hope and who do not have hope—in other words, a “hope gap,” is becoming apparent. This kind of trend is not only occurring in Japan, but in the U.S. and other advanced nations, and one can say that it can be seen in newly emerging and developing countries as the wave of the global economy forcibly advances.

In the midst of these global conditions, there are probably many people starting to feel strongly that without hope, it might be difficult to create a sustainable society. Societies that do not have hope or in which many people have fallen into an abyss of despair have suicide and crime, and many people lack concern for others. They can be said to be societies that are unsustainable. What is important for a sustainable society is whether the society is a community that can enable its members to have hope. The direction of “re-orientation” emphasized in ESD can also be said to be the direction in which hope can arise. Based on this kind of thinking, hope was established as one of the indicators for HOPE Evaluation.

As quoted in the articles of Part I, we were able to listen to the voices of many villagers who spoke of the increase of their degree of hope during the site visits. In Bhutan, all of the various stakeholders shared the
understanding that the villagers themselves would solve their problems. The staff member of the Ministry of Agriculture involved with the project said: “We view the learners as change agents,” and the project leader believed in the inherent abilities of the villagers. As a result, many of the villagers mastered skills in decision-making and became able to deal themselves in solving daily problems they faced. A non-formal education facilitator said: “Through this project, they became good decision-makers. This influence will likely spread to the next generation.” Also, a female villager herself said: “Before going to the literacy class, my life was like that of a cow. Now I have confidence.”

In the village in Malaysia where the IP project was implemented, there were many villagers who had never experienced school and many women from ethnic minority groups who had difficulty reading and writing. The ESD implemented here was a challenging project to realize the production and publication of picture books in the group’s native language of Kadazandusun. An ethnic minority female participant said: “The best experience for me was, in the midst of daily work to take care of the children and tend the fields, to learn a wise way of using time. Also, I was very happy to learn how to make books in my native language and publish them.” Also, a 30-year-old female participant in the project with five children said the following: “I had never been to a library before, but after I wrote a story in my mother tongue, I found myself excited and going to a community library.”

In Palau, the ESD project was to provide vocational education at a high school, and the high school students learned skills in furniture making and mechanical repair work, which they used to contribute to families and the local community. As a result, they gained not only skills but, to borrow the words of one of the teachers who watched them at the school, “satisfaction in their accomplishments, self-confidence and self-esteem.”
As one can see in Figure 2.2, Viet Nam was the country with the most striking increase in the degree of hope. The line increasing to the right shows just how much the early-intervention program empowered families with members with disabilities. When the writer and the team visited the ethnic minority village, a father in his early 30s said: “When my son was born, he could not easily respire and could not move at all. Now he can crawl using his hands as feet. The wheelchair he used has now become a souvenir from the past.”

During this kind of visit into the field, we encountered many expressions of hope. However, it is also a fact that the situations we saw in the field were not only those of villagers who had gained hope. In one home where we went to conduct an interview, there was a family with a son with a disability whose sickness was getting worse day by day. The mother who was holding the son had a small daughter snuggling up to her and responded to us during the interview with tearful eyes.

This was a scene far removed from the gaining of hope. However, as a result of the project, rehabilitation experts and teachers visited the home regularly, and children from the neighborhood came to the home to sing songs together. When we saw the mother who spoke of this change, we confirmed that even if the family was not able to have hope for a bright future, they were a family who had not lost their final hope.

HOPE Evaluation is still in the midst of finding its way, and there is plenty of room for improvement. However, if the essence of ESD is a re-orientation of education, we can say that the voices of the villagers are telling us we need to aim for a daily life that provides hope as well as the kind of sustainable future advocated by UNESCO.
Higher-Order Thinking Skills

In the International Implementation Scheme (December 2004 draft), critical thinking and creative thinking are positioned as special characteristics of ESD, and in the final draft these are expressed as “higher-order thinking skills.” In addition, in the Bonn Declaration ratified at the conference at the midpoint of the United Nations Decade on Education for Sustainable Development, “creative and critical approaches” are emphasized. In this way, from the beginning of ESD, what are generally called meta-cognitive abilities have been emphasized. At the stage of developing the HOPE Evaluation survey questionnaire, we were conscious of the IIS, and tried asking questions concerning these abilities. Thus, I would like to share a portion of the results.

Of the ten countries implementing projects under the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific Innovation Programme for ESD (IP), probably only the projects in Bhutan and Thailand were specifically conscious of the higher-order thinking skills mentioned in the IIS. However, it would be accurate to say that there was consciousness of the IIS at the project selection stage through the application form. Further, following the selection, the special characteristics of ESD from the IIS were emphasized by ACCU in midterm and final reports, and in every aspect of the site visits. The survey questionnaire that was implemented as a key component of the HOPE Evaluation process not only touched upon whether learners acquired “knowledge concerning sustainability” but tried asking learners themselves the degree to which they gained skills in “critical thinking,” “problem solving,” “creative thinking,” and “collaborative decision-making.” Further, the questionnaire asked whether important attitudes for the creation of a sustainable society such as care for oneself, care for one’s family, care for one’s school, care for one’s community, care for the future generations, care for nature, and care for the planet had been cultivated.

At the point of analysis, we examined the degree to which the above knowledge and skills were connected to the formation of caring attitudes. The results in tables 2.2-2.6 at the end of the chapter indicate clearly that knowledge concerning sustainable development and higher-order thinking skills are strongly correlated with the development of caring attitudes. A sample questionnaire used as part of the HOPE Evaluation Survey is also attached together with the charts. “Positive ones (answers)” in the charts indicate answers either of “strongly agree” or “agree,” while “others (other answers)” indicate answers either of “disagree” or “strongly disagree.” In the analysis, T-values were used and the above-mentioned strong relationship between knowledge about sustainable development and higher-order thinking skills was found. (See the column showing “significance”—particularly the boxes with three asterisks, which indicate a strong correlation between knowledge about sustainable development/higher-order thinking skills and caring attitudes). For instance, table ?? shows that the mastery of critical thinking is strongly related to caring attitudes towards family, community, others (future generations), and tools.

The analysis here shows that gaining higher-order thinking skills contributes to the development of caring attitudes which is of vital importance for the creation of sustainable community both in projects like the one in Bhutan where there was a strong consciousness of higher-order thinking skills and others where there was not. It can be said that the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific Innovation Programme for ESD (IP) is a concrete example of implementation of the points of emphasis concerning higher-order thinking skills in the IIS and the Bonn Declaration.

However, one must explore this point further. One cannot deny that there is danger that higher-order thinking can be confused with more shallow “communication skills” and “information skills” that are frequently employed in development that places the highest priority on economic
gain. These “shallow skills” lack the “radicalness” of those being promoted through ESD. The higher-order thinking skills aimed for in ESD are “deep skills” connected with people’s hopes and the sustainability of communities and society. Whether ESD is promoted with this depth will be crucial in determining ESD’s future path.

**Kairos, or “Meaningful Time”**

Up until this point, I have argued that ESD is a concept with the vision for a paradigm shift and that hope is an important indicator for ESD. Lastly, I would like to address the Hope Timeline and ESD evaluation and, further, issues faced in this evaluation. It is with the wish that ESD not become entangled in globalization and become powerful education that I would like to think about consciousness of time.

From the voices of the learners in the Asian and Pacific countries quoted earlier, and from the stories in Part I, one can understand that learners are in the midst of “meaningful time.” Many of the villagers’ voices are filled with hope, and their consciousness of themselves as subjects able to change the points about their lives that should be changed is growing. The time which they are experiencing is a different type of time than we can measure on our watches. Among the villagers we met in the field, there were many who, little by little, were discovering themselves in changing their situation and circumstances to more sustainable ones, and many people who recognized that they were in a particularly special time of their lives.

When one questions whether the Hope Timeline can incorporate this kind of consciousness of time, the limits and issues of HOPE Evaluation come into view. Even though HOPE Evaluation was developed as a key component of the program in order to emphasize qualitative feeling, the HOPE Timeline is an indicator that removes it. The voices of villagers
from the various Asian and Pacific countries quoted before were full of life and the time at which they spoke was clearly “meaningful time” for them. Nonetheless, as a result of the basic problem of measuring qualitative hopes in a quantitative way, this life breath disappeared.

The ancient Greeks called time that could be measured quantitatively *chronos*, and contrasted it with the word *kairos* to refer to time meaningfully experienced. In other words, there are two different types of time pertaining to human development: the objective form of time that is possible to measure called *chronos* and the time that represents a qualitative change, or the subjective time that we ourselves grasp internally, called *kairos*. In terms of a sustainable future, the important type of time is likely the latter. Nonetheless, when one evaluates human development or the development of a society, we, who are accustomed to modern science, try to apply an objective standard. However, unfortunately, this kind of approach does not capture the life and the intricacies of human society. One can probably say that the challenge for ESD is whether it can get close to this “meaningful time” and carefully understand the meanings of things that are difficult to measure. To be situated in the midst of *chronos* but to treat *kairos* as important--the results of ESD must go beyond “higher-order thinking skills” and, ultimately, must create a consciousness of being connected to this kind of human existence.
References


UNESCO. (2005a) Guidelines and Recommendations for Reorienting Teacher Education to Address Sustainability.  


SAMPLE
The ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific Innovation Programme for ESD
Self-reflection Questionnaire

1. About yourself

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Sex</th>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>Age</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

2. Please respond to the following questions as best as you can. Try to focus on changes that that has resulted from your participation in the vocational skills training.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Knowledge</th>
<th>Strongly \agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Not \sure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly \disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>I have a better understanding of the job(s) I do/ I wish to do.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>I learned more about the economy.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>I learned more about the society.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>I learned more about the natural environment.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>I learned more about the sustainability of my community.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Skills</th>
<th>Strongly \agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Not \sure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly \disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>I have developed my skills necessary for the job(s) I do/ I wish to do.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>I have found myself think more critically through different views.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>I am able to solve problems more easily when facing challenges.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>I am able to think in a more creative manner.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>I am more comfortable in making decisions together with my team mates (colleagues).</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No</th>
<th>Attitude</th>
<th>Strongly \agree</th>
<th>Agree</th>
<th>Not \sure</th>
<th>Disagree</th>
<th>Strongly \disagree</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>I care for myself more.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>I care for my family more.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>I care for my school more.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>I care for my community more.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>I care for others including those of present and future generations more.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>I care for tools and instruments we use more.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>I care for the nature more.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>I care for the planet where we live more.</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
<td>☐</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
3: Use the diagram below to rate your level of HOPE about your own future. Take note that each column represents a different time period. Read the question below each column and tick the box that best describes your level of HOPE.

**EXAMPLE**

4: Any Comments, including the most significant outcome from your participation
## HOPE EVALUATION SURVEY QUESTIONNAIRE RESULTS

Table 2.2: Relationship Between Mastery of Knowledge of Sustainable Development and Caring Attitudes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Answers</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t-value (df)</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Care for myself</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.91</td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>-0.41</td>
<td>n.s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>1.92</td>
<td>1.12</td>
<td>(761)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for my family</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td>0.59</td>
<td>-6.014</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>1.96</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td>(105.894)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for my school</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.75</td>
<td>0.85</td>
<td>-2.176</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>1.99</td>
<td>1.03</td>
<td>(114.422)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for my community</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.51</td>
<td>0.65</td>
<td>-6.32</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.09</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>(110.564)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for others (future generations)</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.54</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>-5.626</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.15</td>
<td>1.02</td>
<td>(107.573)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for tools</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.48</td>
<td>0.64</td>
<td>-4.19</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>1.90</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td>(107.95)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for nature</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.74</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>-2.054</td>
<td>*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>1.93</td>
<td>0.89</td>
<td>(761)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for the planet</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.79</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td>-3.599</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.21</td>
<td>1.09</td>
<td>(111.037)</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*  p < .01
** p < .001

N=763 (positive ones=667 others=96)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Answers</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t-value (df)</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Care for myself</td>
<td>positive ones others</td>
<td>1.89</td>
<td>1.16</td>
<td>-1.62</td>
<td>n.s</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.05</td>
<td>0.97</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for my family</td>
<td>positive ones others</td>
<td>1.35</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td>-8.00</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.99</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for my school</td>
<td>positive ones others</td>
<td>1.74</td>
<td>0.87</td>
<td>-3.45</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.05</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for my community</td>
<td>positive ones others</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>0.65</td>
<td>-8.03</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.06</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for others (future generations)</td>
<td>positive ones others</td>
<td>1.54</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>-6.08</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.12</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for tools</td>
<td>positive ones others</td>
<td>1.45</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>-5.85</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>1.98</td>
<td>0.91</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for nature</td>
<td>positive ones others</td>
<td>1.72</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>-3.39</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.02</td>
<td>0.85</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for the planet</td>
<td>positive ones others</td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td>0.85</td>
<td>-3.12</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>2.08</td>
<td>0.98</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* * *  p < .01
* * * * p < .001

N=763 (positive ones = 653 others=110)
Table 2.4: Relationship Between Mastery of Problem Solving Skills and Caring Attitudes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Answers</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t-value (df)</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Care for myself</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.90</td>
<td>1.16</td>
<td>-0.53</td>
<td>n.s.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>1.95</td>
<td>1.02</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for my family</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.33</td>
<td>0.58</td>
<td>-9.04</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>1.84</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for my school</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.72</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>-3.63</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>0.99</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for my community</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.47</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>-8.93</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>0.82</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for others (future</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.48</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>-8.18</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>generations)</td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.12</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for tools</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.41</td>
<td>0.60</td>
<td>-8.03</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>1.98</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for nature</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.73</td>
<td>0.81</td>
<td>-2.71</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>1.92</td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for the planet</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.78</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>-4.05</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.09</td>
<td>0.94</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* *  p < .01
* * *  p < .001
N = 763 (positive ones=600 others=163)
Table 2.5: Relationship Between Mastery of Creative Thinking Skills and Caring Attitudes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Answers</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t-value (df)</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Care for myself</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.89</td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td>-1.31</td>
<td>n.s.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.02</td>
<td>1.11</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for my family</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.37</td>
<td>0.59</td>
<td>-5.02</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>1.74</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for my school</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.73</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>-3.48</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.00</td>
<td>0.93</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for my community</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.50</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>-6.51</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>1.91</td>
<td>0.80</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for others</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.51</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>-7.11</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(future generations)</td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.07</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for tools</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.46</td>
<td>0.61</td>
<td>-4.74</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>1.83</td>
<td>0.92</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for nature</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.70</td>
<td>0.79</td>
<td>-4.41</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.03</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for the planet</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.78</td>
<td>0.86</td>
<td>-3.76</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.08</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

** p < .01
*** p < .001

N = 763 (positive ones=611 others=152)
Table 2.6: Relationship Between Mastery of Collaborative Decision-Making Skills and Caring Attitudes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Questions</th>
<th>Answers</th>
<th>Average</th>
<th>SD</th>
<th>t-value (df)</th>
<th>Significance</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Care for myself</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.89</td>
<td>1.13</td>
<td>-1.70</td>
<td>n.s.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.15</td>
<td>1.17</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for my family</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.39</td>
<td>0.63</td>
<td>-5.34</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.02</td>
<td>0.88</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for my school</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.74</td>
<td>0.84</td>
<td>-4.85</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.31</td>
<td>1.18</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for my community</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.55</td>
<td>0.68</td>
<td>-5.19</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.03</td>
<td>0.89</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for others (future generations)</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.59</td>
<td>0.71</td>
<td>-3.08</td>
<td>**</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.03</td>
<td>1.10</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for tools</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.49</td>
<td>0.66</td>
<td>-3.75</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>1.97</td>
<td>0.95</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for nature</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.73</td>
<td>0.80</td>
<td>-3.68</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.20</td>
<td>0.96</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Care for the planet</td>
<td>positive ones</td>
<td>1.80</td>
<td>0.83</td>
<td>-3.66</td>
<td>***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>others</td>
<td>2.36</td>
<td>1.14</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**  \( p < .01 \)
***  \( p < .001 \)

N = 763 (positive ones=704 others=59)
Introduction

The classroom observation confirmed how the 7-Step Approach\(^1\) has been effectively integrated in the classes observed. The development of the ability of the students for problem identification and a process of prioritization, selection, design and conduct of basic research in groups was equally evident.

The teachers, based on the focus group discussion conducted, were all able to demonstrate an understanding and an ability to implement the relevant steps of the 7-Step Approach to their specific grade level. They were also convinced of the ability of the approach to contribute to significant personal and group change within the students.

However, what was not as evident from the classroom visit and the focus group discussions was the teachers’ own awareness of how their own capacity–building process was shaped by the key principles (if not the actual steps) of the 7-Step Approach. For example, the key principles of

\(^{1}\) A brief explanation of the 7-Step approach can be found in Part I, page P.71 (Table1.2).
problem ownership, understanding of the system that needs to be changes and working in groups as co-learners or co-researchers, were all inherent in the descriptions the teachers gave.

The role of the OBEC facilitator in the design and implementation of the Innovation Project seemed peripheral – as the ‘outside’ expert who was called in when the teachers were not able to address certain issues. However, after some serious probing and reflection, I proposed that the OBEC facilitator who designed and conducted the capacity-building process for the teachers was guided by the very principles of the 7-Step Approach. And it was this capacity-building process that assisted in the integration and growth of the practice in the school that has in turn resulted in the significant change in the students, the teachers, the whole school and the surrounding community.

Journal entry – 8 September
Bansunkong School, Chiang Rai Province, Thailand

I decided to begin this chapter with this excerpt from my journal because I think it highlights how I felt at the end of that day. Clearly the outcomes of this particular Innovation Project conducted by the Office of Basic Education Commission (OBEC), Thailand were displayed to us during our visit. Everything we saw demonstrated the key evaluation criteria of being Holistic, Participatory and Empowering (HOPE) that we had identified as key pillars of the evaluation based on the key principles of ESD (UNESCO 2005).

Furthermore, what my journal entry also highlighted was how I felt the evaluation, which encouraged a dialogical process facilitated a process whereby the evaluation team was able to probe, confirm and highlight to the different project key players what we felt were the strengths and also identify what could be considered as the core innovation behind what was an obviously successful project. As I began to write this chapter, I was
Reflecting on the Evaluation Methodology of HOPE

I was convinced that we were able to identify the core innovation. However, as I was about to conclude writing this very chapter, I was forced to re-think my own feelings as they were documented on the 8th of September.

The re-think has been the result of my attempt to explain and reflect on the HOPE methodology in this chapter. I think through the process of reflective writing I myself better understood not just the methodology, but the dynamics that were involved in the particular Innovation Project I describe above. But before I delve further on this particular project, let me first provide some background into the development and the conduct of the HOPE Evaluation Methodology.

Developing the HOPE Evaluation Framework

The development of the HOPE evaluation framework was initiated in June 2008 by ACCU in collaboration with individual ESD experts and practitioners from the Asia-Pacific region, together with representatives from the Centers of Excellence (COE) in ESD.

There were a number of layers that the evaluation of the Innovation Projects had to satisfy, namely that the projects had to achieve the specific objectives the were set out in the approved proposal, it had to demonstrate a level of innovation that was expected from qualifying as an Innovation Project within the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Program, and finally, it had to contribute to the broader aims of the Decade of Education for Sustainable Development (DESD).

The elements of the evaluation framework were informed by two publications: the International Implementation Scheme of the UNDESD (UNESCO, 2005) and the Asia-Pacific Guidelines for the Development of National ESD Indicators (UNESCO, 2007). Four dimensions were
identified from the key characteristics of ESD as the focused dimensions to be applied in the conduct of the evaluation (ACCU, 2008).

HOLISTIC:
- Address the realms of sustainability (environment, society, economy and culture)
- Employ interdisciplinary perspectives
- Link local priorities with global issues

PARTICIPATORY:
- Use variety of pedagogical techniques promoting participatory learning
- Employ participatory approaches in the process of development

EMPOWERING:
- Capacity development for decision-making, social tolerance, environmental stewardship, adaptable workforce and quality of life both at the individual and collective levels

CONTEXTUAL:
- Locally relevant
- Adaptable to dynamic global context
- Culturally appropriate
- Flexible

The acronym “HOPE” was decided based on the first letters of the key characteristics of ESD that were identified as the key pillars of the evaluation, namely: “HOlistic,” “Participatory,” and “Empowering.” It is important to mention that as the ACCU evaluation team was developing this framework, it was keeping within its sights the global monitoring and evaluation approach that was being developed under the auspices of the International Union for Conservation of Nature (IUCN) through a global
consultative process which was meant to be completed by the end of 2009.²

**Applying the HOPE Evaluation Methodology**

The actual evaluation visits were conducted in seven out of the 10 projects sites from August to September 2008. The pilot evaluation was conducted in Palau, followed by evaluation missions by three teams with each team visiting two countries, namely: the first team visiting Bhutan and Thailand, the second team visiting Mongolia and Viet Nam, and the third team visiting Malaysia and Indonesia. A total of 390 individuals were engaged in various ways during the evaluation process. The different stories compiled in the first section of this publication provide a summary of the key outcomes of the evaluation process. What follows are some of my own reflections as a member of the evaluation team in terms of the development, the conduct and the outcomes of the HOPE evaluation as it relates to ESD.

As mentioned earlier, to be consistent with the very principles of ESD the evaluation process was designed on the basis of ensuring that a holistic view of the projects was considered, that the participation in the evaluation of as many of the key players and their own perspectives, and that the process would empower those who participate, all of these criteria would be based on an understanding of the particular contexts of the projects.

A HOLISTIC view would involve not merely focusing on the direct or immediate project outcomes and impact, but equally valuing the processes employed, the influence of the different spheres of knowledge

(environment, social, economic, cultural and political), and of course the need to engage with the different perspectives of the key players, with a possibility if providing both local and global perspectives.

To allow for the different perspectives to surface, a range of evaluation methods were employed including, first hand observation, written surveys, focus group discussions, individual interviews and public feedback sessions. Not only was the emphasis on the past process or the current impact, but the conduct of the HOPE graph (see p.iv) allowed for the participants to also project into the future. The ACCU also ensured that the evaluation team which had a minimum of three persons, would allow for the incorporation of different perspectives, as such each team was composed of individuals from different countries, different professions (NGO workers, university researchers, and educators) and from different disciplines (media, environment, education, etc.).

For example, the value of first hand observation can be illustrated from the Palau mission where the ability of the evaluation team to experience and feel assisted in better understanding the context of the students. As described in the Palau story, the team members observed that the feeling of affection displayed by the students seemed completely different when they are in the workshops. This kind of insight would not have been possible without first hand observation. However, it is also important to be careful that we do not romanticize what we see or feel, as we only see snapshots of the students or the participants at the conclusion of the project. Hence the importance of confirming what we see and feel from different perspectives: from the students themselves, from the teachers and from the evaluation team. This is just one example of how the principle and practice of being holistic in terms of different perspectives and methods employed were incorporated in the design and conduct of the evaluation.
Furthermore, to allow the different perspectives to surface required that the evaluation be PARTICIPATORY, not just through involving the different key players and groups in the identification of the key outcomes, but involving these same individuals and groups in identifying what were significant for them in terms of the project outcomes.

Aside from allowing for participation through the use of different evaluation methods as described above, the evaluation process spent a significant effort in the collection of individual stories which was guided by the principles of participation informed by both Participatory Action Research (Wadsworth, 1997) and the Most Significant Change Process (Dart and Davies, 2005).

For example, the Thailand evaluation mission, briefly described at the start of this chapter, was initially focused on the significant change stories of the teachers, the students, the school and the community. For these key players the significant changes that resulted from the implementation of the 7-Step Approach were that the students, developed an ability to work on real projects in groups; the teachers, became more confident in the use of the 7-Step approach, the principal, saw how the approach was successfully employed in different grades across the whole school, and for the local community, that they were assisted in developing a waste management plan. However, what facilitated these significant changes for each of the key players I would argue was not the 7-Step Approach alone. It was only through in-depth conversation with the OBEC facilitator with regards to her own significant change story that we unearthed another dimension that contributed to the success of the project as identified above.

The evaluation process was aimed at being EMPOWERING or more specifically of the evaluation process as a capacity-building process through the provision of opportunities within the evaluation methods for
learning from each other and from the evaluation team.

Therefore, focus group discussions were conducted as venues for public reflection prior to selecting the possible participants to be interviewed. The public reflections provided opportunities for not only listening to each other’s most significant change stories or feedback, but encouraged cross-fertilization of these identified changes and feedback. As such these focus group discussions were themselves opportunities for learning from each other. The second opportunity for learning was provided when the preliminary findings of the evaluation team were shared at the conclusion of each of the missions to the different players involved in the project.

For example, the Bhutan evaluation mission involved a sharing of findings with the local literacy class participants; the village (Dzongkha) leaders; officials from the UNESCO National Commission, the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Agriculture, and the Education Secretary. It was during these sharing of findings at the national level, that the contribution of the project in facilitating the development of a working partnership between the different government agencies, such as the on-going link with the Ministry of Agriculture that provided the agricultural knowledge and the Ministry of Education that provided the literacy framework was crystallized. This partnership has since been formalised through an MOU that has gone beyond the joint delivery of the current project. As the staff from the Ministry of Agriculture suggested when we reported back to them about our visit to the local village – “it is now our responsibility to follow-up the outcomes of the learning process” - after they realised that the project was not about funding alone, but in fact about facilitating a different kind of learning that involved the development of partnerships which was also a key component also of ESD.

The principle of being CONTEXTUAL permeated the entire evaluation where the proposed process was adapted to suit the different contexts in
terms for example of language, level of literacy, and time availability, without disregarding the other key principles. For example, the surveys were all translated into the local language, interpretation was employed during focus group discussions, interviews and feedback sessions, and the evaluation missions were conducted in close coordination with the project proponents to allow for maximum participation by the different players.

On the whole, each of the evaluation missions tried its best to be guided by the HOPE framework in the conduct and reporting of the evaluation outcomes. However, on reflection, how effective were we in applying this framework?

Reflecting on the HOPE Evaluation Experience
Before I conclude, let me revisit the journal entry that I shared to introduce this chapter. At the end of my journal entry, I described how I felt that I succeeded in convincing the OBEC facilitator of her significant role in the success of the utilisation of the 7-Step Approach in the Bansunkong School in Chiang Rai.

However, as I mentioned earlier, writing this chapter has made me revisit the conversation I had with the OBEC facilitator. My notes had a quote from her that stated – “you cannot understand the child without understanding the child’s community” and therefore she explained that central to the success of the project was the ability of the teachers to develop an experience-based understanding of the situation that their students faced.

She explained to me that most of the teachers from the school come from the mainstream or dominant culture in the area, while a significant number of their students in this school come from the Akha Hill Tribes. However, by aiming to develop effective ways of engaging their students in learning through the 7-Step Approach, the teachers themselves became participants
in a capacity-building process that facilitated the development of a more holistic understanding of their own students and the context and challenges these students face in succeeding in school. This process in turn resulted in empowering them to become better teachers.

It was the factors that facilitated the empowerment of the teachers that I became interested in un-earthing, and so I engaged the OBEC facilitator in conversation. Let me share my thought processes in evaluating this particular project using the HOPE framework.

The project was indeed holistic because the 7-Step Approach encouraged an inter-disciplinary and integrated approach to learning and teaching. The approach was incorporated throughout the entire school as appropriate in each grade level, and the approach was implemented progressively across the different contexts from the classroom, the school and to the whole community. As mentioned earlier, these were all visible and on display for evaluation team. However, as mentioned, it was only in the conversation with the OBEC facilitator that we were able to identify another significant layer of holistic educational practice. This significant layer involved the teachers, not only as the implementers of the 7-Step Approach for the students via the curriculum, but the teachers themselves as a group of co-learners within the school, which broadens and deepens our understanding and practice of what we call a whole-school approach to innovation.

Similarly, the project was participatory in that the identification and prioritisation of the problems and issues were conducted by the students or the community themselves, which therefore resulted in greater ownership of the process and the outcomes. However, again what was not as obvious but arguably crucial to the success of the project was how the very same principles of the 7-Step Approach were applied by the OBEC facilitator in the design and conduct of the teacher training workshops, based on the expressed need by the teachers and the principal to learn more about the
7-Step Approach. Hence it was participatory not just in terms of the implementation of the approach for and by the students, but it was as participatory in the approach used in preparing and providing on-going mentoring by the teachers themselves.

Finally, it was equally empowering for the students, where each step of the approach involved them directly in making decisions, building individual self-confidence and learning to work in teams. Similarly, it was through the probing that we were able to highlight how the capacity-building process itself was empowering for the teachers – as evident from the way they applied the approach, how they confidently talk about what they did, and how they have effectively worked with each other as a collective to apply the 7-Step Approach.

And so, as I explained the above to her and persisted to argue that her approach to building the capacity of the teachers to facilitate the 7-Step Approach was the most significant innovation in the project, I thought that I had made a breakthrough in convincing her of her significant role - she did say at the end of the evening that no one has previously made her consider this idea. So while she seemed excited, she also seemed a bit uncomfortable with the idea of her role in facilitating the success of the project.

As I write this chapter, months after that conversation, I still think that I was right to insist that her role as the OBEC facilitator was significant in the success of the project, but I also think that I got a bit carried away to attribute her intervention as the key innovation. I guess on reflection, I pushed for this because it was the innovation that was not on display for the evaluation team to see. So on reflection, I think all I wanted to do was to make this aspect of the project visible to the evaluation team, to her as the key facilitator but also to the teachers, who I believed could feel more empowered had they viewed themselves as a community – a community
of teachers who supported each other through learning about and conducting the 7-Step Approach.

So while the HOPE evaluation framework was generally successful in confirming the strengths of each of the projects, the evaluation process itself also allowed the evaluation team to probe and discover aspects of the projects that may not have been as visible to us or to the other project players. But I think that in this discovery process – as much of it has to continue to be informed by the HOPE framework – that unless the participants themselves come to the realisation of the significant factors that have contributed to the success of the project – we may end up with what we wanted to avoid in the first place, telling them what they were good at – rather than discovering and learning with them along the way – also as ourselves part of this community of practice.

And so we continue our journey of HOPE, and like the participants who took part in the evaluation, who mostly had increased their hopes for the future, we ourselves as educators, evaluators and projects managers will continue to look for innovative methodologies of evaluation that incorporates the principles of ESD with not just HOPE but with commitment.

References


UNESCO (2005) International Implementation Scheme, UN DESD.

ESD Indicators.


Lessons on HOPE Evaluation Methodology

Pala Wari
Education Advisor, PRIDE Project, University of South Pacific

In this brief contribution, I have focused on providing views on the lessons learnt from HOPE evaluations as experienced in Palau, Indonesia and Malaysia.

Lessons learnt

Overall, the lessons gained from the field confirm that the underlying philosophy of the HOPE evaluation approach makes it appropriate to evaluate the essence of Education for Sustainable Development (ESD). Given that the four dimensions identified as containing key characteristics of ESD (holistic, participatory, empowering, and contextual) were accommodated in developing the HOPE evaluation framework, this finding is not surprising.

Palau

The HOPE Evaluation methodology was piloted in Palau with the view that data collection and analysis instruments would be tested together with administration and logistic arrangements as well as reporting templates. Palau experience showed the importance of advance planning when
carrying out evaluation studies at country and project site levels. As the first contact point, meeting with the local country officers, especially the project implementation organisations, was seen as crucial. To ensure smooth conduct of interviews and discussions, clarification of responsibilities among the evaluation team was required. Further, specific details had to be agreed on who should do what, and how the survey should be administered and photos taken. It was also decided that audio records of all interviews were to be taken, and guidelines on how interviews should be developed. Finally, it was agreed that a final feedback session would be conducted to obtain feedback on preliminary findings, thus addressing the issue that HOPE evaluation was a learning process.

With the lessons learnt on the HOPE evaluation framework, the HOLISTIC nature of the project on the introduction of vocational education in secondary schools was clearly articulated. While the introduction of a project on vocational skills and training programme in a private secondary school appeared to be no different from the education reform efforts made by the government, data collected through the use of HOPE evaluation methodology highlighted a broader and deeper meaning for the vocational course. During the final feedback session, a senior executive of the Ministry of Education expressed appreciation for the broader ESD perspective of a vocational education programme that goes beyond the narrow view of vocational courses subsidising the normal curriculum. Views obtained from teachers, instructors, and community representatives also confirmed this assessment. Participating students spoke of gaining confidence, self-esteem and sense of cooperation apart from gaining basic skills in carpentry, mechanics, plumbing, etc. School Board members were happy with the programme as an initiative to re-develop the self-reliant attitude of the school which had been lost over the years.

The use of HOPE also found the vocational education programme of the
Emmaus High School addressing the four elements of ESD – societal, economic and environment and culture. Participating students who were engaged in vocational training contributed to the school finances, developed communal work attitudes when they were engaged in undertaking community assignments and developed appreciation of environmental issues.

The Palau experience reaffirmed that one of the most significant strengths of the HOPE evaluation approach is its emphasis on highlighting individual success stories, not only of those who directly benefit from the programme, but project managers and implementers as well as other stakeholders. While the use of conservative evaluation studies would have concentrated on the qualitative outcomes and impacts, the use of HOPE evaluation provided a more rounded picture of the broader beneficiaries and impacts of the project.

**Indonesia**

Indonesia’s project titled “Capacity Building of Community-Based Disaster Risk Assessment and Migration on West Java Volcano Hazard” was implemented by WALHI West Java. This project was mainly a capacity-building project that provided awareness on volcano preparedness to villagers through the use of volunteers. The training approach used by volunteers was found to be holistic in nature, and was aimed at developing a balanced view of wholesome and instilled attitudes and values of ESD.

One of the strengths of the HOPE evaluation methodology is its focus on the processes of project implementation which, unlike the conventional evaluation process, concentrate on outcomes. The use of HOPE evaluation in this case did what it was intended to do and provided credible information through the views expressed by direct project beneficiaries.
and project implementers. More importantly, the evaluation processes used provided useful insight into factors contributing to the successful implementation of the project and the main challenges encountered in the implementation of the project.

Overall, data collected showed that this project met the economic, societal, environmental and cultural needs of the community. In particular: the NGO implementation organisation (WALHI) was committed to mobilising all stakeholders to provide awareness on volcano disaster preparedness; volunteers were willing to work with the villagers and active community leaders took a positive attitude in organising the community to deal with the issues. However, while implementation of the project was successful, the frequent turnover of supervisors at the implementing agency (WAHLI leadership level), the loose involvement of project officers in the project site and use of volunteers from outside of the project site presented real challenges.

**Malaysia**

For Malaysia, the Moyog Family Literacy Project is implemented by Kadazandusun Language Foundation (KLF). The project is unique in that it is not a normal adult literacy project. Apart from providing adult literacy in the local vernacular, the project covered the publication of stories written in local vernacular, and all the stories fit into the general ESD thematic areas.

The findings of the evaluation mission were clear, that the project was a good example of ESD as it accommodated all ESD principles and the successful implementation of the project was due largely to an active and well-managed implementation agency. Of the positive outcomes that emerged from the project, one of the interesting findings was the unintended results of empowering marginally disadvantaged groups of
women. While the project's original intention was adult literacy education, the practical context of the local area resulted in the project scope shifting to adult literacy for women.

The experience in Malaysia also provided a new thought with regard to the use of HOPE evaluation. The argument in support of HOPE evaluation related to the provision of useful data on the implementation processes was challenged. An evaluation team member contended that, although HOPE evaluation methodology had its strengths, it was restrictive when it came to gathering information on the implementation agency, especially its characteristics. The argument advanced is that the evaluation of a project's success requires an in-depth understanding of the characteristics of the implementing organisation, as it has implications for the successful implementation of the project. In view of this, it was suggested that HOPE evaluation methodology should be reviewed with a view to providing a better picture of the characteristics of implementation organisation.

**Remarks**

Lessons from the three countries showed that the HOPE evaluation framework suits the essence of Education for Sustainable Development, and therefore is an appropriate evaluation method to use in assessing the success of IP projects.

The use of HOPE evaluation as a learning process and, more specifically, in providing implementing agencies, beneficiaries and stakeholders with broader views of the project’s link to ESD principles emerged as one of the key lessons. It appears that most people, including project beneficiaries and implementing agencies, had a very narrow view of the project’s goals and its relationship with the ESD. It was only during the final feedback sessions that implementing agencies, beneficiaries and stakeholders were able to grasp and appreciate the holistic view of the project and its link to
Lessons on HOPE Evaluation Methodology

Finally, the acceptance of the view that the HOPE evaluation framework is a learning process in itself is crucial for the evaluation of ESD projects. This understanding means HOPE evaluation would be seen as a working framework and therefore would require constant adjustment to ensure it accommodated ESD principles. This view emerged from the experience gained from the three countries where, it was felt that the HOPE evaluation methodology was restrictive in providing useful information on the implementation agency, and which suggested a review of the methodology.
ACCU’s educational assistance efforts and the HOPE Evaluation Method they have produced have led to various discoveries, learning, and changes among ACCU staff and colleagues involved in the development and implementation work. At the same time, they have raised the need for rethinking of educational assistance.

The Vision of ESD and What ACCU Has Cultivated

ACCU has addressed ESD through the Centre of Excellence Programme for ESD (COE) and the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific Innovation Programme for ESD (IP), beginning by selecting organizations and projects appropriate for carrying on the work of ESD. However, what kind of organization is ACCU itself?

According to the director of the education division at ACCU, “If ESD’s ultimate goal is to enable all people, no matter their position in society, to
have the opportunity to learn from one another, ACCU’s work developing educational materials and promoting international understanding reflects a similar stance of placing people in a position to cooperate towards common goals.”

In 1971, publishing executives in Japan had the thought: “Japan has developed economically, but there is still a hunger for books in Asia. Isn’t there something helpful Japan can do for these countries with the benefits of its development?” This thought came together with the movement by the government of Japan to establish a center through which Japan could contribute to Asia through projects connected with UNESCO, and ACCU was established.

The stance towards its work that ACCU has cultivated lifts up the themes of innovation in the midst of continuity, harmony, and “interesting, easy to understand, and useful.” ACCU projects do not involve one person teaching another. Participants strive to move projects forward by learning from one another, to jointly grasp existing needs, and to create and use learning materials together. One can say that this kind of organizational culture gave birth to the HOPE Evaluation Method. Nevertheless, it was not a smooth birth, as there were several challenges in the process of development and implementation.

**ACCU’s Positioning**

The Innovation Programme aims to enable the seeds of ESD to flower. Wide-ranging and holistic on the one hand, ESD is said to be difficult to understand for the same reason. However, as soon as one tries to simplify it by applying existing standards and frameworks, the buds of ESD wither.

What is the best way of cultivating the seeds of ESD naturally while enabling local people to act based on their own wants? In the answer to
this question lies the key to success for the Innovation Programme. To attempt this, ACCU prioritized non-formal education projects in which ACCU has had ample experience and achievements. In selecting projects, ACCU took care not to fall into the trap of selecting projects solely based on applications with good appearance and organization. As an experiment, ACCU even accepted applications where the content did not include the word “ESD.” These policies were aimed at cultivating the seeds of ESD. In other words, the Innovation Programme began with an emphasis on a “culture of nurture.”

The projects were established with a two-year implementation period from 2006-2008 and were conducted using participatory methods. ACCU did not aim to travel frequently to the project sites. What ACCU did do frequently was, for example, to continue to ask the local implementers “What is ESD?” in different ways whenever there was an opportunity—even from Tokyo.

Staff would ask: “Is this project one that addresses culture, the economy or the environment?” And a year after the project had started, staff would ask: “How has your definition of ESD changed?”

### Stakeholders and ACCU

- The Innovation Program (IP) was conducted based on the following horizontal relationships: [ACCU ↔ Implementing Organizations (Government • NGO • School) ↔ Residents • Students • Children]
- The HOPE Evaluation Method was developed through workshops involving: [ACCU + Experts + Centres of Excellence]
- Field-based evaluation activities were prepared for by: [ACCU + Experts + Centres of Excellence] ↔ Implementing Organizations
- Interviews were conducted involving: [ACCU + Experts + Centres of Excellence +Implementing Organizations] ↔ Residents • Students • Children
Responses that came back included: “We were addressing the environment, but in actuality we ended up working on social issues,” “Social issues and environmental issues are very closely connected,” and “To do this [project], it is important to address the issue of culture.” The implementing partners very naturally came to the “3 pillars + 1” promoted by UNESCO (environment, society, economy, and culture). Further, this process of the flowering of ESD was shared among the project implementers and ACCU.

The Answers Are in the Field

ESD represents a paradigm shift questioning the model of education itself. Thus, using only a customary means of evaluating whether one can observe the planned project results would not be able to reflect the unique characteristics of ESD. It became necessary to develop a new evaluation method of the highest quality suited to ESD. In June 2008, as the end of the Innovation Programme projects approached, ACCU organized the “ACCU Workshop on Evaluation Approaches from ESD Perspectives in Asia and the Pacific” in Tokyo and Miyagi Prefecture, about 300km north of Tokyo, Japan, where a Regional Centre of Expertise (RCE), one of the programmes of United Nations University-Institute of Advanced Studies (UNU-IAS), was located. The workshop brought together experts and staff from Centres of Excellence for six days for the purpose of developing this method.

From the beginning participants were quite excited by the idea to develop a new methodology suited to ESD projects. It was agreed that it should not be a conventional evaluation but something more of a HOPE. However, when it comes to the concrete, it was as if participants were stuck in a long, dark tunnel as they aimed to capture on paper the concrete guidelines for evaluation they envisioned. The group went around in circles about what would be measured by what measurements, and it even
seemed like the whole effort was going to fall to pieces.

Somehow, the breakthrough was achieved when the group went into the field. In the Tajiri District, which is the regional base for ESD and a part of the above-mentioned RCE ESD activities include revitalization of the ecosystem through organic farming, development of name-brand rice, and environmental education. One of the workshop participants asked: “If you had to say one thing you learned through these activities, what would it be?” The twenty people who answered talked about things like “connectedness among people,” “economic results,” “culture,” and “a place to play.” Then, at the social gathering that followed, respondents said things like: “I have never had conversation like this,” and spoke of the value to them of this time spent reflecting.

The questioner became a mirror for the respondent, and the strength of this kind of question echoed among the workshop participants. This consolidated an image of evaluation interviews, and became a powerful step forward in developing an evaluation method. The answer was in the field.

In addition, evaluation questions had to be simple. Energy was poured into work to narrow down the questions. Focus group discussions were established as the main evaluation vehicle, and only five questions would be prepared. Only these questions would be asked. In addition, feedback on the evaluation results would always be provided. This would provide opportunities for people at the site to reflect, and might even enable them to see desirable next steps. While the data would also be useful for interdisciplinary analysis, learning by the stakeholders was given the highest priority.
If the Evaluation Method Changes, the Stance of the Evaluators Will Change

An expert involved with the development of the HOPE Evaluation Method reflected: “It would have been easier if I had used traditional evaluation methods—I changed to the HOPE Evaluation Method.”

HOPE Evaluation is not matched to a logical framework, but starts with what is actually there. Whatever project site one visits, one continues to ask: “What was your most important experience?” This method enables one to approach the reality.

The expert continued: “Concerning the data that comes out, one then determines one’s behavior and stance, and aims to solve the problem. It’s a continual repetition of this. It’s difficult, but I was able to enjoy the process. This was different than other international cooperation—more dynamic.”

ESD Which Cannot Be Seen in Reports Rises to the Surface

On its face, the Palau project focused on vocational education and it was difficult to see the presence of ESD. From the office in Tokyo, ACCU staff wondered how ESD was being manifested in the project and lacked confidence in it. Then, one of the staff questioned a high school student on site. “What was good about participating in this project?” She imagined the response would be: “I learned skills.” However, this was not the case. Answers such as “I gained confidence,” “I was happy that the people around me depended on me,” and “I was happy to be able to be useful on this planet earth” followed one after the other. In this experience, the ACCU staff member recognized the essence of education and felt that she had seen what ESD is. The conversation turned into an opportunity for the
staff member to remember that the most important thing for human beings is to be in a situation where they are able to feel their value. The staff member later reflected that through the HOPE Evaluation, she came to feel that her job—which can change people’s inner being—is one which involves getting close to people.

Similarly, it was revealed that the project in Thailand that extended a participatory learning method throughout an entire school did not have that as its only innovation. ACCU staff visited the project site and from discussions with the responsible person at the Ministry of Education of Thailand realized the innovations she had made in the project approach and process for training teachers.

How this person was involved in the project process and how the teachers changed likely would not come up in a project report, so it would have been hard to grasp these points in Tokyo. A staff member said that it made an impression on her to see the meaning behind going to the project sites and speaking with the people in charge rather than continuing to talk without seeing the situation.

In the case of the agricultural project in Bhutan, ACCU staff were able to see in front of their eyes that farmers who up until that point had been blindly using simple techniques had mastered new critical thinking skills. As part of a literacy class, the farmers discussed which crops to plant in a group discussion, created a matrix which they used to rank different crops, and discussed why they wanted to plant each crop and what kind of farming technique they would use. They understood the content well and how the skills they had learned could be applied. ACCU staff encountered a process of mastering skills that could revolutionize a situation.
From the Office to the Field

ACCU formed three teams which departed for the field at the same time, with the director of the education division remaining at the office. This kind of pattern of sending teams to the field was unusual for ACCU. In this case, staff who ordinarily filled the greater part of their time with coordination and administration work at their desks left for the field to participate in the HOPE Evaluation.

One of these staff members participated in the interviews in Viet Nam concerning a project to care for children with disabilities before their entry to school. By virtue of this care, children who had before been confined to bed increased the number of things they were able to do themselves. When seeing the parents who responded with their feelings of the changes they were able to create with their own hands, the staff member said: “Our stay was short, but I was so impressed with the hopes that had arisen for the families.”

In Mongolia, the director of the implementing organization who accompanied the group on the site visit saw that materials her group had developed were being used in villages far from the capital. She was able to share her happiness with the villagers, and told ACCU staff that she would like to improve the materials further. The ACCU staff member present confided: “At first, I thought that ESD was a novel but fleeting campaign, but I now have seen what it can become in front of my doubting eyes.” In listening to the voices of the recipients and the director, the staff member could truly feel the project’s significance. Now, she said, “The implementing organizations that conduct activities in their specialized areas such as the environment and human rights have become conscious of the need to cross over the different realms and connect activities.”

Of course, this change in attitude does not occur only as a result of getting
out of the office and standing in the field a seven-hour drive away, as in the case of Mongolia. An official with the central government in Palau had talked as if the ESD project at the school had shown no value. However, when he dropped in at the evaluation session at the school not too far from the office, he said he could not conceal being moved by the statements from the students.

Changes can occur even back at the office while supporting the project evaluation, such as happened at ACCU. When receiving the reports back from staff, the director of the Education Division said she was thinking how the projects would be viewed in Japan and how they would be viewed from the perspective of a larger society, and she was able to think from multiple sides and became more concerned and self-critical.

The changes also spread to other staff in the office. In the past, when the office bathroom was not in use, the light was left switched on. However, staff deemed this inappropriate for an organization involved in ESD and the custom of shutting off the light arose as an unexpected improvement.

**Post-Project Phase**

Financial assistance to the projects has been completed. However, for example, in the case of the area in Indonesia where the disaster prevention project was implemented, many issues that should be addressed remain such as the development of roads, legal issues concerning the residential areas, and healthcare. The assistance from ACCU addressed one piece of the issues in the area. Perhaps ESD can contribute a little to empowering people to pursue an effective route for other solutions such as advocating for government action.

In Palau, we can say that the youth have gained skills connected to the realization of their hopes for the future. The farmers in Bhutan also have
hope. They probably know what they should do to secure a sustainable future and to simulate different possibilities.

Turning our eyes, there is a great threat in that children living in societies which are flooded with material goods and information, such as Japan and others, may not have a sense of hope about the future. If there are no children who have hope, a sustainable society is not possible.

The first request to use the HOPE Evaluation Method came from a university teacher who has been working with people in Tajiri. In the midst of ESD seeming like many different things, one can use the HOPE Evaluation Method to see what kinds of differences are revealed over time. Further, when the method is used with a group rather than just individuals, one can see what changes occur among those working together. Much interest in the method from many different places is being expressed.

Towards International Assistance that Emphasizes Process

ESD aims to indicate sustainable directions as well as to emphasize process in order to promote changes among stakeholders.

One staff member expressed her understanding of the meaning of ESD in international cooperation as: “I myself experienced the merits and demerits of the education system when I was raised. If one sees children who have grown up in advanced nations with organized education, they are not necessarily happy. Considering this, I had the vague thought of whether it was okay just to continue to do the work of putting children into schools. ESD came as an answer to this because it clarifies a direction towards which one should be learning.”
In addition, one of the experts confessed to the changes in himself: “In HOPE Evaluation, hopes or lack thereof are discussed. During this discussion, sometimes people cry. Seeing these people, we cry as well. All of the people participating change, and even the project officer came to laugh a lot. The group shares this process of precious moments and the government officials and local NGOs as well as the supporting and implementing organizations all change. However, the ordinary mode of international cooperation is like when a person is shielded by armor and there is no way for the people participating to change,” he said, challenging the usual mode of stakeholder participation.

HOPE Evaluation brought the HOPE Timeline into view. On one hand, measuring sustainability is difficult. For the future, should we try to measure it or not? “The instant that an outside source says that in order to be sustainable, this is the way things should be, the goodness of flexibility and the happiness will probably disappear,” said one of the experts with concern. If one is to set standards, what definition of sustainability, with what units, how it should be thought of, and who should decide? There is no person who can see what sustainability is globally, and no one probably knows what is sustainable outside of their own direct experience. One can say that this is work that needs to be done by each of the recipients who is living that reality. ESD and the HOPE Evaluation Method demand a rethinking of educational cooperation.

The ESD “HOPE” Evaluation Approach

Asia/Pacific Cultural Centre for UNESCO (ACCU)
FINAL DRAFT as of 28 August 2008

I. Objectives of the Evaluation Mission
II. Scope of the Mission
III. Sources of ideas and frameworks
   i) Focused Dimension of ESD
   ii) Focused Indicator Types for the Mission
IV. Process of the Mission
   i) Preparatory Work
   ii) Actual Visits
V. Analysis and Synthesis
   i) Management and Analysis of the IP-specific Data
   ii) Synthesis of 10 IP Reports

*Hope = HOlistic, Participatory and Empowering

**Underlying philosophy:**

Indicators and methodologies of the “HOPE” evaluation approaches, beffited in the essence of ESD, will be endogenously developed and peacefully applied, by sharing a common vision towards our sustainable future,

with due respect to local cultures, traditions and initiatives towards a positive change,

addressing cross-cutting issues, such as peace, happiness, and well-being,

employing participatory and empowering methodologies,

valuing dialogues and thick description of the narratives,

providing formative feedback to the project stakeholders for their empowerment,

with the evaluation mission serving as a platform of mutual learning and self-reflection,

without losing ultimate goals towards a more just, peaceful and sustainable society.
Objectives of the Evaluation Mission

Valuing the “HOPE” principle as an underlying philosophy, the Mission aims to:

(1) gather qualitative and quantitative data for reporting and giving formative feedback

By doing so, the Mission is expected to contribute to:

(2) advancement of the field of ESD and Monitoring & Evaluation
(3) organisational learning for ACCU in ESD and ESD-based Project Management

I. Scope of the Mission

The Mission includes:

(1) All the Innovation Projects to respond to the pre-mission “Self-reflection Questionnaire”, preferably two weeks before the mission
(2) All the Innovation Projects to be visited by the Evaluation Team
(3) A team of three, as a basic unit. The actual number of the participants in one team is subject to change, from a minimum of two persons (ACCU and 1 specialist) to a larger team consisted of more COE representatives and assistant staff. The ESD project managers/staff, an interpreter, other relevant stakeholders from the localities will join in the field.
(4) An approximate duration of 2 weeks as a guide.

II. Sources of ideas and frameworks

The “HOPE” Evaluation Approach is informed by a series of discussion on United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development (UNDESD). In particular, the dimensions of ESD and the indicator types focused in this Approach are based on the following two publications: 1) International Implementation Scheme of the UNDESD; and 2) the Asia-Pacific Guidelines for the Development of National ESD Indicators.

i) Focused Dimension of ESD

The following four pillars have been extracted from the key characteristics of ESD pointed out in the International Implementation Scheme of the UNDESD (UNESCO, 2005, pp.30-31), as the focused dimension of ESD for the HOPE Evaluation approach.

HOLISTIC:
- Address the realms of sustainability (environment, society, economy and culture)
- Employ Interdisciplinary perspectives
- Link Local priorities with global issues

PARTICIPATORY:
- Use variety of pedagogical techniques promoting participatory learning
- Employ participatory approaches in the process of development
EMPOWERING:
- Capacity development for decision-making, social tolerance, environmental stewardship, adaptable workforce and quality of life both at the individual and collective levels

CONTEXTUAL:
- Locally relevant
- Adaptable to dynamic global context
- Culturally appropriate
- Flexible

E. Key characteristics of education for sustainable development

No universal models of ESD exist. While there is overall agreement on principles of sustainability and supporting concepts, there will be nuanced differences according to local contexts, priorities, and approaches. Each country has to define its own sustainability and education priorities and actions. The goals, emphases and processes must, therefore, be locally defined to meet the local environmental, social and economic conditions in culturally appropriate ways. Education for sustainable development is equally relevant and important for both developed and developing countries.

ESD has essential characteristics that can be implemented in many culturally appropriate forms.

Education for sustainable development:
- is based on the principles and values that underlie sustainable development;
- deals with the well being of all three realms of sustainability – environment, society and economy;
- promotes life-long learning;
- is locally relevant and culturally appropriate;
- is based on local needs, perceptions and conditions, but acknowledges that fulfilling local needs often has international effects and consequences;
- engages formal, non-formal and informal education;
- accommodates the evolving nature of the concept of sustainability;
- addresses content, taking into account context, global issues and local priorities;
- builds civil capacity for community-based decision-making, social tolerance, environmental stewardship, adaptable workforce and quality of life;
- is interdisciplinary. No one discipline can claim ESD for its own, but all disciplines can contribute to ESD;
- uses a variety of pedagogical techniques that promote participatory learning and higher-order thinking skills.
ii) Focused Indicator Types
Among various types of indicators, The HOPE Evaluation approach shows particular interests in those identifying “Process”, “Learning”, “Output”, “Outcome” and “Impact/Contribution”. In the conduct of the on-site HOPE evaluation survey, three indicators, i.e. “Process”, “Learning” and “Outcome” are more prioritised. More detailed description of each focused indicator types are shown in the table 1 as a set of examples.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator Type</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Process</strong></td>
<td>The methods used to develop learning resources and activities, and also the methods used in the conduct of learning activities (including assessment).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Learning</strong></td>
<td>The content of the learning or the knowledge, skills, attitude and values being developed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Output</strong></td>
<td>The tangible products such as learning resources produced and learning activities conducted.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Outcome</strong></td>
<td>The individual knowledge, skills, attitudes and values developed as a result of participating in this project.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Impact/Contribution</strong></td>
<td>The applications of the learning outcomes into real life (environment, social/cultural and/or economic aspects) and impact of the promotion of ESD.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: UNESCO 2005, International Implementation Scheme, UNDESd)

### Table 1: Indicator Types Using Teacher Education as an Example

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Indicator Type</th>
<th>Function</th>
<th>Indicator Example</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Baseline</td>
<td>To identify the status of the overall ESD picture</td>
<td>% of new teachers currently receiving pre-service training in ESD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Context</td>
<td>To identify the existence of ESD support systems</td>
<td>National education policy exists that requires pre-service teacher education courses to provide training in ESD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Process</td>
<td>To identify the existence of ESD processes and activities</td>
<td>All pre-service teacher education courses provide training on ESD-related content and pedagogy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Learning</td>
<td>To promote learning and reflection on ESD</td>
<td>Lessons learned in the process of training pre-service teachers in ESD are captured</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Output</td>
<td>To assess outputs such as tools and learning resources, and the immediate results of an activity</td>
<td>% of new teachers certified as having received pre-service training in ESD</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Outcome</td>
<td>To assess outcomes related to changes or improvements that result from ESD efforts</td>
<td>% of new teachers using ESD-related content and pedagogy in the classroom</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Impact</td>
<td>To assess impacts that result from ESD efforts</td>
<td>Learners use sustainable practices in daily life</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performance</td>
<td>To assess the change in the status of the overall ESD picture in a region or country</td>
<td>Increase in the number of new teachers receiving pre-service training</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

(Source: UNESCO 2007, Monitoring and Assessing Progress during the UNDESd in the Asia-Pacific Region: A Quick Guide to Developing National ESD Indicators.)
III. Process of the Mission

The Mission includes 1) preparatory work, 2) actual field visits, and 3) analysis and synthesis. The overall flow of the mission is described below.

i) Preparatory work

- Distribute of the Final Evaluation Form for the Innovation Project Implementing Organisations (See Annexure I)
- Inform the Implementing Organisations of the field visit rationale, process and preparation required
- Consult for appropriate timing, location and programme
- ACCU staff, in consultation with the team leader, to localise the Self-Reflection Questionnaire (Rephrase Question No. 1 and No. 6).

ii) Actual field visits (visit all, vary size/duration of mission)

NOTE: all the meetings, discussions, interviews should be digitally recorded by consent and saved on the laptop as well as external memory devices like USB flash memory.

2.1 On Arrival

- Team building within the evaluation team – sharing the principles of the mission, dividing specific roles (who to lead, facilitate the discussion, do interview, take notes, take photos, do recording, etc.).
- Meet with project officers, to explain process and invite to be part of the process as co-evaluators, and to clarify the details of the project based on the submitted coversheet for the final report.
- Fine-tune the scheduling and arrangement of the FGD, interviews, courtesy calls, etc, with the project officers. Confirm the appointment with the informants.
- Ask for advice on who has rich stories to tell for individual interviews.
- Ask for advice on who are the important stakeholders that the evaluation team should meet. Alternatively the evaluation team can list specific stakeholders they wish to meet and ask for cooperation in making the arrangement.
- Explain the concept of the final feedback session (open to all) and ask for the arrangement (venue, timing, announcement and invitation).
- Ask for cooperation in distributing and collecting the standardised “Self-reflection Questionnaire” designed to measure the learning outcomes of the direct learners (See Annexure II), and send ACCU the original responses by Friday 31 October 2008 together with the Year 2 Final Report. (Provide the digital data with the project officer for translation.) Explain verbally how to answer Question 3 “hope timeline”.
- Pay courtesy calls to relevant officials (e.g. National Commission for UNESCO)
Sampling of the SELF-REFLECTION QUESTIONNAIRE

Its purpose is to quantify and visualise the outcomes of the project activities from a standpoint of ESD.

First, in consultation with the project team, clarify the number of direct beneficiaries (not necessarily the end users). **The priority is for the questionnaire survey to cover all the direct beneficiaries.** However, if the total number of respondents exceeds 100, narrow down the number according to the rough guide, shown below, and do proportionate stratified sampling. The steps are as follows.

1. Divide your sampling frame into categories significant to the project.
2. Figure out the percentage of the total that each category forms.
3. Draw a random sample from each category that reflects its proportion in the number of the direct beneficiaries.

| Table 6-2. Table for Determining Sample Size (n) from a Given Population (P) |
|---|---|---|---|---|---|
| N  | n  | N  | n  | N  | n  |
| 10  | 10 | 200 | 140 | 1,200 | 201 |
| 15  | 14 | 230 | 164 | 1,500 | 207 |
| 20  | 19 | 260 | 188 | 1,600 | 202 |
| 25  | 24 | 250 | 152 | 1,500 | 206 |
| 30  | 28 | 290 | 165 | 1,600 | 310 |
| 35  | 32 | 270 | 159 | 1,700 | 313 |
| 40  | 36 | 280 | 162 | 1,800 | 317 |
| 45  | 40 | 290 | 165 | 1,900 | 320 |
| 50  | 44 | 300 | 169 | 2,000 | 322 |
| 55  | 48 | 320 | 175 | 2,200 | 327 |
| 60  | 52 | 340 | 181 | 2,400 | 331 |
| 65  | 56 | 360 | 186 | 2,600 | 335 |
| 70  | 59 | 380 | 191 | 2,600 | 338 |
| 75  | 63 | 400 | 196 | 3,000 | 341 |
| 80  | 66 | 420 | 201 | 3,500 | 346 |
| 85  | 70 | 440 | 205 | 4,000 | 351 |
| 90  | 73 | 460 | 210 | 4,500 | 354 |
| 95  | 76 | 480 | 214 | 5,000 | 357 |
| 100 | 80 | 500 | 217 | 6,000 | 361 |
| 110 | 86 | 550 | 228 | 7,000 | 364 |
| 120 | 92 | 600 | 234 | 8,000 | 367 |
| 130 | 97 | 650 | 242 | 9,000 | 368 |
| 140 | 103 | 700 | 248 | 10,000 | 370 |
| 150 | 106 | 750 | 254 | 15,000 | 375 |
| 160 | 113 | 800 | 260 | 20,000 | 377 |
| 170 | 118 | 850 | 265 | 30,000 | 379 |
| 180 | 123 | 900 | 269 | 40,000 | 380 |
| 190 | 127 | 950 | 274 | 50,000 | 381 |
| 200 | 133 | 1,000 | 278 | 75,000 | 382 |
| 210 | 136 | 1,100 | 285 | 100,000 | 384 |

*Source: Krejcie and Morgan (1970).*

Kane, Eileen. 1995 Seeing for Yourself: Research Handbook for Girls’ Education in Africa
2.2 Convene Focus Group Discussion with Learners

Organise FGD in a cosy environment.
Explain that you are here to learning from their experience, stories, opinions, etc.
Keep an eye on the interaction among and between the informants and the facilitator(s), and try to avoid the floor being dominated by a certain person and/or one strong statement leading other informants’ opinions into a certain direction.
Use simple words and ask the following questions. You do not have to follow the sequence of the questions as long as those are covered by the end of the discussion.
It may be easier for the respondents to recollect and speak up, if you start with an easy-to-answer question such as “Tell me what you have done as part of this project.” etc.

Q1: What is your most significant/best experience from participating in the project?
Q2: Identify one thing you have learned from conducting the various project activities?
Q3: What for you has changed as a result of your involvement in this project?
Q4: How did this change contribute to your family, community, organisation, society, environment, etc.?
Q5: What improvements to the project do you recommend?

• After FGD, identify a manageable number of learners with rich experiences for individual interviews, in consideration with the advice from the project managers, and make/confirm appointment with them.

2.3 Interview with Learners

Organise a series of individual interviews with learners identified from FGD in a cosy environment. It is advisable to limit the number of people present during individual interviews; otherwise it gives too much pressure on responding individuals (preferably, only an interviewee, an interviewer, an interpreter and a note-taker should be present).

• Conduct interview with learners selected from the FGD
• Expound on the general data gathered from the FGD with emphasis on the individual experience.
• The number of interviews depends on the IP and available time (Try at least three respondents, and they should approximate representative groups, e.g. gender, age, occupation, home village, etc.)
2.4 Interview with Other Relevant and Important Stakeholders

Organise a series of interviews - or FGD, depending on the size of the informants - with relevant and important stakeholders other than learners, in a cosy environment. You may need to explain the outline of this project where and if necessary.

- Obtain a better view of the project from different stakeholders’ standpoints
- Validate the general date gathered from FGD and individual interviews
- Interviewers are free to form questions in light of characteristics of the stakeholder.
  (E.g. for parents, “what do you feel about your child before and after participating in the project?)

2.5 Sharing Experiences, Reflections and Focus Group Discussion with Project Officers/Managers

- Sharing and processing of findings with key staff members (not necessarily working directly on the project)
- Focus Group Discussion with those project staff using the same framework.
  Q1: What is your most significant/best experience from participating in the project?
  Q2: Identify one thing you have learned from conducting the various project activities?
  Q3: What for you has changed as a result of your involvement in this project?
  Q4: How did this change contribute to your family, community, organisation, society, environment, etc.?
  Q5: What improvements to the project do you recommend?

2.6 Interview with Individual Project Staff: selected from the FGD

- Expound the general data gathered from the FGD with emphasis on the individual experience.
- The number of informants depends on the IP and outputs from FGD – no need to do this if FGD has already produced enough data and stories to work on for analysis and synthesis.

2.7 On-going Identification of Key Themes and Domains

- At the conclusion of each day, the team will begin to identify key themes that surface from the data being collected.
- Type out the handwritten field notes for submission to ACCU (See the format in Annexure III).
2.8 Open Session for Formative Feedback (Recommendation)

This serves as a prime opportunity to materialise the “HOPE” philosophy as the process of evaluation. This aims not only for the evaluation team to validate the data but also for any involved stakeholders to reorient their project towards ESD in a more holistic manner. This session helps the practitioners like project officers, teachers, etc. to conceptualise what they are doing at the grassroots level, and helps education policy makers and administrators to have a better picture of what ESD is and how the grassroots activities link to global initiatives like UNDESD.

- At the conclusion of the on-site mission, the Evaluation team including the Project team organises a feedback session.
- Open to anyone who would like to listen and has been affected by the project
- Can be used this opportunity for validation but also provide formative feedback for the project enhancement and sustainability.

Sample Programme of OPEN FEEDBACK SESSION

1. About ACCU
2. About ESD and the ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme
3. The Outline of the Mission – purposes, duration, places we visited, people we met, etc.
4. Preliminary findings
5. Feedback, Q&A, Discussion

The session may take one or two hours including the discussion. The team’s presentation might take 20-30 minutes at maximum.

Divide the roles among presenters.

Arrange refreshments (water, tea and/or snacks if necessary).

For the presentation done by Palau, please see Annexure IV.

2.9 Other Data to be Collected as Evidence

- Photographs
- Video footage
- Newsletters and other documentation done by the project team
- Newspaper clippings
- Background information (e.g. education statistics)

2.10 Preliminary Analysis

- All materials will be recorded digitally
- Accompanying staff to take detailed notes for discussions
- Team to meet in the evening to conduct preliminary analysis by identifying themes that surface. Themes may be used by future missions and may grow as more missions are conducted.

**Note: Sharing of Roles in the Team**
A series of focus group discussion is a key component of the on-site mission. The team leader is expected to follow the discussion contents carefully, while COE representative(s) pays attention to the process of discussion, looking at facilitation, interaction among the discussants, environment, etc. ACCU staff mainly takes notes of the discussion, and other staff such as COE representative(s) is to support note-taking.

**IV. Analysis and Synthesis**

i) **Management and Analysis of the IP-specific Data**
Each team to prepare a Mission Report that will be patterned from the Key Headings IP Cover Sheet of the final report.

ii) **Synthesis of 10 IP Reports**
Dr. Nagata to work with ACCU staff in consultation with Mr. Wari and Dr. Guevara in terms of the computer-aided analysis of the data

2.1 **Decide on the Final Analysis Process that will**
- Identify the broader themes that surfaces from the 10 IPs guided by the overall HOPE framework (Project Evaluation)
- Identify ESD-based Project Management issues that surface for IPs and ACCU (organisational learning)
- Begin to identify theoretical and practical advances in terms of ESD (research and advancing the field practice)

2.2 **Convene an ACCU Focus Group Discussion**
- Sharing and processing of findings with key staff members (not necessarily working directly on the project)
- Focus group discussion of those project staff using the same framework:
  Q1: What is your most significant/best experience from participating in the project?
  Q2: Identify one thing you have learned from conducting the various project activities?
  Q3: What for you has changed as a result of your involvement in this project?
  Q4: How did this change contribute to your family, community, organisation, society, environment, etc.?
  Q5: What improvements to the project do you recommend?
2.3 Interview with *ALL* Individual Project Staff

- To expound on the general data gathered from the FGD with emphasis on the individual experience.
- Number: All
Collected results of the “HOPE” Evaluation Questionnaire

Profile - Bhutan -

Figure 3.1: Knowledge
- Jobs
- Sustainability of My Community
- Environment
- Economy
- Society

Figure 3.2: Skills
- Jobs
- Cooperative decision making
- Critical thinking
- Problem-solving
- Creative thinking

Figure 3.3: Attitude
- Myself
- My family
- My school
- My community
- Future generations
- Nature
- Tools and instruments
- Planet
Profile - China -

Figure 3.4 : Knowledge

- Jobs
- Sustainability of My Community
- Environment
- Economy
- Society

Figure 3.5 : Skills

- Jobs
- Cooperative decision making
- Creative thinking
- Critical thinking
- Problem-solving

Figure 3.6 : Attitude

- Myself
- Planet
- Nature
- Tools and instruments
- My family
- My school
- My community
- Future generations
Profile
- Malaysia -

Figure 3.7: Knowledge

Jobs
Sustainability of My Community
Environment
Economy
Society

Figure 3.8: Skills

Jobs
Cooperative decision making
Creative thinking
Critical thinking
Problem-solving

Figure 3.9: Attitude

Myself
Planet
My family
Nature
My school
Tools and instruments
My community
Future generations

Myself
Planet
My family
Nature
My school
Tools and instruments
My community
Future generations
Profile - Mongolia -

Figure 3.10: Knowledge
- Jobs
- Sustainability of My Community
- Economy
- Environment
- Society

Figure 3.11: Skills
- Jobs
- Cooperative decision making
- Critical thinking
- Creative thinking
- Problem-solving

Figure 3.12: Attitude
- Myself
- Planet
- Nature
- Tools and instruments
- Future generations
- My community
- My school
- My family
Profile -Nepal-

Figure 3.13: Knowledge

Figure 3.14: Skills

Figure 3.15: Attitude
Profile - Palau -

Figure 3.16: Knowledge
- Jobs
- Sustainability of My Community
- Economy
- Environment
- Society

Figure 3.17: Skills
- Jobs
- Cooperative decision making
- Critical thinking
- Creative thinking
- Problem-solving

Figure 3.18: Attitude
- Myself
- Planet
- My family
- Nature
- My school
- Tools and instruments
- My community
- Future generations
Profile - Uzbekistan -

Figure 3.19: Knowledge
- Jobs
- Sustainability of My Community
- Economy
- Environment
- Society

Figure 3.20: Skills
- Jobs
- Cooperative decision making
- Critical thinking
- Creative thinking
- Problem-solving

Figure 3.21: Attitude
- Myself
- Planet
- Nature
- Tools and instruments
- Future generations
- My family
- My school
- My community
Figure 3.22: Knowledge

Figure 3.23: Skills

Figure 3.24: Attitude
The ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme was developed in response to the launch of the United Nations Decade of Education for Sustainable Development (UNDESD, 2005-2014) as an exemplar model for activities that would promote education for sustainable development in the Asia-Pacific region. With the support of "UNESCO/Japan Funds-in-Trust for Education for Sustainable Development", the Programme consists of two sub-programmes:

1) institutional-based "COE Programme for ESD"
2) project-based "Innovation Programme for ESD"

**Centre of Excellence (COE) Programme for ESD**

The COE Programme aims to support existing institutions working in related fields of Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) to become a catalyst for ESD in the Asia-Pacific region. Five organisations appointed to serve as the Centre of Excellence (COE) in ESD in the Asia-Pacific region plan to carry out their activities with a five-year mandate (2006-2010). COEs provide and support educational initiatives that lead to community empowerment, and contribute to building the capacity of institutions, civil society organisations and communities to address ESD issues. The COE will also advocate integrating the ESD agenda into policy, programmes, curricula and practices at various levels.

**Innovation Programme for ESD**

The Innovation Programme for ESD aims to initiate and support projects that will serve as good examples for the implementation and promotion of Education for Sustainable Development (ESD) in the Asia-Pacific region. Ten community-based projects, selected openly in 2006 from ten countries in Asia and the Pacific, are carrying out their activities for two years. Model practices of ESD will be identified and shared for emulation across the region.

### 1. Centre of Excellence (COE) Programme for ESD

1) Asia South Pacific Bureau of Adult Education (ASPBAE)

ASPBAE’s COE project involves connecting the following key concerns: indigenous peoples’ education, women’s empowerment, national and regional level education policy advocacy, literacy research and advocacy, and specific awareness-raising on ESD. It also involves linking national level activities with sub-regional, regional and international activities to promote ESD.

2) Dhaka Ahsania Mission (DAM)

DAM’s COE project is designed to increase the access of vulnerable and marginalized rural communities and individuals, including women, children and people with disabilities, to the available social services to which they are entitled. In planning and managing the project activities, local government authorities and adolescents will both play the roles of change agents towards re-orienting education, equitable access to public services and preservation of natural and social environment.

---

1 taken from “The ACCU-UNESCO Asia-Pacific ESD Programme” brochure, ACCU 2007
3) Thailand Environment Institute (TEI)

TEI’s COE project will have the fundamental tasks of promoting the concepts and practices of sustainable development through improved environmental education in schools, communities, research and training. TEI will implement a range of ESD-related initiatives, including research to create an experts’ network, capacity building for schoolteachers and community leaders, establishment of information sharing system, development of a toolkit, and promotion of ESD policy development.

4) TVE Asia Pacific (TVEAP)

TVEAP’s COE project titled “Telling Stories to Save the Planet” will document 6 innovative ESD projects on video in developing countries in East Asia, South Asia and Southeast Asia. By identifying the most innovative and replicable initiatives and showcasing them, TVEAP aims to inspire many others to emulate. TVEAP will also strengthen the communications skills of organizations whose work is to be filmed. TV series will actively be distributed to broadcast, educational and civil society groups across the Asia-Pacific region.

5) The University of the South Pacific (USP)

USP’s COE project will focus mainly on three major ESD components: 1) Teacher Education, 2) Sustainability Education and 3) Community Empowerment. The major objective of this project is to build education-based capacity, using innovative curriculum development and delivery approaches, and to promote sustainable development in the Pacific island countries.

2. Innovation Programme for ESD

1) Strategic Action for Enhancement of Farm Products for Poverty Reduction in Rural Communities Through Non-Formal Education

Non-formal & Continuing Education Division, Department of Adult and Higher Education, Ministry of Education-Bhutan

Poverty in Bhutan is largely a rural phenomenon, where farming is the main occupation. If farmers are not supported with improved farming techniques and marketing, there is a danger of increasing rural urban migration so that most of the farm land would remain uncultivated. Prioritized actions for improvement of the farming practices will therefore be carried out through developing handbooks.

2) Education of Sustainable Development (ESD) in Rural Primary and Secondary School

China Program Committee of Education for Sustainable Development (CPCESD)-China

Confronted with environmental problems related to socio-economic development in the rural area, thirty primary and secondary schools are being selected to carry out various activities to enhance the awareness of ESD vision for school principals, teachers and students, and hence to contribute to sustainable development in local communities.
3) Capacity Building of Community Based Disaster Risk Assessment and Mitigation on West Java Volcano Hazard

Walhi West Java Indonesian Forum for Environment (WALHI) Friends of the Earth Indonesia-Indonesia

West Java Province is gifted with fertile land, but it is vulnerable to tectonic/volcanic earthquakes and eruptions with many volcanoes present in the area. A series of educational and training projects need to be implemented to decrease the impact of volcanic hazard by raising awareness and building response capacity, as well as by reducing the effect of the hazard on the most vulnerable people living in the disaster-prone areas.

4) Moyog Family Literacy Project (Sabah, Malaysia)

Kadazandusun Language Foundation (KLF)-Malaysia

The project seeks to elevate the literacy capacity of rural families so that they will be more empowered to make documentation (write stories) of aspects pertinent to a sustainable future, such as, the documentation of culture and indigenous knowledge of forest conservation and sustainable use of forest resources. Seminars and workshops are conducted to teach families reading and writing skills, and to assist parents in writing down their stories.

5) Non-Formal Education Capacity Building for ESD in Mongolia

National Centre for Non Formal and Distance Education (NFDE), Ministry of Education, Culture and Science-Mongolia

In Mongolia, the curriculum and contents related to ESD are underdeveloped both in formal and non-formal schooling. Thus, it is crucial to develop ESD-oriented learning and teaching materials in NFE and organize activities to raise public awareness. Linking with the goals of UNDESD and other educational initiatives, the project activities include curriculum development on ESD in NFE and booklet/poster production, and organization of capacity-building workshops.

6) Integrated Environment Literacy Program (IELP) for Poverty Alleviation through Income Generation Programme and Quality of Life Improvement of Girls and Women and Disadvantaged Populations through Community Learning Centres (CLCs)

National Resource Centre for Non Formal Education (NRC-NFE)-Nepal

Low level of literacy/economic status and social discrimination are main reasons behind the situation of poor communities in Nepal. The objective of the project is therefore to provide education to children and adults, especially girls & women, to empower them to conserve and improve the environment through waste management, environment-friendly agriculture, community forest management, production of biogas etc. for their quality of life improvement and sustainable development.

7) Vocational Education Focusing on Facilities Maintenance Officers Training

Emmaus High School Vocational Education Program-Palau

Palau is developing at a rapid pace. Construction of homes, government building and business are increasing. With the school’s mission to train young people to become self-sufficient, good citizen, respecting and contributing members of the community, the main objective of the project is to equip students with needed skills for maintenance of facilities, small engines, appliances among others, for sustainable development of the local community.
8) Participatory Learning Leading to Integrated Community Development; A Case Study Bansunkong school

Bureau for Innovative Development in Education (BIDE), The Office of the Basic Education Commission (OBEC), Ministry of Education - Thailand

This is a pilot project of learning reform within a whole-school approach. Teacher guidelines will be developed specifically for Bansunkong school and will be used in developing an integrated curriculum, as well as to promote child-centred teaching-learning methods by using the local community as a resource for learning.

9) Creation of Experimental Special Groups in Kindergartens and Secondary Schools for Introduction of Inclusive Education

Resource Centre on Special Education under the Republican Education Centre, Ministry of Public Education of the Republic of Uzbekistan - Uzbekistan

At the moment, there are about 250,000 children with various disabilities (0-16 years) in Uzbekistan who need access to education, but many of them are excluded due to negative attitudes or prejudices based on popular misconceptions. Through the project, a flexible and variable system of education taking into account special needs of disabled children will be created.

10) Developing a Model for Home Based E.I. for Children with Disabilities

Center for Education of Exceptional Children (CEEC) - National Institute for Education Strategy and Curriculum (NIESaC) - Viet Nam

The number of disabled children attending school is very low in Vietnam. One of the reasons is that they lack specific skills to access education. Thus, early intervention is vital for their education and life. Through guiding families with necessary knowledge, the project aims to help disabled children to go to school at the right age, ensure equal chance in education for all, and to make them part of collective efforts in sustainable development.